



FINAL REPORT: VALIDATION OF RESULTS

ECVET-Trainer. Proposals for the gradual application of ECVET model in the four key productive sectors of the EU.

File:2012-1-ES1-LEO05-48017

<http://ecvet-trainer.euproject.org/>



The ECVET-Trainer project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This communication reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use, which may be made of the information contained therein.

ECVET-TRAINER: VALIDATION AND EVALUATION OF RESULTS.

GENERAL CONCLUSIONS AND PROPOSALS FOR THE FUTURE

Germany. The project discovered that ECVET is still known mainly to important VET stakeholders in Germany and more at political level. At operational level, i.e. among teaching staff spreading information about the ECVET system/ concept via a broad number of dissemination channels is still indispensable.

One conclusion drawn from this project is that the most reasonable approach to ECVET in Germany is to consider ECVET as a toolbox where educational stakeholders can use different instruments for improving certain parts of VET training because the German VET system and its holistic concept of qualification has evolved over a long period of time and is not very open for influences from outside.

Proposals for the future. Under the described circumstances it could be considered in a second step, for example in a follow-on project of ECVET Trainer, to complement the "guideline" for teachers who shall be involved into the process of setting up ECVET partnerships, with materials that help them understand the concept of learning outcomes. They should learn something about the possible descriptions of learning outcomes and the debates on this subject that show the different, in many cases interest-oriented interpretations of stakeholders at European level.

It is also suggested that teachers become familiar with the specific character of the educational system of the partner country. A lot of country specific information can be found on the website of CEDEFOP.

Italy. The Italian experts have agreed that, from a scientific point of view, the contents of both national and comparative report and of the Guide are of great interest and relevance. But it is important to keep in mind that products, professions and skills can change very quickly in a period of turbulence in the labour market.

Proposals for the Future. For the Italian experts involved in the evaluation it is important to clarify that to implement ECVET in the four key sectors it is necessary to define clearly which type of company we are referring to. The great internal diversity suggests developing very specific pilot projects in

order to obtain useful methodological results. The typology and organization of work in these different types of companies has very different characteristics so there will be a huge difference within the skills and competencies required. In addition, the skills are very different when, in one or another type of company, you go to suppliers or customers (distribution).

Italian experts suggest paying big attention to the risk of a purely formal (and consequently dangerous) implementation of the system. One of the major obstacles in an effective implementation of the system is represented by the costs, followed by the lack of awareness in the labour market, education and training institutions about the benefits of such tools. In this sense ECVET should be firstly considered as a new philosophy that influences a modern perspective of training and learning.

Spain. Currently, ECVET implementation is linked to the EC Recommendation (2009), and the experience gained in various European projects. In Spain the ECVET principles are present in the VET systems (Ministries of Education and Labour). The ECVET methodology has not yet been applied, due to the lack of rules which sets the general conditions for a process of mobility: it means a new Law, together with a reference documentation, that can formalize the transnational mobility of learners / users of ECVET process.

Proposals for the future. VET teachers and trainers are considered as key figures in the development of mobility process within VET systems. In the light of the results, their involvement in the process should have a greater level of involvement, autonomy and responsibility in various activities, such as: preparation of a MoU and learning agreements, teaching and evaluation of learning outcomes and recognition and accreditation of units collected in other contexts.

In this sense, it can be considered that the continuation of this project will seek to achieve this greater autonomy and involvement of teachers and trainers in VET through its participation in processes of guidance (vocational and educational) concerning flexible learning paths which includes the implementation of tools for the recognition of prior learning, especially non-formal and informal.

Finland. Using and experiencing of the design for the online course promoted also the ambitions for a wider application of the presentation modalities used in this course. A more intensive information exchange between the course participants, both in online or off-line format should be encouraged and facilitated by ECVET coordinators.

France. In France, ECVET becomes more and more known. Most VET institution work with mobility programs and need the knowledge of ECVET. We can particularly state that ECVET is well known in apprenticeship schools, they have clear regulations concerning the learning outcomes and it more easy for them to find the partners in EU countries who propose the necessary training to validate the learning outcomes the candidate acquired during his/her mobility.

QUESTIONNAIRE
BLOCK 1. EVALUATION OF THE NATIONAL REPORT AND
COMPARATIVE REPORT, GUIDE OF APPLICATION

Could you evaluate the following products taking into account the main objective of the project?

	Not satisfactory	Satisfactory	Very satisfactory
National Report		X	x
Comparative report		X	
Guide of the application of ECVET in the 4 key productive sectors		X	

Please explain your choice and highlight your recommendations and proposals for the future development of ECVET in the productive sectors.

FINLAND

Information materials could be distributed nationally via the Finnish Ecvet coordination group (CMIO) and be mediated via online services as well as through the group of FI national Ecvet experts.

