Education and Culture DG
Lifelong Learning Programme

creative blended mentoring for cultural managers

A NEW FRAMEWORK FOR THE PROFILES OF MANAGERS OF ARTS AND CULTURE[1]

Objective: report on the results of the partners' surveys to map the skills, competences and attributes of cultural operators in their national labour markets.

Responsible for the report: Gerald Lidstone and Dr. Carla Figueira, Institute for Creative and Cultural Entrepreneurship, Goldsmiths, University of London

Partners:
- ENCATC, Brussels, Belgium
- RPIC-ViP s.r.o., Ostrava, Czech Republic
- Finnish Museums Association, Helsinki, Finland
- Istituto Luigi Sturzo, Rome, Italy
- Institute of Leisure Studies, University of Deusto, Bilbao, Spain
- Denizli Special Provincial Administration, Turkey
- Institute for Creative and Cultural Entrepreneurship, Goldsmiths, University of London, United Kingdom

Data collected:
A total of 104 interviews were conducted by the partner institutions in seven European countries during April, May and June 2012. The interviewees were identified and selected as representative of particular areas in the various national contexts. The interviews concentrated on the collection of qualitative data.

Table 1 Interviews by Partner: breakdown by category

Country, Partner & geographical spread of interviews	Number of Interviews by Category					
	Cat. 1 Professionals	Cat. 2 Just Employed	Cat. 3 Organisation representative	Cat. 4 Unemployed	Other	Tot.
(BE) ENCATC: Brussels					3	3
(CZ) RPIC-ViP: Ostrava	7	6	3	3	1	20
(FI) FMA: Helsinki, Espoo, Vantaa, Kuopio, Lappeenranta and Oulu	2	7	3	3		15
(IT) ILS: Rome, Milan, Bologna, Catania, Ancona	7	5	4	4		20
(ES) ILS-UoD: Basque Country, La Rioja, Cantabria, Madrid and Barcelona	3	3	7	3		16
(TR) DSPA: Denizli, Istanbul, Izmir	3	3	5	4		15
(UK) ICCE-G-UoL: London, Edinburgh	4	3	4	4		15
Totals	26	27	26	21	4	104

[1] This research, part of the CREA.M project 518533-LLP-1-2011-1-IT-LEONARDO-LMP, has been funded with support from the European Commission. This publication reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

The present mapping stage report is a useful tool to orientate the definition of the blended mentoring tool that will be developed and tested in the next stage of our project. It highlights the need for discussion and further attention to blended mentoring in each of the national contexts involved in the project.
It should be stressed that on this project the depth of understanding derived from the interviews was considered a higher priority than undertaking a great number that would yield relatively flat data.

A. EMPLOYMENT IN THE CULTURAL SECTOR

A1. Current situation of employment in the cultural sector in the different countries and brief description of the general process of gaining employment.

Note: this was the only point for which partners were asked to rely on data and information beyond that collected in interviews.

Current situation of employment in the cultural sector

The current situation of employment in the cultural sector is an important dimension of the context in which the CREAM project is being developed thus some awareness of the situation is useful.

A clear picture of the overall current situation of employment in the cultural sector across countries is difficult to achieve due to insufficient data in some countries and the lack of harmonisation of statistics and terminology between countries. For example, the project partners in the Czech Republic reported in their country a lack of knowledge about cultural sector employment due to absence of research in the area – this presents a research opportunity that public authorities welcome and potentially will support.

The current economic crisis is an important backdrop to consider regarding the development of our project. Unemployment affects all the countries part of the survey and, as expected, data collected by many of the partners indicates a lack of job opportunities in the cultural sector, thus job markets can be characterized as saturated and demand led (specifically CZ, ES, FI, UK).

Some partners provided additional interesting information. For example, Italy reports that the cultural employment market there has been stable in recent years but it still represents a very low share of overall employment, despite the high concentration of cultural heritage in the country and having one of the highest percentages of undergraduate courses in culture in the EU. Also the Czech Republic reports that cultural sector employment appears to represent an extremely small fraction (around 0.3%) of the job market judging by a survey of online job offers conducted by our partner. In Turkey, culture is an emergent and growing employment market, according to our partners. Cultural policies are being developed and the sector is in the process of regulation. This is reflected in the absence of well-defined recruitment procedures.

As it can quickly be gathered from these brief notes, the partners operate in a variety of contexts ranging from more established cultural sectors to new and relatively unstructured ones. Thus, the decision to select interviewees representative of particular areas of the cultural sector to inform the mapping stage was designed to efficiently obtain qualitative

data that allowed the project to gather the necessary information to adequately feed subsequent stages.

The process of gaining employment

The formal process of recruitment in the different countries is shaped by national legislations. The detail of these in relation to the process of gaining employment in the cultural sector is outside the scope of the project. However it is important to gain a general understanding of how the process is developed across the geographical areas in which the partners operate.

Overall, partners identified a range of recruitment procedures that vary, for example, with the type of organisation (e.g. state/large, small/private) and the type of position advertised (e.g. senior/junior, artistic/managerial, technical/general/administrative). Larger and state dependent organisations tend to follow more standard recruitment procedures, advertise positions widely and recruit from a larger pool of candidates. Procedures in smaller organisations (and non-state dependent ones) will be simpler, and they may tend to look for candidates they may already know or have knowledge of – the Spanish report, for example, mentions the importance of internships, previous collaborators and networks in this case. This can be explained by a number of reasons: larger organisations normally have to abide by certain employment laws that do not apply to smaller organisations; these smaller organisations will try to simplify and restrict their recruitment procedures to save time and money. The streamlining of procedures and recruiting from a smaller pool of candidates, can, in some cases, give the impression of lack of transparency, an issue we will come back to.

The recruitment process will start with some sort of job advert that can range from:
- personal offer or very restricted 'invitations to apply';
- advert in organisational websites and specialised media and/or networks;
- advert in general media and/or job centres.

