



Efficiency Measurement of Lifelong Learning, using of Balanced Scorecard Concept

Final Report

Public Part

Project information

Project acronym: EMOLL
Project title: Efficiency Measurement of Lifelong Learning,
using of Balanced Scorecard Concept
Project number: 510007-LLP-1-2010-1-CZ-LEONARDO-LMP
Sub-programme or KA: Leonardo da Vinci
Project website: www.emoll.eu

Reporting period: From 01/10/2010
To 30/09/2012
Report version: 1
Date of preparation: 19/11/2012

Beneficiary organization: EuroProfis, s.r.o

Project coordinator: Gabriela Ledererová
Project coordinator organization: EuroProfis, s.r.o
Project coordinator telephone number: + 420 774 711 046
Project coordinator email address: gabriela.ledererova@europrofis.cz

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission.

This publication [communication] reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

Executive Summary

In a knowledge-based society, a special attention must be paid to the management of skills necessary for companies to be competitive. The money invested in this area is often wasted due to a lack of tools to measure the efficiency of trainings with regard to the interconnection between the organization's performance, strategy and training of individual employees.

The EMOLL project responds to the lack of clear methodology for educational efficiency measurement. It is designed for organizations and companies standing out of both formal and informal life-long educational systems. Its aim is to deliver a global and a general approach with a set of indicators as well as a framework adaptable to the needs of each company or organization on the basis of its objectives, contexts, and strategies.

We focused on organizations from different settings such as public, commercial, and educational and our targets in these organizations were/are members of top-management, HR managers, specialist in in-service training, members of middle (line) management and other staff. Another important target group was identified in educational, consultation and similar organizations that provide expert services to organizations and their staff such as trainers, lecturers, consultants, facilitators, etc.

The partner consortium was formed by 7 organizations from 6 European countries. There was a balanced representation of 3 elementary types of partners: higher education and research area, adult education and consultancy providers, and representatives of beneficiary organizations. Cooperation on this background enabled us to develop products matching the needs and experiences in education and HR development. It also allows the application of standardized research and development methodology and its implementation in target organizations.

EMOLL project consisted of two main phases: 1. development and 2. pilot implementation and exploitation. We developed and verified new EMOLL methodology and supporting tools for effective measurement of lifelong learning benefits. It is enhanced by Balanced Scorecard, a well-known tool in strategy performance management used by efficient and competitive companies.

To make it possible, we provided training and simulation environment and implemented the EMOLL methodology in 12 pilot organizations by adapting the EMOLL concept to individual needs, culture and strategy of each organization. Apart from these main activities, other important steps were undertaken throughout the project such as quality assurance, networking and dissemination.

The EMOLL methodology proved to be implementable and apt to provide a systematic approach to evaluation and measurement of education efficiency and efficacy in all types of organizations involved in the implementation phase. Best practices from 6 partner countries provide recommendations and alternatives for future development.

In the future we expect to promote EMOLL best practices through the established knowledge network and to share gained experience in HR development and management issues with other potential users and multipliers of EMOLL outcomes.

More detailed information and outcomes are available on our website: www.emoll.eu.

Table of Contents

1. PROJECT OBJECTIVES.....	5
2. PROJECT APPROACH.....	6
3. PROJECT OUTCOMES & RESULTS.....	10
4. PARTNERSHIPS	16
5. PLANS FOR THE FUTURE	17
6. CONTRIBUTION TO EU POLICIES	19

1. Project Objectives

EMOLL project responds to the absence of clear methodology for measuring the efficiency of education and HR development in organizations. The development of such methodology and its implementation and verification in the target organizations was our main goal.

