



Foundation for Professional Development
in Public Administration
Sibiu, Bulevardul Victoriei nr. 2-4, cod 550024,
tel. 0040 - 726 -19 61 51 , fax 0040 - 269 - 23 22 78
<https://sites.google.com/site/perfectproff/home>
e-mail: perfectproff@gmail.com



Postal adress: Street Anton Pann, no. 17, postal code 550378, Sibiu - Romania

**External Evaluation of the VOSES -
Volunteering Solution for
Entrepreneurship Spirit” Project,**
a Leonardo da Vinci - Transfer of
Innovation Project (action n. 2012-1-ES1-
LEO05-50825)

Final Report

Sibiu, October, 2014

CONTENT

Introduction.....	3
Presentation of the VOSES project.....	3
The aim of the Final Report of the External Evaluation.....	10
Methodology used for the External Evaluation.....	10
The progress of the project towards the project's objectives.....	11
The transnational partnership.....	20
The project's impact on the target group.....	22
The use of transferable innovation.....	24
General conclusions of the Final Report	28
Appendix 1 – Gantt Chart	

1. Introduction

The Final Report of the External Evaluation is the last of the three reports which the Foundation for Professional Development in Public Administration Sibiu, Romania will elaborate for the **VOSES -Volunteering Solution for Entrepreneurship Spirit” Project**, a **Leonardo da Vinci - Transfer of Innovation Project (action n. 2012-1-ES1-LEO05-50825)** developed in the framework of the **Lifelong Learning Programme** of the European Commission. The projects duration was October 2012 – September 2014 and the external evaluation took place throughout this period.

The information that was used to compile the Reports of External Evaluation (Initial, Interim and Final) was, on the one hand, information provided by the project partners (reports of the Work Packages, newsletters, media coverage, email group etc), but also information collected through our own activities (questionnaires, interviews). All this information was critically analyzed and interpreted.

2. Presentation of the VOSES project

VOSES -Volunteering Solution for Entrepreneurship Spirit” Project, a Leonardo da Vinci - Transfer of Innovation Project (action n. 2012-1-ES1-LEO05-50825) is developed in the framework of the Lifelong Learning Programme of the European Commission. The project’s aim is to promote the entrepreneurial spirit of young people, with the assistance and expertise of early retired or recently retired volunteering mentors aged 50 and over. The project is developing since October 2012 to September 2014. This project is being carried out by six organizations: FUNDACIÓN VOLUNTARIOS POR MADRID, Spain – project coordinator, EURO-NET from Italy, Instituto de Formación Integral (IFI), Spain, JobInVest A/S, Denmark, The Romania Red Cross, SIBIU branch and SOCIEDADES PORTUGUESA DE INOVAÇÃO, SPI

The main goals of the project is:

- To improve a volunteering mentoring of retired or early retired businessmen, with altruism, who want to offer their expertise in business management to young people.
- To develop an interactive platform that connects retirees with labor market experience and young entrepreneurs for free advice on how to undertake projects, containing all the relevant material and information on the transferred product.

Specific objectives:

- To encourage the creative thinking, entrepreneurial skills and attitudes of young people, like other skills useful for the development of business values - curiosity, continuous learning orientation, proactive attitude, autonomy and creativity;

- To promote opportunities for youth participation in entrepreneurial activities, and allow retirees volunteers offer their expertise in business management;
- To promote the integration of entrepreneurship as a subject in the education system;
- To promote the potential of senior entrepreneurs; Intergenerational Learning;
- To promote Volunteerism people over 50 years in retirement process (Active Ageing);
- To be a forum for thought, discussion and debate on topics of interest for seniors (the extension of working life, active ageing, etc.).

As mentioned before, this project is being carried out by a partnership between six organizations from different countries.

The **Coordinator partner is FUNDACIÓN VOLUNTARIOS POR MADRID from Spain**

www.voluntariospormadrid.org



FVXM is a non-profit entity that seeks to promote, train and support volunteering in the city. Their main activities are awareness campaigns that target the citizens of Madrid with the aim of implementing a culture of solidarity, training for volunteers and social entities, and support for businesses to set up specific projects in the framework of employee volunteering schemes.

The organizations' objectives are:

- To promote the citizens engagement in voluntary activities.
- To enhance the participation of business sector in the framework of the corporate social responsibility.
- To support all social entities in the development of projects fostering solidarity.
- To offer a public service that facilitates the establishment of projects that promotes volunteering action.

Main activities:

- Awareness campaigns that target the citizens of Madrid with the aim of implementing a culture of solidarity.
- Volunteering School that provides training opportunities.

PROJECT PARTNER #1



EURO-NET

[.Italy]

www.synergy-net.info

EURO-NET (non-profit organisation) has a wide experience in the field of training with qualified teachers, tutors and coordinators with experiences in hundreds of European projects and in the provision of services to children, young people and adults: information, project development, training courses, counselling, e-learning, networking and partnerships, publications and websites.

EURO-NET is an Europe Direct centre of European Commission and it is member of about 35 European Networks. It has realised about 200 projects with Youth, Socrates, European Youth Foundation, LLP, Leonardo, Life, Culture 2000, Progress, Representation in Italy of E.C., Council of Europe, etc.



The Association co-operates with many public Administrations and private organisations with which it has particular agreements for the diffusion of juvenile and adults activities and helps all juvenile organisations to realise European programs: with its help about 300 projects were realised and financed in Basilicata and in other Italian regions.

PROJECT PARTNER #2



Instituto de Formación Integral

FORMACIÓN. PROYECTOS E INNOVACIÓN

[.INSTITUTO DE FORMACIÓN

INTEGRAL, S.L.U.