FRANCE

The National report explains the actual situation in France, even if experts are working continually on ECVET, this means ECVET will continually progress.

The comparative report is interesting because it allows learning more about the different EU systems and there implication in ECVET. It is interesting to see that the development of ECVET is not the same in the mentioned

countries and therefore it is very important to continue the dissemination of the product which should be of great interest for Vet organization but also for not implicated partner countries. However it is sometimes a little bit long and there are some repetitions.

The Guide for the Application of the ECVET model is clear and necessary, very useful, sometimes too many repetitions.

GERMANY

For our national VET experts, the National Report clearly describes the current situation of ECVET in Germany. Especially the last part of the document with the SWOT analysis and the incorporation of VET stakeholders' suggestions for further enhancement of the idea of ECVET is a highlight of the German National Report.

Evaluation conclusion for the National Report: Satisfactory

The Comparative Report is seen as a good overview regarding not only the country-specific ECVET situation and problems/ challenges during this shifting period it is also considered a good overview over the different European VET systems itself. Transfer of Innovation projects like this one are a good opportunity not only to work together on a defined project but to also gain knowledge about the partner countries specifics in the project related fields. Therefore the Comparative Report is a good example how knowledge transfer between European countries could work.

Evaluation conclusion for the Comparative Report: Satisfactory

The Guide for the Application of the ECVET model is seen as useful document, especially as a clearly defined FAQ document. Nevertheless, Karin Kübner from the German Bundesinstitut für Berufsbildung/ National ECVET contact point thought it was a bit too long with a number of redundancies in the text.

In her opinion in the introduction it is not clearly said who the target group of this guide is and what kind of information is provided. For example it describes the procedures of ECVET testing and implementation in different countries and projects, but does not give a clear recommendation or advice for practitioners how to use ECVET instruments e.g. Memorandum of understanding.

Concluding her explanations she recommends to provide additional information about the ECVET-Toolkit <http://www.ecvet-toolkit.eu> developed by 14 national agencies that should support VET providers organizing quality-assured mobility.

Evaluation conclusion for the Guide for the Application of the ECVET model: Satisfactory.

ITALY

The Italian experts have agreed that, from the scientific point of view, the contents of both national and comparative report and of the Guide are of great interest and relevance. But it is also worth saying that the topics require a long and difficult process of involvement of employers, stakeholders and workers.

In addition it's important to keep in mind that products, professions and skills can change very quickly in a period of turbulence of the global market. As the qualifications outcomes depend on dimensional, technical, economic and market factors it may be difficult to define a long term standard. There is also still no clear identification of informal skills.

All experts agree that it is important to continue the process that has just begun developing it for each sub-sector and involving workers and employers. It may be very dangerous, in the present state of knowledge, an experimentation carried on without the involvement of stakeholders.

The expert from the Friuli Venezia Giulia region states that, regarding the health care, it should be considered more learning outcomes as the following ones:

- Outcome nurse practitioners' professional performance
- Outcome Technician laboratory professional performance and other Care Professionalist
- Outcome Practitioner Physician professional performance

SPAIN

National report. The experts note that the national report are suitable for the development of ECVET, but it is necessary to keep in mind that, nowadays, ECVET model remains unclear in different aspects and is still under debate and experimentation in the European countries. About national report, they have considered that some paragraphs which identify a great ignorance of ECVET must be deleted, since this situation in Spain is not true to reality. ECVET principles are already implemented in both VET systems: it is observable in the availability of accumulate units and some mobility experiences are linked to the on-the-job learning experience (FCT, Ministry of Education).

The comparative report is an instrument that identifies and summarizes the statement of ECVET in participant countries, showing differences and

priorities in each case. This report has helped to define some items of the Guide and the contents of the e-learning course.

The Guide has been considered of great interest by training responsible involved in the project. Evaluation reports have considered that the Guide presents a practical way to understand and to adapt the ECVET methodology. VET experts have considered that the explanations are clear and sufficient according to the current situation. It takes into account the lack of information on ECVET in Spain. The Guide is considered a useful tool for designing a successful mobility processes within organizations. When we asked about the usefulness of this document, the answer was positive regarding the objectives of the organizations affected by the project.

On the other hand: the experts highlight the need to reinforce the idea that this Guide has been developed within the ECVET-Trainer project: so it will be used only in this project.

It is obvious that the Guide is addressed only to VET Stakeholders, trainers and teachers and not for citizens. It is necessary to advice of this situation at the front page of the document.

The topics about "Recognition of Non-Formal and Informal Learning" and "ECVET points" are not clear and do not contain specific information regarding the Spanish situation.