We focused on organizations from different environments: public, commercial, educational or non-for-profit. Our targets in these organizations were/are members of top-management, HR managers, specialist in in-service training, members of middle (line) management and other staff. Another important target group was formed by educational, consultation, and similar organizations that provide expert services to organizations mentioned above and their staff such as trainers, lecturers, consultants, facilitators, etc. (see also section 2)

The main objectives of EMOLL project were defined as follows:

- To develop an innovative methodology for efficiency measurement of HR development and education in organizations.
- To develop a computer-based simulation model that would provide an overall idea of the cost-effectiveness of trainings, modelling of cost-benefit ratio concerning HR development and education in the organization.
- To familiarize consultants – EMOLL experts – with the methodology, supporting tools and implementation process to ensure smooth implementation of the method in pilot organizations.
- To implement the methodology in beneficiary organizations (12 in 6 countries), verify the methodology and the process of implementation, and to exploit the results to the beneficiaries, identifying key performance indicators in each organization.
- To collect best practices from pilot trials, providing examples and recommendations for further exploitation of EMOLL.
- To disseminate and promote the results among target groups.

We found out that many company owners or organization managers see strategic management simply as a tracking of a few key indicators. They are cautious about adopting new methods, worrying their complexity, and fearful of losing too much time over them. HR departments are generally understaffed and barely able to keep up with routine personnel administration, with hardly any time for developmental activities.

The EMOLL method, which is orientated in its basic principles towards the area of educational processes, can be very well implemented in organizations of both the commercial and non-commercial, public sector. Organizations of the commercial sector especially reflect the development of employees very often as a cost item and not an investment in their budgets. The EMOLL method leads the organization to awareness of the wider contexts and also, if properly implemented, of the wide-ranging usefulness of its outcomes.

The interest in the methodology supports our view that with the assistance of EMOLL experts, organizations are motivated to undertake the long-term pursuit of HR metrics. Their fundamental underlying motive is to gather specific quantifiable data about the contribution of HRD and the benefits it brings to the organization, which supports their argumentation in managerial discussions about priorities in future investments.

2. Project Approach

The project approach is in principle deduced from the objectives (section 1) and summarized outcomes (section 3). Generally we respect the principle of constructivism by creating an innovative methodology for the target users (companies, non-profit organizations, public administration, resp. their top management). In other terms we attempted to find the approaches, methods and tools already in use in organizations and linked them up with new methods.

Therefore, in the beginning of the project, we effectuated an entry analysis (based on a comparative and benchmarking approach) of methods of evaluation and measurement of educational processes already in place, which helped us in assessing the current situation in detail. The identified methods were compared with the Balanced Scorecard (BSC) that we decided to adopt as a background concept, since it is known in potential target group as a method for strategic planning and management used to align the business activities with the vision and strategy of the organization, as well as to monitor organization performance against strategic goals. In addition it also works with metrics – key performance indicators from the various fields of organization's life.

We combine the BSC structure of four perspectives (Learning to growth, Internal processes, Financial perspective, Customer perspective) with widely known methods and tools for training evaluation and efficiency measurement (mainly Kirpatrick's evaluation model and Return of Investment model of J. Phillips). One of the instruments set up during the implementation phase and customized to each target organization was the strategy map that showed the key strategy topics in connection with the organization's vision. Our approach was to cascade the BSC method and perspectives to the HR field and set the strategy topics as well as its definition in particular KPIs concerning HR development, HR processes, its impact on clients and also financial efficiency.

As a consultancy product and cognitive-based, the implementation of EMOLL method in beneficiary organizations (target users) is based on close cooperation of EMOLL experts with the organization's management.

The contextual view, which is facilitated by EMOLL method with the use of measurable indicators, and subsequently financially assessable criteria, offers a new, effective and comprehensive approach to the effectiveness of development of human resources. The result consists not only of a demonstrable rate of financial return, but also of options for making internal processes more effective, and consequently the anticipation of a satisfied customer and the associated predictions directed towards higher prosperity and competitiveness of the organization.

The **innovativeness of the EMOLL method** is based on measurement of both the effects of specific training events, and of the whole cycle of the educational process with respect to strategic goals within the complex of factors of multiple perspectives regarding the development of employees in a given organization. Apart from financial indicators, the method also facilitates the consideration of the client's approach, of internal processes and their administration and of the indicators of training within the complex of activities of the whole educational process (from analysis of training needs, through implementation of training schemes, to evaluation of the results of trainees and the benefits of training for both trainees and the organization).