Spain]

www.ifi.com.es

Instituto de Formación Integral (IFI) is a private company with more than 100 workers which runs training and consultancy activities with enterprises, Employers Associations, Trade Unions, NGOs and individual workers.

IFI mainly operates in:

- Non Regulated, continuous and occupational vocational training: IFI has successfully developed and managed various Training Plans at regional and national level.
- Consultancy and Projects, IFI offers services which cover the whole cycle of a Project in the Socio-labour field (labour integration of disadvantage people, equal opportunities, conciliation of work and private life, corporative social responsibility, prevention of labour risks, labour relationships and human resources management) Information society; Education and vocational training and Local development.

* European projects, IFI has wide experience in Life Long Learning Programme (LdV, Grundtvig and Transversal Programme), Community Initiative EQUAL, etc.

PROJECT PARTNER #3



JobInVest

[.Denmark]

www.jobinvest.dk

JobInVestA/S is a limited company, owned by 11 3F departments and 6 Danish Metal-branches in the South Region and central Denmark. We are a team on 13 employees.

Its goal is to be an active player in the workforce development on the regional labor market:

- Guidance of job seekers, assessment of their competences and preparation of job plans.
- Planning and implementation of competence development, targeting individual companies and their employees
- Recruitment and training / qualification of new employees
- Development and implementation of courses for entrepreneurs
- Development, management and participation in projects and networks

During many years, JobInVest has organized courses for entrepreneurs in co-operation with different business development centers and vocational schools. Furthermore, over the last years, we have conducted a Social Fund project called "From unskilled to entrepreneur" to help unskilled unemployed people start their own business.

PROJECT PARTNER #4



SOCIETATEA NATIONALA

**DE CRUCE ROSTE DIN ROMANIA, FILIALA
SIBIU**

[.Romania]

www.crucearosie.ro/filiale/SB.html

The Romania Red Cross, SIBIU branch aims is the prevention and alleviation of human suffering in any circumstances, without any discrimination as to the citizenship, nationality, race, gender, religion, age, military, social or political affiliation. SNCRR has 9 employees, 120 volunteers and more than 400 members. She also develop programs in social, humanitarian, youth and volunteering area in order to fulfill our functional law.

Voluntary Center Solferino is a center, regarding the human resources for the NGO's of SIBIU and the surrounding area in order to increase the institutional and operational capacity of the NGO's sector, by involving the community in the volunteering action.

Target groups: NGO's from the social and youth areas from SIBIU and also the local community. Activities in Volunteering: recruitment, initial courses, occupation, monitoring...

Activities for the NGO's: occupation and support for the volunteers, courses, exchanges experience, promotion of the volunteering...

PROJECT PARTNER #5



SOCIEDADES PORTUGUESA

DE INOVAÇÃO, SPI

[.Portugal]

www.spieurope.eu

SPI is a knowledge management oriented company with the mission to manage projects that foster innovation and promote international opportunities. SPI provides services in 3 areas: Training, Consulting and R&D. Has a permanent staff of nearly 50 people in 8 offices worldwide. SPI is accredited by the DGERT with recognized capacity to conduct a range of training activities.

SPI has experience in using different training methodologies for various target groups and applies innovative pedagogical approaches, including eLearning. SPI has experience in developing training plans, selecting training resources, developing didactic materials, evaluating training courses and assessing the impact of training programs. SPI has a wide experience in the area of entrepreneurship.

SPI has developed Global Entrepreneurship Monitor reports (Portugal, Angola), and implemented projects as PECAE-Promoting Entrepreneurial Culture in Adult Education; Self Entrepreneurship Training for Trainers; EU WOMEN; etc.

3. The aim of the Final Report of the External Evaluation

The final Report represents, on the one hand, a logical follow-up of the activities carried out during the last year of the VOSES project, representing, from this perspective, a continuation of the Initial and Interim Report of the External Evaluation. On the other hand, the Final Report compiles all the information collected during the External Evaluation of the entire duration of the VOSES project, October 2012-September 2014. For this we will use the methodology presented in the initial report in order to find out if the key-issues to be evaluated are being carried out as planned.

The key-issues have been agreed upon with the partners of the project and concern following aspects

- The progress of the project towards the project s objectives;
- The transnational partnership;
- The projects s impact on the target group;
- The use of transferable innovation.

4. Methodology used for the External Evaluation

After determining the key –issues that will be taken into consideration during the External Evaluation, the experts of the Foundation for Professional Development in Public Administration Romania, Sibiu proposed, for each one, a specific evaluation method.

The progress of the project towards the project s objectives – was monitored throughout the project duration, using different tools. With regards of the activities and the deliverables that each partner had to elaborate we used the Gantt chart, which allowed us to determine if they were carried out on time, and if the deliverables have been submitted. The dissemination plan represented the starting point of our analysis, but also other information was required and media reviews from all the six partners.

The transnational partnership (communication, cooperation, cross cultural understanding) – this aspects was being observed through the elaboration of several questionnaires, through interviews with the partners and by monitoring the emails and other information exchanges between the partners, as well as through information obtained by internal surveys.

The projects s impact on the target group is very important. In this context, the External Evaluator strived to determine if the mentors, retired businessmen, considered that the topics, manuals and mentoring process were appropriate and relevant, while the mentees, young entrepreneurs, have made used of the provided consultancy and experience of the mentors.

The use of transferable innovation will be monitored using indicators like the number of mentors and mentees, as well as the elaboration of manuals for the interested parties. For this, the online platform and some courses from the WTE were adjusted to the needs and expectations of the mentors and mentees involved.