This advert will describe, in more or less detail, the job duties and the profile of the candidate. The data indicates that the UK and Finland have perhaps developed clearer sector wide requirements regarding the job advert (e.g. lists of required skills and competences).

The process of recruitment in response to the job advert appears to be fairly standard across the countries examined. This includes applying for the job by sending a cover letter and a CV (or similar form) with details regarding skills, knowledge and attributes (not necessarily using this terminology). These documents are evaluated by a committee (or even just one person in a very small organisation), which short lists candidates for interviews and then proceeds to a further evaluation during interview. This results in a final decision regarding the job offer - senior management normally have final decision power. The chosen candidate will then take the job, subject to a probation period.

Some notes

From the data collected by the partners, it was interesting to note the degree to which the observation of some procedures/conducts, such as the advertising of posts, selection of

candidates and the veracity of information provided in CV, were reported to be followed or not.

The issue of restricted advertising of posts was mentioned above and it is a recurrent theme in the data collected. The Finnish partners highlighted the existence of a number of jobs in the cultural sector that are not openly advertised, to which potential candidates will only have access through connections and networks. The Czech Republic partners also report that in many cases new employees are recruited on the basis of personal contacts, recommendations and references. The Italian partners state that "In Italy the informal channel continues to be the main way to find a job in all sectors: 3 employees out of 10 come into the labour market through family and friends referrals" (these practices are reported as more acute in the cultural sector). This represents an important barrier to entry into the cultural labour market.

The restrict advertising of posts ties in with concerns over candidate selection. The Italian partners report that candidate selection is characterized by a lack of standard procedures. Also Turkey notes a similar situation leading to current recruitment relying on personal contacts, with candidatures documented by CVs and supported by personal references. Increased regulation is underway in Turkey and in Italy "standard procedures assuring objective evaluation of candidates and a system of certification/validation of professionals is perceived as essential for the efficiency of this [cultural] market." Clear standards and procedures are an important basis for fair competition in the job market.

The Czech Republic partners acutely raised the topic of the accuracy of the information provided by job applicants. They identified on the part of the candidates a tendency to state in their CV not quite truthful information about skills, knowledge and experience. Spain made a similar observation. Although other partners have not objectively identified this situation in their countries, the overall concern with this type of situation is indicated by the importance attributed to the interview in the recruitment process: a decisive phase of the process, where candidates must demonstrate and evidence the relevance of their competencies and attributes to the position being applied for. Interviews, however, are not infallible and, at times, only after the position is taken, employers conclude that their decision was not the best (e.g. mentioned by BE, SP, UK). However it was also noted in some countries that the process of probation, reviewing the progress of a new appointee within a fixed timeframe, can be used if it is felt that the wrong decision has been taken.

Still in connection with verification of information, it is noted in the data obtained from the surveys that many employers are starting to use the Internet to harness further information about candidates to validate their CVs, e.g. by requesting e-portolios (CZ) and researching social networks such as Facebook (SP,UK).

Another concern emerging from the data is about how the current economic crisis is affecting employment in the cultural sector. The concerns put forward are broadly related with:
- lack of funds for the cultural sector and problems with the system of financing culture (CZ identified it as a concern across interviews and as a often given general reason for stagnation, "*if not even downfall of the* [cultural] *sector*". CZ signals that the existing system does not respond to current market, economic and social dynamics);
- reduction of hired staff, decrease of recruitment and an increase of freelance consultants (an emerging trend in FI), resulting in a growing need for flexibility, risk assumption and

motivation for workers as employment in the cultural sector is shifting towards forms of temporary and project-based contracts (IT).

As mentioned at the start of the report, the economic crisis is the context in which the partners are developing this project and, it can also be said, one reason why they are developing the project: aiming to support those in precarious employment.

B. ATTRIBUTES, SKILLS AND COMPETENCIES

B1. Which balance of knowledge, attributes, skills and competences was most often identified as constituting a competitive advantage on gaining employment? What was the common quality employers identified as important across positions in the cultural sector?

The data obtained allows us to observe that:
- the balance of knowledge, attributes, skills and competences offering a competitive advantage to gain employment depends on the particular cultural sector;
- the balance of knowledge, attributes, skills and competences offering a competitive advantage to gain employment depends on the position being advertised;
- attributes/personal characteristics appear to be more important than skills in the case of non-technical jobs;
- experience/practice appears to be more important than education/qualifications, particularly in the case of junior positions (however, to be able to reach senior positions, qualifications can make a difference). However, they are important in Finland, as informants report it as being the base on which their expertise is built.

The data obtained indicates that the balance of knowledge, attributes, skills and competences constituting a competitive advantage on gaining employment in the cultural sector in the different countries and cultural sub-sectors is diverse and complex – please see section H.

In terms of important qualities constituting an advantage in gaining employment, partners collected a wide range of mentions. In order not to reduce the richness of the data obtained, which provides a good overview of desirable qualities for job applicants, we are presenting the untreated material on Table 2. Before presenting the table, we would like to invite reflection on the profile suggested by the CZ report:

> *"Overstating, we can define an ideal magic applicant that is being wanted by employers – young, able, reliable, loyal workaholic, with plenty of experience, 100% healthy and willing to work for a minimal salary."*

We suggest thinking about the aims of the project: is the aim to construct the image of a candidate with a 'super profile' and support its development or is it to advise individuals on their own paths of self-development?