During the pilot trial, measurement of the educational processes (especially in manufacturing sector organizations) was imbedded into the wider context of the basic strategic objectives and the area of management and development of human resources of given organizations.

Looking at HR from 4 perspectives has allowed the participating TOP managers to select metrics, which measure both quality and quantity. While this is a demanding task, it does bring very interesting results in the long term, with significant added value. People cease to be viewed as mere cost items, and are seen as a form of investment in the company's growth and development. We are able to quantify this investment and the EMOLL methodology allows us to measure its benefits and impact.

This method does require a new task set: to measure the results of education not just for language courses, but also for other selected types. The choice of metrics was made in a group setting, where TOP managers met line managers and Quality controllers met with HR staff. It was the first occasion that a team of this nature had formed around the agenda of people development. Through their interaction, managers broadened their understanding of people development topics. By means of this platform the participants exchanged their observations, practical experiences and know-how. They gained not only a new perspective on the activities associated with people development, but also improved their own competencies in this area. For many of them, the process of defining metrics was the first opportunity they had to become fully aware of their co/responsibility for their teams' development.

From the perspective of good practice and for sustainability of the EMOLL method we provide following recommendations for various countries:

- **Recommendations for application of the EMOLL method in individual countries:**
 - Acquisition of the method in potential organizations (the optimum candidates for implementation of the EMOLL method are organizations with an institutionalised and formalised vision and strategy, with an interlinked strategy in the area of HRM and HRD; applying the strategy of management, including strategic management of HR and having competent key personnel in the area of management and leadership).
 - Prior to implementation (introduction of the method) - to verify the degree of fulfilment of the optimum prerequisites stated in the paragraph "Acquisition of the method" (by initial analysis, definition of starting points etc.); the level of the deficits constitutes a relevant indicator for the implementation conception scenario and design of the EMOLL method in a given organization.
 - During introduction of the method - to implement, monitor, routinely evaluate and extrapolate measures for improvement; to conduct inductions in parallel with the degree of necessary involvement and competences of individual actors in various processes of EMOLL development; to regularly emphasise the purpose of the method, the objective of which is the continual improvement of the factors contributing to the results of development of the employees in the organization.
 - Following termination of direct support by external experts in the period of introduction of the EMOLL method in the relevant organization - application of

tools and accompanying measures on the basis of a mutual agreement between the “supplier” of the method and the organization implementing the EMOLL method.

- **Universal recommendations** (linking international project activities in the area of measuring the benefits of training and development of human resources)
 - Prior to the acquisition of supranational projects and to the creation of supranational teams (to verify the level of existing practical experiences and the real temporal capacities of experts in the specific thematic area of individual partners).
 - In the planning of joint projects - to reflect the real needs for various forms and tools of communication (the development of the method demonstrated the necessity for numerous personal meetings / increased by at least 1 international meeting in the preliminary months of implementation at the stage of design and development of the methodology, and/or one more meeting at the end of implementation of the project for personal exchange of experiences).
 - In the introductory stages and/or implementation, to determine and fine-tune the platform of perception of the theme (topic) and approaches to it in individual national cultures, including clarification and specification of the linguistic connotations (semantic and syntactical differences) in the given area of expertise.

As highlighted in the section 3.9, we have been careful in adopting a **systematic approach to dissemination of our results**, preferring to make contact with organizations and firms rather than individual experts without any organizational attachment, and furthermore by segmenting target platforms/networks.

The **main type of organizations for contact** covered product-oriented and service-oriented organizations with different types of management and from different environments such as public, not-for-profit and commercial sector. The ratio of the target group settings was based on:

- strategy management perspective of each EMOLL partner (by exploiting own contacts as well as networks and partnerships),
- interests, needs and available resources (personnel, financial, material and technical, informational) of the potential target organization.
- open-mindedness of the company’s management regarding HR area and strategic visions.

From the **short-term** perspective our **target group** was formed by pilot organizations involved in the implementation of EMOLL method and by EMOLL experts in each partner organization that participated from the beginning in all project activities. The strategy for reaching those targets coincided with the strategy adopted for the **long-term target group** that was of the same character, but contacted organizations were not directly involved in the implementation process.