5. The progress of the project towards the project s objectives

Regarding the first issue *the progress of the project towards the project s objectives*, the Final Report of the External Evaluation will determine if the activities are being carried out according to the timetable. The partners of the VOSSES project had to develop 32 deliverables, until the end of it (September, 2014). The Interim Report comprised the deliverables due until august, 2013. Until that moment, all 15 deliverables that should have been initiated/finalized were being addressed to. Although there were some delays, the up to date evaluation on reaching the projects objectives indicate that most deliverables are available now. In appendix 1, a Gantt Chart indicates the situation of deliverance, for each expected deliverable. For each workpackage, the situation is as follows:

Work Package 1 – Management and Coordination

This WP is being pursuit throughout the project. The objectives of this WP are:

- To guarantee that the resources and budget are adequately managed and used
- To guarantee an adequate communication flow among the partners, and with the OAPEE
- To ensure the adequate development and fulfillment of the project activities
- To dynamism the participation of project partners in all project activities.

This WP was managed by one of the Spanish partner, FVxM – Fundacion Voluntarios por Madrid.

The Interim Report indicated that there were no problems in regard with the resources that each partner had at their disposal. Furthermore, an audit of the project found 6 incidents to which they accepted all the corrections/clarifications presented, except for two of them: one specific for FVxM about its web page, and one other, concerning all the partners of the staff costs according to the criteria of the working days. Regarding this matter, partners decided not to accept the Auditor's decision, since this does not reflect the law in their countries, nor the way staff costs have ever been calculated in any other project, additionally this would harm financially everyone. For the communication between partners the site, the email group, the Skype meetings and, of course, the face to face meeting contributed to a good understanding of every task and, thus, to the organization and fulfillment of all activities included in the project. Until September 2014, there are 7 deliverables that

should have been carried out. The Kick-off meeting and all Steering Group Meetings, as well as the accompanying minutes of these meetings are available. The interim Report was available after the first project year. The Final Report is being elaborated at the moment, as it has to include all activities, some of which are still in process.

Deliverable 1.1 Interim and final report (financial and technical)

The Interim report was being elaborated by the management team, established by Fundacion Voluntarios por Madrid – the project coordinator. This undertaking required an effective communication flow between the partners, because they provided the necessary information for the WP leader (financial forms and schedules, justifications etc.). Similar, for the final report, under the coordination of FVXM, each partner has to submit the required information.

Deliverable 1.2 Kick-off meeting

The Kick-off meeting took place in Spain, on the 5th -6th November, during which the partners agreed upon the action plan, timetables and other organizational issues. “All important steps in the project period were discussed and all the partners had the possibility to contribute to the way the project was understood and implemented” as the Danish partner’s representative stated.

Deliverable 1.3 Steering Group Meeting 1

The first SGM was held in Romania and was organized by Crucea Rosie Romana, Filiala Sibiu (SNCR). The meeting took place between the 15-16th of April, in Sibiu, 5 month after the Kick-off meeting.

The meeting started with the presentation of the results of the Local Discussion Groups, held by each of the partners, in order to establish what the needs of the project’s target group are. In addition, partners discussed intensively about the transfer and adaptation of the 10 modules of the WTE course. The discussion also addressed on the next stage of the project: organize and implement two workshops with volunteer senior experts in entrepreneurship and business, and specifically in each field covered by the VOSES training course. The purpose was to adapt the WTE e-learning package and develop the final VOSES mentoring methodology.

Deliverable 1.4 Steering Group Meeting 2

The second SGM took place between December 10, 2013 to December 11, 2013. The VOSES project team met in Esbjerg, Denmark, to discuss the future activities in the project, especially the pilot Projects, which run in all the participating countries from January to April 2014. It was a very important meeting for the partners because they identified the guidelines for developing the pilot experience: the selection of the mentees and mentors, the profile of the participants and the methodology of the piloting.

Deliverable 1.5 Steering Group Meeting 3

The next SGM meeting was organized in Porto, Portugal, between the 2nd and 3rd of June, 2014. It consisted on discussion regarding Pilot test results and discussion (WP5); Presentation of the Validation Plan and adjustments (WP6); Presentation of Audit Report and results from the Intermediate report; Discussion about the action plan for Monitoring and Evaluation (WP8) for Validation and discussion about the dissemination actions (WP7).

Deliverable 1.6 Steering Group Meeting 4

The last meeting took place in Potenza, Italy, between the 3rd and 4th of September 2014. The most important aspect that was included was related to the national results of validation and also to the national conferences that still were to be organized. It also took place a press conference at the City Hall of Potenza where every partner could talk about the development of the project in his own country.

Deliverable 1.7 SGM's Minutes

Every meeting that took place, the kick-off meeting and the SGMs were followed by the elaboration of an extensive minute, which contained the main discussion points, conclusions, etc. Some are available on the projects website.

Work Package 2 – Training needs Analysis / Transference of the WTE training product

The objectives of this WP were:

- To analyze the training needs of the target collective;
- To analyze the previous contents of the project;
- To elaborate a Report on the training needs about young entrepreneurship;
- To elaborate a set of guidelines for transferring the WTE results to the new target group, according to the previous analysis.

This WP was coordinated by the other Spanish partner in the project – IFI, Instituto de Formacion Integral.

In order to reach these objectives, there were 3 deliverables due to be developed until august 2013.

Deliverable 2.1 Establishment of 5 Local Discussion Groups

The Local Discussion Groups were organized in each country - Spain: 17th of January 2013, Denmark: 23rd of January 2013, Romania: 28th of January 2013, Portugal: 18th of February 2013 and Italy on 25th of February.