Table 2 Qualities identified by employers as being important in job applicants

Partner	Qualities
BE	curious, open, eager to learn, open-minded, collaborative, proactive, responsible

CZ	new ideas, creativity, communication, higher-measure of co-operation, invention, reliability, creative thinking, team work, communicative skills, performance orientation, loyalty, independence
FI	Skills: project management, economy/business (how to make budgets, marketing, clear picture of 'money'), ICT and languages (not just foreign languages, but also those used in the country – FI is a bilingual Finnish/Swedish country, but Russian is also important in Eastern Finland), good communication and writing skills, and also social skills and fitting well with team (inc. team-working skills). Attributes: open to learning new things (changing world). Other skills and specific knowledge will give the candidate advantage in a competitive market.
IT	Attributes: diplomacy, courage, humility, sensitiveness, understanding of contexts, focus, flexibility, patience, tenacity, structure, perseverance, strong motivation and energy, ability to make decisions, relate well with others. Skills: fundraising, audience development, project management, organisational skills. Other: dynamism, eagerness to learn, passion and motivation, experiences abroad denoting linguistic skills but also openness, independence and growth of candidates.
ES	Attributes: love for what you do, discipline/hardworking, dedication/vocation, commitment to your work and to society, proactivity, (i.e., collaborating with associations, developing own projects), honesty, respect, sensitivity, to be curious about what is happening, to be connected, to have your own criteria as cultural consumer, to be patient and flexible, to have empathy (in order to understand other departments roles or externals, i.e. artist, philosophers, client), to reflect plurality of cultures/races, assertiveness, coherency (between interests and professional career), affection to the organisation. Skills: social, technical (e.g. musicians), foreign language (in deep, one minimum or two), communication, service orientation.
TR	teamwork, communication skills, knowledge about specific cultural area
UK	Skills: organisational, communication, interpersonal Qualities: flexibility, ability to fit in a team/organisation

The qualities assembled in Table 2 are taken from different sections of the partners' institutions. There was not a concern with analysis regarding what is a skill, an attribute, knowledge, competence or what is a quality, issues of same concept/different term. In face of this dense description, partners can decide which data needs to be revisited and analysed in depth in view of the next stage of the project.

Most of the data collected is pertinent to specific cases. The report of the Spanish partners identified a list of qualities *Professionals (middle management) working in cultural organisations* considered to be decisive in gaining their jobs:

- An international profile as student (studies abroad)
- Having knowledge of the institution and of their persons
- Capacity to work, respect and responsibility
- Proactivity, launching initiatives
- Showing availability and passion
- Being patient and humble when learning,
- Listening to others.

This list, although it can be said to be one of many possible, highlights many of the repeated qualities in Table 2: responsibility, initiative, knowledge, social skills.

A systemic approach to cultural management is proposed, in the report of the Italian partners, as an alternative way to view the balance of knowledge, skills and attributes: "Organisations don't need to find perfect candidates …if they are able to value and combine different and complementary competencies and attributes among different people". This can be connected with the ability of being able to work in a team and the importance some of the interviewed employers placed on a candidate having the right profile to fit in the team/ organisation. It might be worthwhile for partners to discuss this issue of shift of focus from the individual to the organisation in the view of the objectives of the project.

B2. Do employers feel that job applicants have them? Are they looking for specific criteria or for new and innovative thinkers? Do job applicants feel they have them? Are they aware of their skills and attributes and what they can do to develop them? Thus, are there significant differences between the expectations of employers, of people recently gaining employment and of job applicants?

The answer to this strand of the survey is partially answered by the characterisation of the employment market in the cultural sector noted in A1 as a demand led market, with considerable more applicants than job opportunities.

The data obtained in the survey however highlights some variation in finding suitable candidates across the countries where the project partners are based. In the UK, interviewed employers had no problem in getting candidates with the right profiles. They look for different profiles according to the position they want to fill and job seekers were aware of their skills and attributes and knew how to develop them (e.g. short courses, postgraduate education). In Finland, while data also indicates a demand led job market, regional variations and variations in terms of the size of employer organisations were highlighted in the report. Some interviewees in the UK also made remarks to substantiate this variation. Thus, capital cities and bigger urban centres will have a more buoyant job market for the cultural sector, where prestigious and larger cultural/arts organisations will be able to attract and choose employees from a large pool of talented candidates.

While examining the data obtained, it is important to understand the context in which the partners are developing their survey. For example, the Spanish partners mention employers have, at times, difficulty in finding the right candidate. They find it easier to fulfil management and administrative positions than technical ones. Also they note that sometimes candidates have the education but not the right skills or attributes. On the other hand, those looking for a job felt well prepared but were more aware of their skills than of their attributes. For them language knowledge and insufficient awareness of the cultural sector were the main concerns. This thick description redirects us to many different strands of analysis, some general, others linked to the fact that the survey had a particular focus on the Basque country, which entails (among others) particular linguistic issues – knowledge of the Basque language is an advantage for employment. Obviously the detailed analysis of these strands is not possible in the remit of this report. However over the diversity of the EU national, regional and even local context may play an important role. In the case of Finland, an employer highlighted the attraction of having regional candidates filling their posts as this would lead to less change.

Continuing the reporting of the different results in terms of finding the right candidates, the Czech partners concluded, from the data collected, that while many of the applicants did not fulfil the requirements, employers were able to find employees with the relevant profile for the positions they advertise. This can be viewed, as in the case of other partners' data (e.g. UK, FI), as an indication that the employment market in the cultural sector is demand led. This can also be interpreted in the sense that the requirements were too ambitious as a true description of the post and that a person who did not fulfil them all could in fact be suitable. Alternatively, once in post a candidate adapted to the post fast and 'fitted' the criteria swiftly.

Exploring the strand of age/experience in relation to the skills and attributes of candidates, the Czech partners identified a generational divide in relation to computer and new technology related skills, foreign languages and use of new methods of work – with a negative balance for the older generation. At the same time, the IT report notes that more experienced candidates are more aware of their skills and attributes and TR data corroborates this. So we could conclude that, in some cases, although older/more experienced candidates may be lacking in certain skills/competences, they are more aware of their profiles and how to developed them. This awareness can confer a slight advantage that younger/less experienced candidates could benefit from.