Our team made significant effort to reach as broad spectrum of organizations / individuals as possible to disseminate the EMOLL best practice and outcomes (cf. section 3) related with development and education (lifelong learning as such).

We established a knowledge network on international and national level, enlisting experts from both the supply and demand sides of further education. It is based on formal and non-formal networking of each project partner and it was continually built up in parallel to the EMOLL project life. The national networks have similar structures and reflect the specificity of business area of every partner and the situation in their countries/organizations. The networking platforms on national level are profession, institution, project and business based and are described in more depth in EMOLL knowledge network concept available in our website.

To reflect on our project achievements we prepared **EMOLL quality assurance instrument and evaluation plan** considering **evaluation strategy and tools**. All outcomes, as well as its impact and added value were assessed on the basis of defined quality standards and were subjected to external evaluation.

The following tools proved to be valid:

- peer reviews of all project outputs provided by each partner;
- continuous consultations and discussions within the team;
- evaluation questionnaires designed according to the internal quality assurance instrument and specified quality indicators;
- evaluation / feedback exercise focused on “What does work or could be done better?/What works or was done well?”;
- quality sub-group formed by team members and assigned to review the key final outcomes.

The lessons learned during the project were shared within the team and relevant findings were adopted to improve the quality of final outcomes and the partnership as such.

3. Project Outcomes & Results

The major EMOLL achievements coincide with the milestones of our project outlined in section 1 of this Final Report.

3.1. Analysis of existing approaches and tools for efficiency measurement and evaluation of education in organizations

The fundamental source for evaluation of the current status of procedures and methods of evaluating educational processes in European organizations consisted of initial analyses, in the context of which individual partners of the project collected data on the methods of evaluation of training in their home countries.

The **entry surveys** presented by each partner country were primarily desk research based, and in selected cases elaborated as in-depth analysis. In order to compare the gathered data a standardized **evaluation form of “Trainings’ efficiency measurement method”** was created.

In compiling and summarising the methods, the **analysis report** focussed on the relevant and best quality methods from the perspective of the BSC. Its conclusions created the basis for the creation of the innovative EMOLL method (see the following point b).

3.2. Development of innovative EMOLL methodology

The **EMOLL evaluation methodology** was aimed at filling a void by proposing both a global and general approach with a set of indicators, as well as a framework that could be adapted to the particular environment of each company or organization. It contains the evaluation of existing practices, the principles of the Balanced Scorecard method and considers the new EMOLL method.

The method is based on the Balanced Scorecard (BSC), which is a strategic performance management tool aimed at formalising and communicating the company’s strategy and measuring its financial and non-financial results.

The EMOLL method, in the process of implementation in the pilot trial, and the experiences of partners reflected by their feedback on implementation in 12 organizations (see reports D7 and D8 of this project), proved that the concept of the EMOLL method:

- delivered the intention stated in the introduction to section 3 of this methodology - i.e. that the methodology constitutes a tool for advancement and development in the area of human resources (their management and development), simultaneously connected with an expanded perception of this area from other (not only financial) points of view;
- confirmed the requirement for adaptation of the EMOLL method tools (strategic map, benchmarks including specification of their criteria and their usefulness in measurement) to the organizational and managerial contexts of each individual organization (declared in the introduction and also in the conclusion to clause 2.3.4 of this methodology);
- proved the necessity of parallel input of EMOLL method experts - indoctrination in the areas of:
 - comprehensive perception of training processes in the context of the other

systems and processes of management and development of human resources in the organization, which cannot be neglected in the implementation of the visions and strategies of each organization,

- the purposes of the method, the objective of which is the sustainability or continuous improvement of the factors sharing in the effects of educational processes, the success of which is determined by a complex of other systems and processes in the organization.