The aim was to involve different experts and stakeholders to determine the training needs of the target group and to find out the country specific requirements. Also, these groups of experts made some remarks regarding the content of the WTE project and its relevance to the national target group.

Deliverable 2.2 5 National reports from the Local Discussion Groups

After each of the 5 Local Discussion Groups, the organizing partner had to elaborate a report, which included the conclusions of the local experts and stakeholders regarding the existing training and opportunities for entrepreneurship, the detection of barriers for youth entrepreneurship and the identification of attitudes and knowledge that can help promote entrepreneurship amongst young people, in each country. All reports have been submitted.

Deliverable 2.3 Set of guidelines for transferring the WTE results to the new target group

This deliverable regarding the skills and key competences required for youth entrepreneurship and the adjustment of the WTE product for this new target group (young people, instead of female) are included in the report developed by IFI and which is available on the project's website, but only on the partners section.

Work Package 3 Transference and Adaptation

The main objectives of this Work Package were:

- To adapt the product of Women Technology Entrepreneurship project;
- To elaborate the new training materials;
- To develop a mentoring methodology;
- To elaborate the integrated Mentoring and Training Program;
- To translate the contents into all partners languages.

This WP included 7 deliverables until the end of the project and was managed by FVxM and IFI.

Deliverable 3.1 Establishment of 10 workshops

Each country hosted 2 workshops. One, which aimed to receive input from experts regarding the 9 WTE training modules and which have been adapted and transferred through the VOSES project. The second workshop aimed to receive input from senior experts regarding the mentoring methodology (mentor's profile and role and the mentoring process). The WTE training modules were assigned to each project partner and, during the national workshops, these were analyzed by local experts and the required adaptation of these materials for the new target group was initiated.

In Denmark the first workshop was held on the 13th and 16th of May. The assigned modules for Denmark that were discussed by the participants were “Communication” and “Administrative and legal issues”. The second workshop was held on the 17th of June 2013.

The first workshop in Spain was organized on the 27th of May 2013. The WTE modules that were analyzed by Spanish experts were “Business management and leadership” and “Customer Service”. The second workshop was organized on the 28th of June 2013.

In Italy, the first workshop took place on the 27th of May 2013. The analyzed WTE module was “Business Plan”. The second workshop took place on the 1st of July 2013.

In Romania, the first workshop was held on the 31st of May 2013. The WTE modules debated regarded “Effective Business Networking” and “E-business and web-marketing”. The second workshop, regarding the mentoring methodology was held on the 3rd of July 2013.

The Portuguese experts made content adjustments regarding the WTE modules “Innovation and Ideas generation” and “Web design” during the first workshop. The second one took place on the 1st of July 2013.

Deliverable 3.2 Elaboration of 5 reports from workshops

The project partners, which have organized the national workshops, had to develop a report, which included the recommendations made by the experts. These suggestions regarded the content of the WTE training modules and the adaptations required, on the one hand and, on the other, the opinion of senior experts on the Mentoring Methodology. All of the recommendations were taken into account and, after the review of the other project partners, the final version of the modules was completed.

Deliverable 3.3 Elaboration of the general report for the adaptation of the transferred product

The General Report for the adaptation on the transferred product was elaborated by FVXM and IFI. It was divided in to global reports: one contains the conclusions of the first workshop, which includes the recommendations made by local experts regarding the content of each of the nine WTE training modules that will be transferred by the VOSES project. The other global report contains the outcome of the five national workshops regarding the “Mentoring methodology analysis”. Here is to be found the mentor’s profile, the mentor’s role and the mentoring program structure, as seen from the senior expert’s perspective.

Deliverable 3.4 Elaboration of the Mentoring-Training Programme

The elaboration of this deliverable was scheduled to be ready at the end of September, 2013. It integrates to aspects:

- *An online training course containing 8 modules focused on the entrepreneurial world.* This Training course focus on interpersonal and key competences for young adults. The training materials have been adapted on the specific needs of the target group and the labours market needs previously detected at national/local level in Spain, Italy, Denmark, Portugal and Romania.
- *A mentoring programme to transfer knowledge and learning through experience* and by establishing a personal and trusting relationship to guide, stimulate and encourage young entrepreneurs to meet their needs via direct contact through the platform and meetings.

Deliverable 3.5 Manual for promoters

The Manual for promoters was revised and input of all partners was included. Its final version dates from august 2013.

Deliverable 3.6 Manual for mentors

The Manual for mentors has been developed in cooperation by all partners. It's available since august 2013.

Deliverable 3.7 Manual for mentees

The Manual for mentees was being elaborated by all partners, coordinated by FVXM and is available since august 2013.

Work Package 4 Development of the project ICT Training and Mentoring Platform

The deliverable of this WP consists in the ITC e-learning Platform prototype, based on a multi-lingual, fully operational Web 2.0 platform. In preparation of these deliverables, many steps have been initiated (adaptation of the WTE training modules, discussion about the structure etc). The leader of this WP was IFI.

Deliverable 4.1 ITC e-learning Platform prototype

The ITC e-learning Platform is available online at <http://platform.voses.eu/>. Most users considered it to be user –friendly.

Work Package 5 Pilot Experience

The Danish partner – JobInvest, coordinated this WP. The overall objective of this WP was to develop a pilot experience to test the e-learning tool and mentoring methodology. Subsequently, there are 2 deliverables:

Deliverable 5.1 Guidelines Selection of pilot experience target groups

This deliverable consists of some guidelines on planning a successful pilot experience, developed by JobInvest. These include indications regarding preliminary activities and also how to conduct, collect data and follow-up and report.