The Italian report reiterates a recurrent point in the survey: employers deal with heterogeneous profiles and finding an ideal mix (in the Italian case: flexible competent and motivated professional with strong organisational skills) is difficult. Further to skill development, IT and FI report that skills related to administration and budgeting are often mentioned by job-seekers as the ones needing further development – this appears to highlights the importance of hard skills related with financial matters, crucial to the survival of the cultural sector in a time of decreasing public subsidies. IT also notes a lack of communication between employers and job-seekers regarding the real needs and dynamics of the sector. This gap is also noticed between education and job market, as we shall see in C. This situation points to the need, in some countries more than others, to foster and increased interaction between the different stakeholders to prepare in the best way possible candidates that are needed to perform in and lead the development of the markets.

The topic of creative thinking appears to follows, according to some of the data, the binary of generic versus specialised positions, where people occupying the latter are perceived as needing to 'do the job' (however this does not preclude the use of 'some' innovation). This quote from a FI interviewee sums up the topic very well:

> *"Combination of both is often the best. I think that there are not so many places that can afford to hire just innovative thinkers." "But the job seeker should always be open to innovative ideas. It shows that you are interested in developing yourself and your work."*

B3. How did established professionals acquire them? Which experiences have your interviewees considered the most and the least formative in a professional career in the cultural sector?

Experience is identified in the research as the most important means to acquire and develop the right set of skills, knowledge and attributes for employment.

Reported **formative experiences** are mostly related with on-the-job experiences (including internships and freelance or own project initiatives) of performing different roles and through observation and interaction with colleagues (senior and otherwise). Education is also, but in a smaller number of cases, mentioned as a source of formative experiences: inspiring teacher (secondary schooling) or guest speaker (higher education). Other situations are also mentioned: FI interviewees refers to life experiences, childhood (living near a castle), which indicates a broader view of formative experience; IT mention teachers and relatives as key people triggering formative experiences; an interviewee in ES notes how participating in her family business provided her with practice of work ethic and procedures. It might have been useful for interviewees to provide them with a working definition of formative experience, however this could also diminish the richness of the data – see G.

Least formative experiences do not seem to have made as a decisive imprint as positive ones in the professional career of the interviewees – the number of least formative experiences mentioned (e.g. Turkey mentions theoretical background and desk work) is significantly less than positive experiences. This may indicate a more pronounced impact of positive experiences on the individual learning process.

A discussable topic arising from the research, and which is outside the scope of the CREA.M project, is that of **attributes** being **innate** and the extent to which they can be **learnt**:

> "*Senior professionals from different sectors often refer to attitudes towards analysis and synthesis, organization, determination, as partly innate and partly developed in early stages of their lives*".

This may be another topic of interesting reflection for partners in view of the development of the project.

Serendipity is mentioned as playing an important role in formative experiences through "fortunate encounters" and contacts with key people. To what extent can people prepare and plan for a career in the cultural sector?

C. EDUCATION AND PREPARATION FOR WORK

C1. What qualifications are employers looking for and what do they consider is their importance in gaining employment? Reflections on information provided by professionals in employment regarding educational preparation for 'real jobs', e.g. development of particular skills.

Largely, it can be said that qualifications are important for gaining employment. The data collected, however, indicates some variations in attitude towards the importance of qualifications. This also appears to be more relevant in the case of specialist jobs that imply particular skills.

An academic degree on a relevant field is often a basic requirement for work in the cultural sector in Finland - humanities and cultural management degrees are a common background that employers look for. Postgraduate degrees are also obligatory for many jobs in local and central government. This can be linked to the Finnish context where cultural sector education in widely available. It is interesting to note that some informants felt there were too many available courses in the area of postgraduate education in arts/cultural management – this should be viewed in the context of discussions about educational cuts in

Finland. In Spain a degree is also recognised as a base for employment with further specific training in culture. The Czech partners report that employers value academic degrees, particularly when a position is related to specific knowledge and skills, however in the case of artistic positions, 'talent' takes priority. Nevertheless CZ interviewees often mentioned that education did not provide adequate preparation for work. The same is reported in Italy, where education is often perceived as too theoretical – both at undergraduate and postgraduate level. Nevertheless, in Italy, knowledge in the humanities/a strong cultural background was considered a necessary basis for employment, while "the concrete technical abilities needed to work are learnt through direct experience".

The importance of experience above education in gaining employment has already been stressed. So, for instances, in Spain, while knowledge in cultural management or in a specific cultural area are the necessary base to work in the cultural sector, experience, is decisive to gain employment. Again, in Turkey, while an academic degree is a starting point to apply for jobs, experience and references will make the difference between candidates. The Finnish partners details the situation noting that the development of general competences (e.g. writing skills, researching, language) relies on education, while the development of other particular skills is often practical ("learned by doing").

In the UK, education/qualifications seem to be more important for senior positions. However they can be a must for specialized/technical jobs, this can include fundraising (development) or marketing (audience development) . In the UK your undergraduate degree does not seem to be determinant for a career in culture, some of the interviewees came from the sciences - transferable skills are highly valued. Often these candidates will reinforce their knowledge in arts/culture through a variety of ways: postgraduate courses, technical courses, placements or by developing their own projects.

C2. How do job applicants perceive their education has helped them developed skills for their intended jobs?

Many professionals working in the cultural sector studied subjects quite different from their professional careers (e.g. CZ a director of a multi-cultural centre studied nuclear energy) – this confirms the importance of experience in the development of a professional career in the cultural sector. The Turkish partners highlight how this situation disadvantages newly graduated candidates and the importance of internships and volunteering work during university education.