The knowledge of the EMOLL method improves the skills of **involved persons** in the area of HR development and also their orientation in respective terminology. It facilitates better and more efficient communication in the field of working with people (unanimous understanding of concepts in HR development). The added value of the method consists of immediate benefits for its actors included in:

- the pilot trial (HR department workers, managers, specialists, tutors and other interested persons in the individual subjects of the pilot trial of the method) – better orientation and, for some persons, development also of competences in the area of educational processes together with the expression of interest in further personal development in this area;
- the implementation of the project (project teams of partners in individual countries) – recognition of certain specifics and procedures in the area of educational processes in individual countries, their cultures and selected organizations sharing in the pilot trial of the EMOLL method.
- the method of interaction of EMOLL experts (see also 3.5) – use of the acquired knowledge/experience in pilot organization and also in their own practice as multipliers – within a suitable framework. Especially when training in different parts of the country is needed.

3.3. Packet of key performance indicators

To create a set of measurable indicators for each pilot organization that participated in the project was the task closely related to the development of the EMOLL method as indicated above.

First an inspiring set of 38 indicators was created on basis of each partner proposals. It was used by EMOLL experts as a supporting packet while setting indicators in each pilot organization (see 3.6). In total **105 indicators** were identified during the implementation in target organizations. Now there are available **12 sets of customized KPIs**, one per target organization, defined on the basis of its strategic objectives, needs, management system they have implemented and the sector they're involved in.

Pilot organizations plan to evaluate on regular basis using the implemented measure cards (indicators) and expect to improve their processes. In pilot companies they plan to monitor and evaluate defined indicators (measure cards) on the regular basis. In one pilot company (FR) an automated process for evaluation of training was developed and is based on quantitative indicators. For long-term impact on potential users of EMOLL outcomes see sections 3.9 and 5.

3.4. Computer-based simulation model

To support the training of EMOLL experts (see 3.5) and to assure appropriate comprehension and smoother implementation of 3.2 and 3.3 a **flight simulator** was developed as a **learning managerial support tool** (for 3.5 and 3.6). It enabled

smoother introduction of BSC/EMOLL to involved employees of pilot organizations and helped EMOLL experts during the process. The simulation model provides key performance indicators, strategy map and relations between measures; its functionality is described in the simulator's **user guide**.

The example of imaginary industry company is used and the "players" can design strategy decisions (e.g. internal and HR processes, aims for products and to clients etc.) and manage the "life" of this company. They can also observe the quantified results regarding for example financial and customer satisfaction.

3.5. EMOLL experts (consultants) trained in methodology and simulation

In order to familiarize EMOLL consultants with the methodology, supporting tools and implementation process, a training was designed and organized. In total **12 experts** (2 per partner organization) took part and brought the acquired knowledge and tools to practice (see also 3.2, 3.3 and 3.6). The basic approach was to have 2 different consultants working together in the target organization, the first as an expert in HR processes and the second as an expert in definition of indicators and observation. Together they were able to provide and coach the complete implementation process and to impact the organization in a more complex and efficient way.

3.6. Implementation and exploitation of the EMOLL method in target (beneficiary) organizations

The aim of the implementation process was to demonstrate that the EMOLL approach is applicable and that the best practices (see the following sections 3.7 and 3.8), which originated from the implementation and adaptation process, are useful examples and recommendations for next exploitation beyond the project's life.

In total **12 pilot/target organizations (2 per country, 6 countries)** were recruited by the EMOLL team and took part in the implementation and exploitation of the EMOLL method. Among the organizations there are product oriented (4) and service oriented (8) subjects with different type of management and from different sectors (public, commercial), some of them are large enterprises, some SMEs, one is higher education institution. All these organizations have in common that their management is predominantly open-minded regarding the HR area, have got some strategic visions and also had sufficient interest, need and resources to undertake the process.

To ease the process of implementing the products into beneficiary organizations **guidelines** were provided. They describe the process step by step and propose **implementation scenarios**.

For each organization a **customized strategy map** was designed as well as a set of **KPIs** that are considered in detail on respective **measure cards** each (see also 3.3).

It was proved that the implementation process and adoption of proposed measures had benefited the involved organization with new knowledge, experience and approach. They expect to improve their processes and exploit the benefits within other future activities (for more see 3.7).