Deliverable 5.2 Reports on assessment of the pilot experience

All reports with regard of assessing the pilot experience have been submitted. By using the same structure, it was possible to make a consolidation and a common evaluation.

Work Package 6 Validation

This Work Package aims to experiment the prototype through validation groups, to assess the results obtained from these and to adapt the prototype to the results of the validation reports. The main objective of the validation was to add to what was learned from the pilot experience and develop structured recommendations on how to improve the VOSES Training and Mentoring Platform. Each country has developed 1 peer review in their countries. The validation was realized with the help of experts, in each country, and with the participation of some of the mentors from the pilot experience. The feedback received from the participants and from the mentors validated actually the pilot experience from every country.

The leader of this WP was the Portuguese partner – SPI, Sociedad Portuguesa de Inovaco.

Deliverable 6.1 Report on conclusions. Recommendations for prototype improvement: a report with the key conclusions of the validations activities and a set of recommendations for e-learning and mentoring environment improvement

All national recommendations were included in a final global report on validation.

Deliverable 6.2 Production of the definitive version of the e-learning and mentoring environment based on the ICT platform

This deliverable consist in the present form and version of the online platform, available at <http://platform.voses.eu/>

Work Package 7 Dissemination and Valorization Plan

Dissemination is a very important activity during the entire project. The main objectives include awareness raising of the entrepreneurship training course and mentoring methodology to end users, promoting further project's outcome and disseminating the results of the project at national level. The dissemination was realized using official VOSES newsletters and brochure, articles of own newsletters of the partners, local discussion groups, workshops, project meetings, national conferences, dissemination meetings and events, social networks (Facebook, LinkedIn, Mojalink, Skillpages, Scoop.it!, ReferralKey, Xing, Twitter), official VOSES web site, various web pages on own partners' websites, mailgroup, mailing lists, radios. There are 4 deliverables in this WP, managed by the Italian partner – Euro-Net.

Deliverable 7.1 Project website

The project's website is available and up to date. It's content is available in six languages: English, Spanish, Italian, Romanian, Danish and Portuguese. www.voses.eu

Deliverable 7.2 General project Brochure

The brochure of the projects is available on the website, translated into all partner's languages.

Deliverable 7.3 Five project newsletters

Until this stage of the project there are five newsletters developed, although just three are available online.

Deliverable 7.4 National Dissemination Conferences

The National Dissemination Conferences were organized in each country, as follows:

- ✓ Denmark: 20th of August 2014
- ✓ Spain: 27th of August 2014
- ✓ Italy: 18th of September 2014
- ✓ Portugal: 29th of September 2014
- ✓ Romania: 29th of September 2014

Work Package 8 Monitoring and Evaluation

Monitoring and Evaluation was being pursued throughout the project. This work package was carried out using an evaluation plan that was developed at the beginning of the project. There was an internal and external evaluation of the coordination, the progress of the project, of the partnership, as well as of the mentoring-training program results and the adaptation and transfer of Innovation to young entrepreneurs. The leader of this WP was Red Cross Sibiu - SNCRR, who realized the internal evaluation of the project and Foundation for Professional Development in Public Administration, who realized the external evaluation. This WP consists of 6 deliverables

Deliverable 8.1 National reports about the evaluation of projects activities

Each partner had to compile a national report which was supposed to gather the opinion of everyone involved in the project. All reports have been submitted.

Deliverable 8.2 Internal report about evaluation of project's activities

This report was realized on the basis of the quality plan and the questionnaires submitted by the partners in the first year of the project.

Deliverable 8.3 Final report about evaluation and dissemination activities

On the basis of the national reports a comprehensive report is being elaborated at the moment.

Deliverable 8.4 External evaluation reports of the project: initial, interim and final

The subcontracting of the External evaluation had some delays, so that the Initial External Evaluation Report was presented in June, 2013. Yet, the delay has been recovered, as the Interim Report of the External Evaluation was being submitted on time. The Final Report of the External Evaluation is being delayed with some days, as a consequence of the contractors (SNCRR) demand to include all activities carried out in the framework of the project, until the 30th of September 2014, in the external evaluation.

Deliverable 8.5 Evaluation Plan

The evaluation Plan (Quality Plan) was elaborated at the beginning of the project. It was available since December 2012. It contains the methodology of the evaluation.

Deliverable 8.6 Evaluation Questionnaires

The questionnaires were developed at the same time with the Evaluation Plan and they will be used throughout the project. So far there have been developed questionnaires for the internal evaluation of the meetings, the understanding and achieving of deliverables of the project. Some other questionnaires were sent in order to evaluate the quality of the future deliverables, such as pilot experience, validation and national dissemination seminars etc.

6. The transnational partnership

The project was being carried out by a partnership between six organizations from Portugal, Romania, Denmark, Italy and Spain. Aspects regarding the transnational partnership (communication, cooperation, cross cultural understanding) were observed through the elaboration of several questionnaires, by the internal and external evaluators. The information exchange between partners seemed to be fine, as seen through the email-exchange and the discussion on the private area of the VOSES webpage.