Education was mostly perceived as theoretical basis – but nevertheless a structural background - on which to build upon. Further studies in the cultural area, e.g. cultural/arts management postgraduate courses, were perceived by professionals as offering a specialised education, developing relevant skills for the work place (but not the case in IT). However, even in the case of these courses, interviewees considered that there was room for further improvement, particularly in these areas: accounts, budgets, human resources, grant applications, project development. Postgraduate courses that include internships as part of their programmes are considered by many interviewees an important way to develop practical skills and enlarge a network of contacts.

The Spanish partners, report specific criticism of the educational sector:
- lack of practical knowledge at university (inc. the practice of social/people skills necessary for work);

- not fostering an entrepreneurial attitude;
- focus on content instead of processes.

The situation is not unique to Spain and some of those concerns are also reflected in the reports of other partners, in particular that of Italy.

UK applicants feel that post-graduate education in the area of arts and culture has, most times, provided them with broad awareness of the cultural sector and some competence in skills such as business planning and development, marketing, finance, team work, research and presentation. Postgraduate education in the UK also offers sector awareness, which along with a network of contacts and experience is one of the main important advantages in gaining employment in the cultural sector.

C3. What is the importance of nonformal and informal learning in job applications? How do applicants demonstrate that and how do employers validate it?

Non-formal and informal learning are considered important for job applications. An FI interviewee highlights that *"All hobbies and interests are important and valuable, for example: art, organisations, even courses in first-aid or security officer work".*

Employers do pay attention to different types of learning, described by the candidates on the CV and cover letter. Employers view the interview as the place to evidence that learning in relation to the position candidates are applying for. Employers believe that not always job applicants are able to make the most of this type of learning to advance their applications and gain a competitive edge. This may be related to a series of circumstances, for example deficiencies in their presentation skills, poor understanding of the interview purpose and process, relative low awareness of their own learning and its importance. IT data point to the fact that job applicants are not sufficiently aware of the importance of non-formal and informal learning in a job application, thus they do not highlight it enough.

Obviously the onus is not only on the candidate, employers may not be facilitating the opportunities, for example during the questioning in interview, for candidates to demonstrate their non-formal and informal learning.

Besides the CV and questioning for evidence during interview, references can also be used to check learning. Increasingly a number of employers is starting to check the candidates' profiles in social media (e.g. Facebook, LinkedIn). However, in Finland it is understood that employers are not allowed to search potential candidates on Google, or if they do so, they are not allowed to use this information in the selection process.

D. THE PROCESS TOWARDS EMPLOYMENT

D1. What is the importance of internships/work placements/stages/volunteering work and previous connections or knowledge of individuals and organisations in gaining employment?

Experience in the work place through the above mentioned short to medium term opportunities (often unpaid or low paid) appears to present advantages to all those involved in the process of employment: employers, applicants and also to educational institutions that are often involved in the process. Employers are able to count on precious help and

expertise to develop their activities for no or low cost – at times these placements are a solution to understaffing, which is inadequate and unfair. Internships (and similar) also offer an opportunity for employers to meet potential future employees and see how they are, fit in the team, adapt to the organisation, with no further obligations; inject new ideas in the organisation. Applicants are able to experience a range of professional situations and tasks with a limited level of responsibility, thus building up a portfolio of evidence useful for future job applications. They can also learn by observing the best practises of the organisations and start to build their own networks of contacts. Educational institutions also benefit from the links between students and professionals when placements are a part of their programme of studies: professionals are an open door to what is happening in the field, their knowledge can feed into academic research, thus this institutions are able to accurately monitor and reflect on what is happening; students are given an important asset for employability as practical experience is determinant in the process of gaining employment – thus these courses will be more sought after; develop curriculum in line with sector needs, thus equipping future workers with the necessary skills.

The importance of internships is evidenced in the reports. For example, FI reports that 5/7 interviewees in category 2 mentioned internships/placements helped them get a job, and two others had previous connections to their future workplace. In Spain internships are perceived as a good preparation for real jobs due to their practical character. In the UK they are also very important in gaining employment as relevant experience is highly ranked by employers. The Arts Council England has created a substantial document of guidelines for internships in arts organisations, recommending paid internships. On the other hand, Italian interviewees remarked the need for a better and stronger link between internships offered by universities and the actual needs of the sector, in order to contrast the current vicious trend of unpaid stages not leading to any concrete job opportunity.

Previous connections and knowledge of individuals and organisations appears to be quite important to gain employment in Italy. The Italian partners mention that internships/ placements are an opportunity for employers to meet future collaborators, which is of paramount importance as “In general the sector is perceived as a field in which connections and personal knowledge of people can make the big difference in gaining employment”. It is particularly striking that “All the interviewees that succeeded in gaining employment went through recruitment processes thanks to direct connections with people and knowledge of individuals working for the institutions that hired them”. These networks of contacts can thus have dual effects of enabling a few and barring access to many to job opportunities.

Previous knowledge of individuals and organisations appears not to be as determinant in the UK, however it can be of value on the identification of a job opportunity, as a means to evidence your skills and attributes and demonstrate interest in the job/organisation. It is essential to research well an organisation to emphasise your ‘fit’ in an application or interview.

Criticism of internships/stages is evident in some of the data collected. IT reports that internships and stages “are not structured to educate and train for real jobs and don’t have enough connections with the job market”. It appears a restructuration of internships/ placements is in need so that they are useful for job applicants and not merely a way of an organisation ‘getting work done for nothing’. In a way that is why the perception that stages in smaller organisations are more valued than those in bigger ones, as in the latter tasks are much more broken down, while in the first case the intern will have an opportunity to do many more things (IT).

Finally, it might be interesting to reflect on this comment of BE Interviewee 1 that invites to a rethinking of human resources in the cultural sector and consider its economic consequences:

> *"I think in the [cultural] sector, we have a general problem which lies in the fact that we are a value based sector and that oddly enough we don't apply those values on our own working environment. We tend to promote generosity and solidarity and all these humanistic values, but then we tend to exploit people … people expect to be exploited when they're working in the cultural sector. We have low salaries. We work overtime. We have burnouts all the time."*

D2. What is the importance of the interview in the recruitment process?