By working on developing their metrics, the staff acquired new competencies and gradually the perception of their roles from the viewpoint of TOP management is also changing. TOP and middle managers have become more aware of their shared responsibility for developing the staff on their teams; they devote more time and effort to it and acquire new skills. Their contribution to scoring against agreed metrics leads them to appreciate the quantifiable contribution made by HR. This aspect is

especially important for TOP managers, and uplifts their motivation. They no longer see HR as a “costly” item, the first in line for cutbacks. They see instead and investment into the achievability of their own visions and strategies.

3.7. Validation of EMOLL products (method, indicators, simulator)

The validation process was undertaken not only to verify the EMOLL outcomes and the way of its implementation, but also to identify eventual gaps and to confirm that the main stakeholders of the project accept the validity of the outputs developed within the project, while suggesting – in case of need – any necessary modifications or improvements to make the products more transparent and/or more easy to use in practice.

To collect the necessary data **questionnaires** were designed that assessed each object of validation, **EMOLL methodology concept and document, KPI set and simulator**. To verify the outcomes a focus group method was applied and performed in each pilot organization on national level.

The results provided an important contribution to be taken into account by the project while updating the final version of critical outcomes such as EMOLL methodology and packet of KPIs. The simulator has been conceived as a support software and wasn't expected to be modified during the project's life. **Validation report** describes with more detail the results and is available on project website.

3.8. Best practices from implementation

The aim was also to gather best practices from implementation projects, and to show that:

- the EMOLL approach is implementable, and
- the best practices, which originated from the implementation and adaptation process, are useful examples and recommendations for next exploitation beyond the project's life, i.e. other potential users.

The best practices were collected from all project partners at the end of the validation phase as examples and recommendations on how to implement/exploit the methodology.

A large part of the analytical work, to identify best practices, was done within the validation phase itself (see 3.7 above). The designed **best practices identity cards** were a way of providing uniformity to the set of data collected. In order to guide the reader through different possibilities of implementation EMOLL **an interactive mind map** has been provided so that, for future use, the research of the best practice “fit for purpose” is easier. The map is available on <http://webbrain.com/brainpage/brain/94366CAB-2273-2DAC-DC55-3F9E91F08658#-5>. More details on EMOLL best practices are considered in **Best practices report** that is available on project website.

3.9. Dissemination and knowledge networking

To share the results and experience gained in EMOLL project with identified target groups we designed dissemination strategy and built up a professional knowledge network on national and international level.

As regards the structure and character of **target users** they are more or less identical from the short and long term view, only the work with long-term targets falls also beyond the project's life span.

From the short-term view we focused on our EMOLL expert team, pilot organizations and their staff, involved in the implementation process. From the long-term view we target at organizations, companies and their staff, i.e. the same group of objects. As regards the impact on these groups we consider more aspects in sections 3.2, 3.5 and 3.6 above.

We made significant effort to reach as broad spectrum of organizations/individuals as possible to disseminate the EMOLL best practices and outcomes related with the development and education (lifelong learning as such).

In doing so we have been careful to adopt a **systematic approach** to networking: preferring to make contact with organizations and companies rather than individual experts without any organizational background, and furthermore segmenting by target platforms/network segments.

The main **material outcomes** of the dissemination and networking activities are creation of:

- EMOLL dissemination strategy
- EMOLL knowledge network concept (national and international level)
- EMOLL conference on “Good Practices, Issues and Innovations in Quality and Efficiency Management of Vocational Training”
- Project website www.emoll.eu (information about the project, partners, objectives, outcomes, activities)
- EMOLL Facebook account <http://www.facebook.com/pages/Efficiency-Measurement-of-Lifelong-Learning/199856160145103>
- EMOLL discussion group on LinkedIn http://www.linkedin.com/groups/EMOLL-group-4468741?trk=myg_ugrp_ovr
- Articles on EMOLL approach and experience
- Workshops, seminars, round tables, panels
- Newsletters
- Brochure, pads, calendars, pens

Another important related outcome is **á concept of further networking** that we describe in the section 5 of this Report.