The initial questionnaires filled out by all partners, revealed a generally good communication and understanding between partners. The partners considered that the initial activities were carried out on time and with great involvement from all parts. Some considered this project as a “pioneering” tool, as mentoring isn’t as common in all partner countries, but also as a great chance for young people and for retired experts. The collaboration with the project coordinator was considered to be a good one. Partners appreciated the direct and fluent contact, the attention of the project coordinator regarding the opinion of all other partners. Also, one partner could identify an improvement regarding the visibility and the availability of the coordinator, during the first 6 month of the project. More attention should be oriented on the quality of the work. Although there were some difficulties at the beginning of the project, the communication between partners improved by using the yahoo mail group and the members area of the project website. The face-to-face meetings were being carried out in a friendly, professional and collaborative atmosphere, but some improvement was still necessary regarding the quality level of the outcomes, for some partners. The Skype meetings were also of great importance for the communication process between the partners. Most partners strongly agreed on the fact that the partnership will be able to achieve the project’s objectives, as partners were working hard and, to that moment, the planned objective have been met. Still, one partner considered that while some work packages have been carried out appropriately, others were not (a comprehensive dissemination strategy, quality assurance and external evaluation), which might affect the achievement of the project’s objectives. For the Interim Report some delays in providing the deliverables were being pointed out, as one partner mentioned: quality plan, dissemination plan and external evaluation. Concluding, the initial questionnaire indicated that there are

some problems, inherent to every first steps taken by this partnership. Yet, the majority of the partners considered that there have been improvements in communication and collaboration with the project coordinator and between partners.

The final Survey regarding the satisfaction of the partners indicated that all partners are either very satisfied or satisfied with the project, considering it to be a very useful project, which permitted the realization of an innovative action in the field of e-learning and the offer of a platform very useful to young entrepreneurs. Also, this project offered the chance for obtaining new knowledge and also a very good interest from media, which permitted the promotion of this initiative and partnership. On the other hand, some improvements could be done in planning the activities.

Regarding the project's management, four partners were very satisfied with it and also with the collaboration with the coordinator, while two were satisfied with these aspects. An overall positive appreciation was being awarded to the production of the deliverables (three partners were very satisfied and three were satisfied) and to the Guidelines for transference (two partners were very satisfied and four were satisfied). As we decided to include in the external evaluation information and findings provided by the partners through internal questioning, the National Reports of Evaluation bring some further insight regarding the transnational partnership.

So, for the representatives of FVXM Spain, the coordinator of this project and the ones from IFI, Spain, the general cooperation was "Very well. There has been a great collaboration and involvement of all partners. Sharing opinions and work." With regard of the face to face meetings, the Kick-off was „very useful because there was a presentation of the summary of the all work packages and their contents and steps, and developed an Action plan for the next 6 months" and all other SGM "have been important for the developing of the project because in all of them there was analyzed the previous work until that meeting and specified the next steps...I think , there have been just the necessary meetings, no more, no less."

SPI Portugal considered that „communication with the coordinator, as with all partners, was done mostly through email, which led to an overwhelming quantity of emails to organize. However, the coordinator was always quick to reply. Partners seemed to be confused with the most updated documents and emails, other times some emails were reportedly not received. The kick-off meeting was highly relevant and should have been longer to allow sufficient time for all the topics to be discussed. As they coincided with different deliverables deadlines and further decisions to be made, the meetings turned out to be quite useful and just the right amount."

For EURO-NET Italy, "the coordinator did a very good job. The partnership worked very well. All the activities were decided in group as a whole. All the meetings were really important and really useful to take all the decisions about the project's steps. The meeting were enough for this project."

Representatives of SNCRR Romania stated “We had a very good cooperation with the coordinator during all the period of the project. He planned very well the timetable and he helped us to respect the deadlines. The partnership was a good one and complex one because each of us represented different actors, so the entire experience was a complex one. The dialogue with them worked very well.” With regards of the Kick-off meeting “it was very important for the start of the project and we discussed all the important topics.” Further, “all the meetings were very important for the the project and well prepared by the partners who hosted them. We also had some Skype meetings and we don’t think that more meetings would have been necessary.”

In Denmark, representatives of JobInVest consider “the cooperation with the coordinator worked very well, we received quick answers to our questions and there was a good follow-up on the deadlines.”In regard with the general partnership they concluded “the partnership was a good combination and competences and all of us have learnt from each other.” Referring to the relevance of the Kick-of meeting and the SGM’s „all important steps in the project period were discussed and all the partners had the possibility to contribute to the way the project was understood and implemented. All the meetings were important for the development of the project. The meetings face-to-face were very well combined with Skype meetings, so we don’t fill that more meetings would have been necessary.”

7. The impact on the target group

The target group of this project is made up, on one hand, by the mentors and on the other hand, by mentees. Making usage the terminology included in the project, we consider that „Mentoring is an intergenerational learning process, where a person with relevant experience and/or knowledge (Mentor) shares with another person (Mentee), generously and selflessly (volunteering), in a relationship of trust, in order to facilitate his personal and professional development, providing support and assistance needed to achieve their objectives. See more at: <http://voses.eu/mentoring#sthash.x3qLVMkm.dpuf>

MENTOR: A person with relevant expertise. Senior Entrepreneurs, Businessmen, Executives or Professionals, with altruism, with a wide work experience, 50 and over early retired, recently retired or active, who want to offer their expertise in business management to young people in need, through a particular approach: volunteering as a vehicle for active ageing, intergenerational learning and social participation.

MENTEE: A person who wants to learn the Mentor and his personal and professional development. Young people from 18 to 30 years old, facing a difficult situation in the labour market, especially the ones from vulnerable social groups and contexts, who want to develop an entrepreneurial project.

The pilot experience provided both with the opportunity to make use of this situation. Though, there were some differences between the participating countries in the project, most considered the relation between mentors and mentees as a closed one.