The interview is a key stage of the recruitment process. Exact procedures for the conduct and evaluation of the interviews vary and its examination is beyond the scope of the research. For the purpose of the project, it is useful to understand that interviews are the occasion when, having been selected from a pool of job applicants, candidates are able to demonstrate the relevance of their skills, knowledge and attributes to the job at stake. The interview is thus a key point of the recruitment process.

While the interview is considered a crucial point in recruitment by employers, they also recognise their faults, as sometimes candidates "may lack key attributes and reveal it only in the real job". See also p.4/5 on this subject. In this light it is interesting to note the Turkish partner consideration about the need to find new and innovative ways of presenting the candidate. In this sense it would be worth considering the usefulness of further exploring the importance of the Internet and social/professional networks - some data has pointed to the use of e-portfolios and Facebook.

D3. How do employers perceive job applicants in terms of their interview preparation and performance?

Employers appreciate candidates that have thoroughly prepared for the interview, which includes a wider awareness of the area/topic to which the job position relates.

While Finland reports that "Employers say job seekers are well prepared for interviews", Italy adds a nuance in relation to the candidates self-awareness that can be reflected in their performance at interview: "Job applicants that interview for the first time are perceived as not aware enough of their strength points in terms of skills and attributes also because they are not fully sure of what kind of real job they are trying to achieve". Along similar lines of thought, the UK employers feel candidates need to develop their skills in communicating and applying their relevant experience and education during interviews and thoroughly prepare for these by researching the job offer, the organisation, the interviewers and the wider sector. They also feel that candidates in the planning of their career should invest time and effort to get measurable experience in areas their intend to apply for (as page 11).

Regardless of the importance of the interview, we need to be aware that employers start building their perception of the candidate on receipt of the CV and cover letter. So

preparation for interview is important in the setting of overall preparation for a job application.

D4. What is the importance of feedback on job applications?

The request of feedback by a candidate to an organisation following an unsuccessful application is a normal procedure in the UK, although not all candidates make use of that possibility. In the other partner countries this does not seem to be a usual practice.

From the data collected, it can be observed that most candidates do not ask for feedback. If they do, the answer given by the organisation tends to be generic and not focused advice that will help them to improve future applications. For example, Finland reports reasons as: too many good candidates or over qualified, and Italy mentions over-skilled. The Czech Republic also mentions that most often applicants do not receive feedback and if they do it is vague and/or insufficient. A key reason for the vagueness may just be that time taken to do this fully is not seen to be 'core' business for the organisation or that the candidate will contest the reasoning.

Feedback is noted as not expected in Italy and not usually received in Spain, where, however, candidates find this would be very useful for their improvement - a feeling share by Turkish respondents.

D5. Do job seekers approach job-hunting with an entrepreneurial mindset? Are they fully aware of the job market opportunities? Do they plan their action and/or take professional advice?

The Turkish partner replied clearly to the question with a resounding no. The data from other partners appears to tend also for a no or limited use of 'entrepreneurship'. Italy reports job-hunting is not approached in a proactive way. In the UK, candidates with postgraduate education in the area of arts and culture seem to be more aware of the different dimensions of the sector and of the need for an 'entrepreneurial mindset'. However, overall planning and seeking career advice did not feature highly in informants' replies. The Spanish report correlates awareness of job market opportunities with candidates with more qualifications and experience, adding that these candidates are also the ones that take professional advice on how to create a CV and perform in an interview.

Many of those interviewed that were seeking a job appeared not to have a clear idea about their future career, they were open to pursuing positions in a different range of sectors. This is not surprising, as the job markets appear to be demand led, thus opportunities are scarce and competition fierce. It was also noted from the interviews that professional advice on CVs and careers was not a usual course of action for those seeking employment. Perhaps some professional input in this area would help candidates increase their chances of obtaining a position.

This question raises issues with the definition of an 'entrepreneurial mindset', that is open to different interpretations. . In order to clarify further this question it is useful to identify and reflect on what different partners and their interviewees understood as being entrepreneurial:

- CZ "detailed mapping of a labour market", "striving for gaining contacts" that can lead to recommendations and references;
- FI "direct contact with potential employers", being proactive, creative and working hard when looking for a job;
- IT: proactive, plan the process, sending of speculative CVs;
- ES: to be proactive, creative, to have an exciting attitude, to like challenges, to be positive, to be auto-critical and also critical with the others, to be non-conformist, not to give up, to try to improve and advance, to innovate yourself and to innovate the sector where you intend to work;
- UK: researching and networking job opportunities. There is the assumption that entrepreneurial qualities are essential but this is not always articulated. However some posts clearly do not need or desire entrepreneurial qualities.

The list is quite diverse and it would be useful to discuss the need and importance of reaching a consensual working definition of 'entrepreneurial mindset' for the development of the project. This might be best addressed by looking at graduate 'attributes', rather than degree learning outcomes.

D6. Do job seekers only approach a particular sector such as performing arts or will they seek jobs across cultural sectors?

Data varies across countries. In the UK there was no clear trend in the interviews, however students in HE are very clear on their sector intentions. In the Spanish report candidates interviewed were willing to work in any cultural sector. Finnish data indicates that job seekers demonstrate interest in specific areas, often connected with what they have studied. Italy also mentions specific cultural sectors, with more experienced candidates having a clear idea of what they want. Also Turkish data mentions the targeting of particular sectors.

E. ORGANISATIONAL CULTURES

E1. Do organisations provide some form of training for your professional integration/ induction? How did interviewees view its importance/usefulness?