Partners consider that ECVET methodology is still unclear regarding several key aspects which should be clarified for its successful implementation in the VET systems:

- Mobility is not ECVET: ECVET is a tool to facilitate mobility.
- ECVET is not a system of qualifications.
- ECVET is not training system.
- There is not only one type of Memorandum of Understanding and LA. (The one available was proposed for the ECVET-Team, and it is only a proposal).
- Recognition of competencies acquired by labour experience is different of the processes of recognition of prior learning.

Lastly, experts have commented that this guide is based in the guide "Get to Know", produced by the ECVET-Team, which is not an official document of the EU.

BLOCK 2. EVALUATION OF THE STRATEGY OF DISSEMINATION

Regarding the documents of dissemination, could you please evaluate the documents and devices of dissemination regarding the main aim of the project?

	Not satisfactory	Satisfactory	Very satisfactory
10 competitive advantages		XX	xx
Informative Booklet		XX	xx
Sections of the web site		XX	xx
Newsletters		XX	xx

Please explain your choices and highlight your recommendations and proposals for the web-site this kind of documents in the process of development of ECVET.

FINLAND

Materials developed by the project supplements materials already available through the Finnish national ECVET coordination body (CIMO).

FRANCE

All documents are very interesting and as we realized a target group at the first beginning of the project, which we enlarged during the ongoing project, we disseminated regularly these documents.

A special university for training and orientation was organized during October 2013 at the MPS.

This allowed to make an informal dissemination and the developed materials were appreciated.

Dissemination was also realized thanks to social medias and online magazines.

The ECVET Trainer Website allowed also the dissemination and of course the online course. The whole dissemination process was very satisfactory.

GERMANY

At the beginning of the project every project partner identified various stakeholders in the field of vocational training. All three newsletters, the document "10 Competitive Advantages" and the Informative Booklet were distributed to them. Especially for the distribution of the newsletters the website provided by the Swedish project partner was a very useful tool.

Besides the dissemination strategy defined for the project, Euproma drafted additional press releases that were published on various online platforms (i.e. Open PR) and on the company website.

The dissemination strategy itself is considered suitable for the purpose and the aims of the project by our experts. Nevertheless for future projects they suggest to make also use of social media channels like Facebook, Twitter or Scoop it!. As an additional feature regarding the usage of social media channels, a real exchange of opinions with relevant stakeholder could occur that might have direct influence on the projects progress/success.

Evaluation conclusion for the overall dissemination strategy: Very Satisfactory

ITALY

The Italian experts involved have stated that the dissemination strategy drawn by the partnership is good for the aims of the project. One of our experts have also suggested that in further projects may be used social networks in order to reach a wider target and also get real time feedbacks on products and events.

All the products seems to be clear and satisfactory, in particular the document "10 competitive advantages" and the website's sections have been considered very satisfactory. However, some experts have stated that it would be important to understand the concrete impact of the dissemination strategy on the organizations.

SPAIN

Dissemination tools are formed by a website and several reports available on the project website in Castilian, which facilitate the monitoring of the results of the project.

The instruments listed in the table above are intended to provide project information, create interest in mobility through ECVET and get the involvement of VET trainers and professionals for a satisfactory implementation of ECVET in the productive sectors.

These documents have informed VET teachers, trainers and practitioners about the progress and key results of the project. The documents have been delivered by e-mail at different moments, during the lifetime of the project.

The main topics of information are located in 3 areas: methodology and ECVET principles; roles and expectations of VET teachers and trainers; and experiences collected in the ECVET pilot project in Europe.

BLOCK 3. E-LEARNING CONTENTS AND PLATFORM

Regarding the E-learning platform, e-learning materials and the development of the e-learning course, could you indicate what is your opinion regarding the main aim of the project.

	Not satisfactory	Satisfactory	Very satisfactory
E-learning platform		XX	XX
E-learning materials			
E-learning		XX	XX

Please explain your choices and highlight your recommendations and proposals for the web-site and the documents.

FINLAND

Using and experiencing of the design for the online course promoted also the ambitions for a wider application of the presentation modalities used in this course. A more intensive information exchange between the course participants, both in online or off-line format should be encouraged and facilitated by ECVET coordinators. In addition to above more general reflections/evaluation of the developed e-learning materials the Finnish project group has also performed a more detailed module-by-module online evaluation exercise with data derived from the consulted expert group.

FRANCE

E-learning and platform: Firstable for the partner organization MPS it was not understandable that we had to integrate ourselves the training modules in the platform; this took 10 days of work.

Experts returned that the courses seem to be sometimes a little boring because of the lack of interactivity. They think this is the reason why most of the participants left the course before.

However the main points are well explained and the modules are very clear.

The online course will allow the exploitation of the project, as people can access easily and when they want.

GERMANY

The pilot e-Learning course as one of the major achievements of the project was considered as satisfactory by our experts. Nevertheless some issues were raised to improve the e-Learning course to fully exploit its potential and the potential of the Moodle platform in future.