Our **dissemination strategy, tools, channels and concept of networking** are considered in more depth in the section 2 that refers to project approach and also in respective documents accessible on our website.

3.10. Quality assurance

Considering the quality assurance the activities were focused on both, the outcome quality and the project processes quality. The **standards (indicators) of quality** were identified and their performance was followed throughout the project and according to the **evaluation plan**. The results of the **progress and final assessment** of the EMOLL project were provided through respective **evaluation reports** and they refer to all project activities.

An important feedback to partner consortium was provided by **external evaluation** that was considered fruitful and the majority of presented suggestions were adopted in final outcomes. Partner consortium prepared a written **feedback to external evaluation** also.

Regarding EMOLL outcomes such as analysis, methodology, simulator, training, validation, best practices, dissemination and networking, they are all available for public use and accessible on EMOLL project website: www.emoll.eu/results.

Some results (such as e.g. customized KPIs set and simulator´s user guide) are linked with the complete implementation process, and therefore are available for each potential beneficiary organization. Please contact us in case of your interest (contacts to co-ordinator as well as each partner are available also on the project website). All outcomes related to project quality assurance are confidential.

4. Partnerships

Considering the aims of the project that were to analyse, develop and implement the innovative methodology in the field of strategy and HR management, the involvement of different types of know-how and expertise was necessary. We responded to this challenge by creating a partnership based on 3 types of organizations with different background:

- A. Higher education area (HEA) / research field organizations – to achieve adequate standards of research and development work;
- B. Consultancy, adult education providers – to provide experience and knowledge about the sector of target beneficiaries in order to improve project outcomes, communication and implementation processes regarding the target sector.
- C. Product-oriented (industrial) organization – as a representative of the target beneficiaries to provide input needs, possible obstacles, challenge as well as to give continuous feedback to the development and implementation processes and products.

According to this structure the partnership was based on 7 organizations from 6 European countries. The partners that represent described types of organizations are:

- A. Blaise Pascal Université (France) and Scierter (Italy)
- B. EuroProfis (Czech Republic), CTC Polska (Poland), G. Popov consulting (Bulgaria) and OPAL (Turkey)
- C. TRW (Czech Republic)

The European added value of the multi-country partnership is the purpose and the need of such methodology across the Europe. This lack is evident in various environments and was confirmed by our entry analysis. On the other hand the participation of more countries brought more mind approaches and content-background, and contributed to the improvement of the EMOLL final products to be more universal, applicable and shareable.

Considerable asset of working within the multicultural team was, generally speaking, the acquiring of new knowledge and different approaches, sharing know-how to relevant contents and professional development of team members as such. Getting to know partners from other European countries, their skills in the subject field, as well as expert and project potential was an opportunity think of collaboration within future activities and projects. (for more on partnership benefits see also section 5 of this Final Report).

It is very challenging (also because the communication is mostly virtual) for the cooperation since the partners come from different countries, have different experience and cultural feedback. Understanding of concepts/terms, not only within the social sciences, was not always identical, so sometimes we had to cope –regarding our issue – with different understanding or its different application.

We must add of course, all the positive aspects linked with interculturality, and with the differences between the partners because of their historical and social background. Somebody sometimes looks not active or efficient, but when we know him/she, we discover that he/she is kind and open-minded person and can be a high quality resource for other reasons. We believe that pan European projects always teach us humility, tolerance, open-mindedness, and understanding.

As to the benefits of our partnerships established outside our partner consortium, they are considered in sections 3 and 5. Some recommendations related to partnership are provided in section 2.

5. Plans for the Future

The project activities impact was assessed to find best practices and innovations within the given period, to provide options for the future development of the project and to identify areas where improvement may be necessary to enhance the incidence. In this context, according to the partnership, **the EMOLL methodology** based on BSC as an innovative and interesting methodology, training of experts in the course of the project and remarkable interest of pilot organizations **ensures the impact providing innovations and new approaches**.

Sustainability of the products introduced so far was emphasized by the partners and target users as an opportunity for further development. In order to enhance the impact and to reach a wider community including stakeholders and other potential contributors, partners addressed to advance communication and knowledge network. Proactive dissemination activities on national levels scheduled after the project's lifespan are viewed as a supportive and visible step in this sense (see above).