Most of the organisations approached during research seem to provide some sort of integration/induction for new employees. The structure, content and length of the induction depend on size of the organisation (e.g. larger organisations tend to have more structures procedures, smaller organisations to have more informal ways to induct new staff), type of organisation (need to abide to certain regulations) and, at times, on the previous connection of the individual with the organisation (for example past interns need less induction than someone that knows the organisation for the first time).

Induction appears to work in a continuum: ranging from an organic, intuitive process (CZ), provision of written material or a welcome day (FI), which can include tours of facilities and demonstration of procedures and be further extended by short courses (UK). The picture varies across and in the different countries: Spain reports variations between organisations, Turkey says is it a common practice for large organisations, while in the UK all organisations approached had some form of induction. In Italy, professional integration was reported as not structured and often perceived as of low importance: there is a "lack of an organisational

culture focused on HR in Italian cultural organisations", from selection to management of staff.

The process of integration/induction is generally viewed as important by professionals but often it is mentioned that not enough time is dedicated to these activities (e.g. CZ).

E2. Were interviewees aware of equality of opportunity policies, diversity policies or disability policies?

General awareness of these policies seems to be widespread, more so in larger organisations, however there are variations worth exploring. The Czech report although reporting general awareness finds that the extent to which these policies were applied was discussable and finds that this issue was not sufficiently explored during the research process. Also Spain reports awareness of policies but notes that in practice these are not taken into account. In Italy, reported awareness depended on size of organisation - disability, gender and nationality were categories mentioned. Turkey reported awareness for those employed in larger organisations that by law have to apply that sort of regulations. This question seemed unclear for Finnish respondents and this resulted in data indicating low awareness. In the UK all interviewees replied that they were aware of these policies.

E3. Were interviewees familiar with the role of mentor and the process of mentoring? Provide approximate percentage of 'yes' or 'no', and breakdown of people in employment or not, and explain in broad terms how they viewed those areas.

The concepts of mentor and mentoring were perceived and defined diversely across countries and emerged as needing further definition. See G. Partners should consider reflecting on the concepts and their impact on the development of the project.

Table 3 Concepts of Mentor and Mentoring

Concept	Definition
Mentor	tutor, someone experienced that can give advice or professional help, senior/ superior/older/specialist colleague (CZ) Prompt for discussion: *"A mentor should be a person who communicates openly, co-operates, shares his/her experience and is not 'jealous' of other people. I want to be an example for my employees and I will provide feedback to them.*" CZ Cat. 1 Interviewee 1

Mentoring	alliance, supervision, seen as related to induction/integration of new staff, setting an example, demonstrate/show procedures/behaviours, give advice or professional help, clarification of information regarding the functioning of an organisation, share of experience, networking, handover of experience, provide feedback, mutual help (CZ); support someone that is starting a career, advices/ideas on how to start a career; one-to-one relationship (IT); a chance to grow up (SP); guide on how to improve skills and attributes in order to be successful (TR); guiding new employees (as induction) (TR); teaching how to do the job, pass on experience (BE); demonstration of behaviour and advice from current and past colleagues (from the same or similar organisations) (UK) Prompt for discussion: *"to be yourself…and to remain yourself is the best mentoring top line that you should put on that mentoring book or publication"* BE Interviewee 3

Overall the data collected indicated that employed people are more familiar with the concept of mentor and mentoring. Turkey reported an 80% awareness of the term mentoring, mostly employed interviewees. A similar trend is visible in the UK data, where interviewees in employment were aware of mentoring, but most of those seeking employment were not. Finland also reported that mentoring was somewhat familiar to those already working. Spain reports a broad awareness of mentoring in interviewees, but notes that those seeking employment were unable to concretely define the concept. The Italian partners reported 55% of interviewees were familiar with the role and process: 80% of employed were familiar with the idea, while this only happened with 50% of the unemployed. However IT reports that the role of mentor is not connected to learning methodologies process to be used nowadays. Some procedures to induct interns are comparable to mentoring.

E4. Did employers provide formal or informal mentoring in the work place? Brief description of procedure and identified benefits.

The partners described a range of situations regarding mentoring in the work place.

In the UK, mentoring is normally present in the work place, even if not always in a formal way. Informal mentoring tends to be the norm, this included: internal mentoring (colleagues mentoring each other, particularly in small organisations), external mentoring (formal outsourcing of mentors – specifically for senior positions), through professional networks (often in the same city, e.g. heads of development network in London theatres) or friendship circles (but with a professional connection). The initiative of establishing mentoring relationships was generally placed in the individual - the employer organisation would support that process by advising mentors (or could also suggest that process in performance management/review). The identified personal benefits of mentoring are support, guidance and training. Mentoring is also beneficial to organisations because it creates links between organisations (if you have outside mentors or are part of a professional network that also performs that role) allowing them to work together and fostering a more holistic approach to the sector of the arts and culture.

Finland reported one person involved in formal mentoring and also mentions informal mentoring as the main procedure of professional integration ("I was always able to ask my colleagues"). Benefits of mentoring mentioned in the report include: "it was very useful and

helped me to acculturate into different work and duties"; "help people mediate tacit knowledge".

Spain reported only one case. This variety of situation should prompt partners to reflect on the need and importance to define the concept of mentor and mentoring for the development of the project.

E5. Report on significant organisational differences in recruitment process between organisations (e.g. large vs. small organisations in terms of department in charge of recruitment and use of interviews).

Overall, it can be said that large organisations tend to have human resources (HR) departments or law departments that assist individual departments with recruitment, while in smaller organisations members in senior management take the lead in those processes. Interviews appear to be a widespread tool in the recruitment process. See section A for overall trends in the recruitment process.

As an extreme example of variation, please note the reflection of the Italian partner: In Italy, with the exception of governmental bodies, organisations in the cultural sector reflect the management style of the director, which independently of the size of the organisation, and the existence or not of an HR department, will ultimately have the final word in what recruitment is concerned. The report raises concerns over equality of opportunities and the role of personal connections in the process.