Here are some of the remarks made by our experts (especially from the DEKRA Akademie):

- Designing an Online course requires temporal, spatial, psychological, social, and technical issues that need to be taken into consideration.
- Lack of interactivity (Moodle offers some interesting features that are not fully exploited, yet and is seen as a tool where learning in a social context is a main issue).
- Evaluating learning outcomes from the students taking the course – should be orientated on the idea of Learning Outcomes presented in the ECVET system
- For the didactic media remains room for improvement regarding presentation, editing and usage of interactive tools.
- The whole e-Learning course has not yet fully exploited its potential.

ITALY

In the experts' opinion, the official website of ECVET-Trainer project is very user-friendly and interactive.

One important consideration about the e-learning course is that, as to implement ECVET in all four key productive sectors it is necessary to define which type of company we are referring to, it should be more useful to identify methodological options rather than specific indications. In this perspective the e-learning courses should be more focused on general information, than specific topics. Then they can be also combined with a wide range of case studies in order to clarify the information and topics discussed.

The work of adaptation of the modules should be improved and also the contents optimized (experts have noticed that some of the contents are repeated in several units), also providing more external resources.

As English language has been pointed out by some participants as a possible barrier for the comprehension of some external resources provided the issue has been discussed with the experts. Most of them have agreed that, as ECVET is mainly a European tool, it is important to use English as a lingua franca for some specific resources or references, taking care that the basic concepts and information are also available in the national languages.

SPAIN

Organization of the course. The course has been well organized in connection with the information provided, the timeliness, scheduling and delivery of educational material.

Content and teaching methodology. Course content is tailored to the planned program and meets participant's training needs that show a right combination of

theory and practice. It is recognized that the content is repeated in several modules. The language and concepts are very technical and specific making it difficult to read. One aspect of improvement is the downloadable documents: it is a slow and tedious process (considering issues downloading, printing in the participant's own home, etc.). It is also considered necessary to have a larger number of video/animation presentations.

Course duration and schedule. The duration of the course has been considered enough, according to the planned objectives and contents.

Tutor / trainer. The tutor plays an important role, explaining the concepts and the different approaches for the future application of ECVET. The involvement of the tutor is required for the final assessment of the course.

Didactic materials. Presentations have been appropriate. Students were able to follow the content on-screen and have taken the opportunity to print the most relevant documents. Participants have claimed about the improvement of the on-line presentations considering the possibilities of Moodle technologies. Case studies have facilitated discussion among participants as well as explanations of the tutor. Due to the active participation of students in the forums, we consider that the case studies have been very useful to understand the ECVET concepts and the methodology.

Some participants disagreed with documents in English. It is necessary to consider the low level of English of Teachers and Trainers. So, it would be convenient to remind candidates about the nature of ECVET and the mobility among different countries, where the use of English is the most frequent tool in these processes.

Didactic resources. Materials have facilitated the learning process to the students. Participants in the course have a positive opinion about materials: (individualized tutoring, e, virtual library, search engines, etc.), applications, means of communication and telematics services are easy to use and the evaluation tests have them allowed to know the level of learning achieved.

Overall rating of the course. The course provides a new and enriching approach about mobility in the VET systems. It is necessary that students are informed about mobility among VET systems, in order to increase their motivation in the course.

Overall satisfaction. All modules have been interesting for the students. There were more active participation in Modules 1 and 2. A comment from a student suggested that the contents were repeated during the modules.

Suggestions and comments for improving the course.

In general, the course meets the planned objectives. Nevertheless there are some topics for the improvement:

- Avoid repetition of contents along the modules.

- Pedagogical adaptation of texts: the materials appear too technical and should be developed in a more didactic way.
- Provide with the same format to all the questionnaires: referring to module 3.
- Use a more visual and interactive resources. It is considered necessary to use a larger number of presentations in video format.

Participants in the experts groups for the validation of results

Organization	country
Federation of Education Workers. FETE-UGT	Spain
IFES	Spain
Ministry of Education MECD	Spain
Ministry of Labour SEPE	Spain
CIFO-UAB	Spain
DEKRA Akademie GmbH Stuttgart	Germany
CEDEFOP Expert on ECVET	Germany
BIBB - Bundesinstitut für Berufsbildung	Germany
Food Akademie, Neuwied	Germany
KEUDA	Finland
Vantaan ammattiopisto Varia	Finland
Savonlinna työvoimatoimisto	Finland
Consultant at Ernst & Young Financial-Business Advisors	Italy
Università del Salento	Italy
Regione Friuli Venezia Giulia – Responsible for Social Policies	Italy
CERES – Centro di Ricerche Economiche e Sociali	Italy
Mouvement Européen	France
MPS. Responsable Mobilité	France

INFA. Cap Mobilité	France
--------------------	--------