In Italy, the relation mentor-mentees was a very good one, there was total disponibility on part of the mentors and mentees. They had the chance to meet at least one time each week, in person, but also anytime via email or phone. This experience hat a large utility, as the mentees could make use of the vast experience of mentors, especially in consultancy. The mentees showed a high interest, because most of them had had already an idea about a possible business and about having their own company. So, through the pilot experience they had the chance to experiment such a scenario.

In Denmark, the relation between mentors and mentees was very important for both parts. As soon as they got in contact, they made use of the face to face meetings, but also used telephone and mail to communicate. Both considered this experience very useful and decided that future relations between them should be a priority. There were two types of mentees: some were very involved, because they already had a business idea, which they meant to bring to life. The other mentees had not such a high involvement, because they just wanted to learn something more about entrepreneurship.

In Portugal, around 90% of the mentees have had a good relationship with their mentor and confessed that they had a lot to learn from them. Some didn't have enough time to invest in this project, so they didn't get everything out of this opportunity. So, for instance, one of the mentee didn't show enough interest and didn't finish all modules. Still, for the most part, communication took place on a regular basis either face to face or via Skype, email, phone. This is mostly due to the effort and interest shown by the mentors to get through to the mentees.

In Spain, the mentors were very involved in the mentoring process, always available for the mentees. Although, at the beginning, the mentors experienced some anxiety regarding the use of the online platform and about meeting the goals, they became more confident after participating in some meetings. So their self esteem grow through this process. The mentees, on the other part, didn't have enough time to commit to this process, so they weren't able to go through the modules and then ask some specific questions. Thus, they didn't know what or how to ask for support and share of experience. Still, one of the most important impact of the project was that they took their own ideas more seriously and got to be more aware of the different components that a business requires, getting, in this way, a better understanding about the "big picture".

In Romania the relationship mentee – mentor was the most important part of the pilot experience, being the "human" element in this phase. The matching of the mentees with their mentors was done by the promoting organization – Red Cross Sibiu. They had 2 mentors and 8 mentees and finally 4 mentees to one mentor. They had weekly

meetings in the office of Red Cross during one month and these face to face meetings were very important for their relationship. Due to these meetings, the mentees were able to speak openly with the mentor about their project idea and develop it. The relationship they had with the mentors became one very important for them, even after the ending of the pilot experience. The impact this relationship had was a very powerful one also on the mentors, and at the end of the pilot experience they expressed gratitude for being part of this, because "they also learned a lot from their mentees" during this project.

In figures, the situation looks as follows:

- ✓ Denmark: 7 mentees (just 5 have finished the modules) and 3 mentors
- ✓ Romania: 8 mentees and 2 mentors
- ✓ Italy: 9 mentees and 3 mentors
- ✓ Spain: 6 mentees and 6 mentors
- ✓ Portugal: 10 mentees and 7 mentors

8. The use of transferable innovation

The use of transferable innovation was another important aspect that was monitored during the external evaluation. Preparatory activities included the organization of the Local Discussion Groups, in each country, establishing a set of guidelines for the transference, the elaboration of an action plan, the selection of the WTE: Women Technology Entrepreneurs – modules, that will be used in the VOSES project, the first workshops, organized by the partners in order to get some feedback from national experts on the topics, revision and final version of the modules and developing mentoring methodology. Throughout this process there was an intense activity and preoccupation of the partners to make use of all suggestions and inputs that were available, in order to adapt the learning modules to the target group of the VOSES project, namely young people. Furthermore, the practical mentoring program will enhance their business competences and personal skills.

The partners decided to use nine modules from the WTE. So, each partner had one or two modules to revise, during a workshop with local experts and, afterwards, during discussions and feedback between all partners. The distribution of the modules between partners was as follows:

- Innovation and Ideas Generation – Portugal
- Business Plan – Italy
- Communication – Denmark
- Effective Business Networking – Romania
- E – business and Web marketing – Romania
- Web design – Portugal
- Business management and Leadership – Spain
- Customer Service – Spain

- Administrative and Legal Issues – Optional for each partner.

The invited local experts provided valuable input and suggestions regarding the modules, during the workshops, which were taken into account by each partner. With few exceptions, the modules were adapted in regard of the content, structure or form, according to the input of local experts, on the one hand and the feedback of the other partners, on the other. A comprehensive presentation of these changes can be found in the 1st Workshop GLOBAL Report, from June 2013, as well as on the discussion from the private area of the VOSES website and from the email exchange between partners.

During the validation process, each partner has obtained different inputs. At the SGM in Potenza, the national inputs were aggregated so that following conclusions were assessed:

- ✓ The order of the modules is considered generally acceptable and no changes are recommended;
- ✓ On the content, there was some demand for further development on the topics of sales, marketing, finance and accounting. Also, it was suggested to create new modules about labour laws, personal branding, funding opportunities, soft skills, among others;
- ✓ Generally, it was agreed that the users of the course should be able to choose what modules to complete, with no predetermined order;
- ✓ About exercises, it was very clear that these should not test the knowledge of the mentees, but rather give them practical exercises to apply to their own projects or directly to a business plan.

In short, as the final Satisfaction Survey indicated the most important changes and adaptation were the following:

Module	Responsible with revision	Important changes/adaptations
Innovation and Ideas Generation	Portugal	Updated content, added multimedia content and examples
Business Plan	Italy	All the module were adjourned and elaborated in a new version
Communication	Denmark	-
Effective Business Networking	Romania	We added more practical examples and exercises and we updated the content.
E – business and Web marketing	Romania	We had to transform actually the two modules – E-business module and Online marketing

		module in only one. We had to select the most important parts from both modules and to adapt the content to a new, single and complex module.
Web design	Portugal	Updated content, added multimedia content and examples
Business management and Leadership	Spain	Leadership: although the content was very good and complete, was too large, it was necessary to simplify and adapt the language to the target group to engage and motivate them: statements, slogans... using more friendly language and messages Business Management: The structure used was not adapted (U.S. model). It was necessary to rethink the content to make it more general and adaptable to all partner countries.