G. RESEARCH PROCESS

G1. Reflections on the interview process: what have we learned that we consider an important lesson to pass on to other researchers focusing on the same areas?

Interviews were conducted through a range of means: face-to-face, skype, telephone, email. The UK found that face-to-face appeared to yield an increase in the amount of information gathered, but noted that seemed to be more dictated by the interviewees predisposition to share information.

FI reflected on the bias of samples and suggested the use in the future of a snow-ball method to identify further respondents.

CZ considered that the research objectives deserve a larger number of respondents and a bigger scope of analysis and time.

Language was another important issue. Researchers had agreed to define for interviewees, according to a previous circulated document, the concepts of 'skills' and 'attributes'. During the course of research other concepts also proved to need a common definition for the purpose of the project: 'mentoring', 'cultural manager', 'formative experience', 'entrepreneurial mindset'. Further to language, IT report mentions the lack of a common vocabulary to talk about roles, skills/attributes across artistic contexts. The European dimension makes this more complex and potentially enriches this situation.

Cultural implications also arose from the process of interviewing. FI reports: "Finns are shy and they don't want to praise their skills. At some point I noticed that there might be something true in it since not all were so eager to say what made them the best candidate for the job".

IT reports that the use of some Anglo-Saxon approaches to inform questions in the survey (and project principles) (e.g. stress of behavioural approach in recruitment processes) arouse positive reflection in candidates in Italy. Partners should seek to reflect and clarify other potential bias in the construction and development of the project.

Cultural implications coming from the exchanges were also encouraging. IT reports that some of the interviewees, for instance, found the competency model used in the research and the stress on the level of attributes as positive inputs for a reflection on even obvious aspects of the Italian recruitment process.

While assembling this report, which relies on the national reports, we noted that, at times, there were doubts about terms used. Having access to interview transcripts in English was not sufficient, ideally we would have liked to have access to the transcripts in the original language. This would enable the researchers to clarify doubts in the original and overcome doubts caused by translation. Translation is no doubt of extreme use in international projects, however it imposes another layer of meaning in the original material. It would be useful to operate as much as possible in a multilingual environment and not in one dominated by a particular language, in this case English. Obviously this is a complex issue connected with the diverse linguistic skills of participants in international projects.

H. OTHER

H1. Other relevant points that have arisen from the research conducted.

The data collected from the 104 conducted interviews was useful and adequate for the CREAM project as an indication of some of the current concerns regarding the employment of cultural managers and of their attributes, skills and knowledge across the different countries. It provides a broad brush description of cultural managers' employment in the cultural sector in Europe insofar as the situation across and within the different countries and cultural sectors is so diverse.

Supplementary data obtained from other studies and publications will enable the partners to further polish their mapping of the "new skills needed to redefine the cultural manager as a new job based on entrepreneurial competences", which is the basis of the next stage of the project, New Culture Curricula Framework. Examples of literature, some already available on the workspace PBworks (Research/literature) are:

- The People Theme: Thriving in the 21st Century: Competencies, qualities and attributes for the arts & cultural sector in times of complexity, change and uncertainty, a 2010 report by Mission Models Money;
- Empowerment through Mentoring to Promote the Importance of Real Work Experience (EMPIRE) project, a 2008 Leonardo project (with many materials available, description of project available at http://www.adam-europe.eu/prj/3734/project_3734_en.pdf);

- Validation and Certification of Training in the field of European Cultural Co-operation Project Management (VANIA) final report 2005-2007.

The research process also raised questions that might be important in the development of the project, one these is the need of a definition of what a cultural manager is. IT found this abstraction positive, insofar as it "push[ed] interlocutors into efforts of abstraction to evaluate their sector from a different point of view". Other similar definitional needs have been mentioned in section G.

The Czech Republic report suggests reflection on ways to develop the cultural sector in the national context, away form dependency on public money.

The UK report notes the topic of transferability of skills – some professionals felt that transferring sector was difficult given the short term nature of funding in some sectors: organisations had no time to grow people, thus used people already working in similar job/ organisations in the sector. But there was evidence of transfer in the interviews (UK orchestra to heritage, business personal assistant to music management and Finland advertising agency to concert hall).

In the report of the Italian partner a classic topic arises about the debate of 'cultural manager', artist versus manager binary: "The artistic component of the job sometimes "overcomes" the concrete tasks people would become in charge of, this is perceived as a problem by employers that value more the organizational and managerial skills and attitude and fear applicants might be "missed artists"". Also Spain mentions that "people with education in culture (i.e. arts)" might be more at risk of demotivation if occupying administrative posts. On the other hand, in Finland, educational paths appear to adequately direct people to their desired professions, and no such tensions were observed.

Lastly we would like to invite all partners to reflect on an insightful comment of the Turkish report regarding the fact that every country has its unique way of perceiving and representing culture, and hence managing it - the difficulty of finding common points and how contrasts should be used as a comparative advantage for each country. So, how will this diversity impact on the development of the CREAM project?

Mentoring: Important points to take to the next stage

To conclude it is important to highlight and summarise the report's references regarding mentoring:
- the identified 'more formative experiences' have a series of features related to mentoring;
- mentoring is often based on personal relationships of trust which will positively impact on personal and organisational development;
- mentoring can be used to support job-seekers: it can foster reflection on professional career, self-evaluation on the appropriate balance of competences (including a re-design of the CV), the bridging of identified skills gaps, improvement of interview performance, increase motivation;
- mentoring can be used in the integration of professionals in organisations that due to lack of structure or time are not able to provide formal induction;
- mentoring in the CREAM project is a 'box full of differences' – from which we can all collaboratively learn.

The mapping stage has been extremely helpful in raising awareness of the context of the CREA.M project. It made us understand that in many countries there is a need for better data collection and aggregation and that there are benefits from harmonisation of indicators and methodologies at EU level.