Generally speaking the impact of project activities on future plans of each partner (based on EMOLL experience) is considered by the whole partnership as very positive and fruitful. EMOLL project has broadened partners' perspective regarding expert issues, project management and cooperation within an international team. The partners also got the opportunity to get new ideas for future activities and projects and plan to share their experience with other organizations, companies and individuals.

From internal point of view some partners see the EMOLL concept as an important issue to be reflected also within internal activities of HR area of their organization and intent to enlarge the established network to provide new trainings and seminars using the EMOLL concept in practice. TRW (partner 7) and several pilot companies plan to evaluate BSC (measure cards) on the regular basis and expect to improve their processes. In case of partner 7 the EMOLL methodology will be used during the external audit ISO TS 16949.

From external point of view the EMOLL methodology is perceived as a "good issue" and of easy application:

- in "theoretical" activities as for example training courses focused on HR development,
- in practice within consultancy services focused on HRD and HRM and
- while designing new projects for/with other organizations (focused in lifelong learning development).

On the basis of interest expressed by Czech pilot organizations as to the sharing of knowledge and best practices acquired within the EMOLL project a **concept of further networking** was outlined by the project coordinator.

As regards sustainability it considers founding of a regular discussion platform on HR development and management issues; based on EMOLL experience (regular meetings of HR managers, specialist, top managers, trainers, consultants, associations' representatives, etc.). Such platform would give space to

- regular meetings and discussions on HRD and HRM issues; all related with the quality assurance and measurement within the development of HR and strategic management, as well as to

- new projects and collaboration on national and international level.

Reliable and valid basis for this concept was already established with pilot organizations or organizations / experts within EMOLL knowledge networks during the EMOLL implementation and exploitation/dissemination. The emerged links/relations are based on needs of those subjects to share knowledge and experience regarding EMOLL and related HR management and development areas or other systems (such as adaptation process of employees, talent management, knowledge management, including the context of HR strategy and strategic management of HR).

6. Contribution to EU policies

The project is about delivering the systematic approach in quality and efficiency of education in the organizations. By having complete overview and control of education activities in connection with visions, strategic goals as well as the financial investments (return of investments) organizations (potential project target group) are able to manage the HR development and education inside, control the investments to staff and plan as well as evaluate its performance.

It is the EMOLL project's contribution to European policy in life-long learning as well as improvement of competitiveness of European companies (Lisabon, Education and training 2020) by providing the instrument for support the education performance to the organizations.

The project closely refers to the topic of quality in education, what is a hot European education policy topic (Copenhagen declaration, Bruges communiqué).

Since some of EMOLL partners are organizations with a great deal of experience in implementing learning programmes for clients in the private or public sector and/or related to EU projects. Our experience shows that there are very few functional HRD systems out in the real world, and that related activities are restricted to just running some courses.

Both national and European companies invest considerable resources into training people. With regard to the increasing competitive pressures in the field of business, the issue of the effects of financial resources expended on development of employees within organizations is very often discussed at the same time. The main issues debated in this area are the insufficiently demonstrated and provable benefits of training for the main actors - the employees and especially the employers.

A new and systematic approach to HR is needed. For example for the Czech Republic this is quite a challenging, as its subsidised programmes are focused on training – which can be easily monitored (you only need an attendee list to confirm it took place).

A systematic approach to HRD means being able to identify and analyse development needs; to be able to set development goals; to monitor the implementation of training and to set up a way of evaluating the benefit brought not just to participants, but to the enterprise.

Based on our experience acquired within the pilot implementation of the EMOLL approach, we can summarize our recommendation for HRD in the EU context as follows:

- Need to support the introduction of HRD systems in organizations and enterprises – not just activities (via training subsidies)
- The HRD process deserves support through all its phases: requirements analysis, training itself, benefits assessment
- Need to support the development of HR capabilities in organizations and enterprises

How best to do this in the EU? → Reorient the grant programmes policy towards systematic HRD projects.