The final, adapted Version of the modules has been uploaded to the platform and the mentors and mentees in each country have made use of them.

Regarding the national opinions on this subject, the utility of the modules, a pilot experience has been organised in each participating country.

EURO-NET found out that for Italian users, the most interesting module was the one regarding the “Business Plan”, as it provided crucial information about what is needed, from the financial perspective, in order to found a successful company. Additionally, the online platform was considered to be clear and very friendly, although, in the beginning, some problems came about, but which were quickly resolved.

During the pilot experience in Denmark, Jobinvest established that the most useful modules were: “Business Plan”, “E – business and Web marketing”, “Web design” and “Communication”. Less useful were considered to be “Business management and Leadership” and “Administrative and Legal Issues”, probably because of the early stage of preoccupation of the mentees, as this aspects become crucial, in later stages. The online platform is considered to be very useful, providing good

information, but need to prioritise the mentoring support. For the best results, the content of the online platform should be enriched by meetings, guest lecturers and networking.

In Portugal, SPI found out that for the mentees, the most interesting aspects were related to how one should create one's own company, namely the module "Administrative and Legal Issues". Other modules have received a mixed evaluation. So, for example, "Customer Service", "E – business and Web marketing" and "Web design" received good reviews from some of the users, but also critics. Most of the critics considered these modules to be too technical. The online platform worked, in essence, but it involved lots of effort to explain, primarily to mentors, where each course is, where to find the exercises, how to download. Also, it was technically not so easy to use. What was particularly inefficient was filling out the evaluation formulary.

In Spain, however, the platform was considered to be friendly and easy to use, although initially, mentors had their doubts and fears, if they could live up to the challenge. FVxM and IFI established that the most appreciated modules in Spain were "E – business and Web marketing" and "Business Plan", while "Administrative and Legal Issues" were very difficult to understand and to specific.

For Romania the e-learning platform was very appreciated by the mentees, being considered user friendly and with all the important information. They enjoyed all the modules, especially the "E-business and Web marketing", and the "Web Design". For one of the mentors, it was a little more difficult to use the platform because of their lack of experience with the computers, but this is a general problem with the people over 60 in Romania, but when the platform was presented to them they appreciated it as a very complex and useful one.

9. General conclusions of the Final Report

This Final report of the External Evaluation showed the progress of the project towards the project's objectives, how the relations between the partner of this project has evolved, the impact on the target group and, as well, the use of transferable innovation, during the two years of the project.

The initial timeline for each of the eight work packages and the deliverables has been made in advance. The Gantt chart we use for the External Evaluation has been elaborated on the basis of the project's application form, drawn out some time ago. This explains why some delays have occurred in providing some of the deliverables. Still, most of the deliverables have already been finished, except for the final reports. The exact situation can be easily seen on the Gantt chart, Appendix 1.

The six partners involved in the VOSSES project have now been working together for two years. The majority of the respondents consider that the launching of the project was satisfactory. The initial meetings were productive, tasks were effectively distributed to all partners and the project coordinator assured a good collaboration with every partner. Regarding the collaboration between partners, some consider that, at first, communication was difficult, but that it improved over time, especially after creating the yahoo mail group and member area of the website. Regarding the project's management, four partners were very satisfied with it and also with the collaboration with the coordinator, while two were satisfied with these aspects. An overall positive appreciation was being awarded to the production of the deliverables (three partners were very satisfied and three were satisfied) and to the Guidelines for transference (two partners were very satisfied and four were satisfied).

The target group consisted of mentors, elderly, retired business men and mentees, young people who wanted to develop their entrepreneurial skills. After the pilot experience, the partners reached the conclusion that this experience had a large utility, as the mentees could make use of the vast experience of mentors, especially in consultancy. Mentors and mentees considered this experience very useful and decided that future relations between them should be a priority. For the most part, communication took place on a regular basis either face to face or via Skype, email, phone. Due to these meetings, the mentees were able to speak openly with the mentor about their project idea and develop it. Although, at the beginning, the mentors experienced some anxiety regarding the use of the online platform and about meeting the goals, they became more confident after participating in some meetings. So their self esteem grew through this process. Some mentees initiated first activities in order to bring to life their business ideas.

The use of transferable Innovation was one of the most present activity in the first year of the project. The initial Local Discussion Groups that have been organized in each country aimed to provide information about the required key competences,

which young people need. On this basis, the content of the online courses could be adapted, according to the set of guidelines for transference that also has been developed. So, the WTE-modules represented the starting point. The partners decided to use nine modules of the WTE. Each partner was responsible for one or two modules, which had to be adjusted in order to be suitable for developing entrepreneurial competences of young people. After that the modules was also reviewed by the other partners and further changes have been made.

Some general conclusions regarding the adaptation needs considered that the order of the modules is considered generally acceptable and no changes are recommended. On the content, there was some demand for further development on the topics of sales, marketing, finance and accounting. Also, it was suggested to create new modules about labour laws, personal branding, funding opportunities, soft skills, among others. Generally, it was agreed that the users of the course should be able to choose what modules to complete, with no predetermined order. About exercises, it was very clear that these should not test the knowledge of the mentees, but rather give them practical exercises to apply to their own projects or directly to a business plan.

Author: Scientific Researcher PhD. Mihai Baltador

