

{ English ToolBox

ToolBox

ToolBox

ENGLITS

ToolBox

PEER REVIEW TOOL BOX

1. Application of Peer Review Methodology in OCT

OCT aimed at increasing the formative approach of Peer Review procedure, improving the attitude of involved institutions and personnel toward mutual learning.

OCT realised a cycle of 3 interrelated Transnational Peer Reviews; all reviewed institutions were OCT partners. All experiences were managed by SAIP with the relevant contribution, for each specific Peer Review, of the personnel of the reviewed institutions; an external expert supervised all the Reviews in order to ensure the quality in the implemented process.

The OCT Peer Review procedure is based on the standard phases of the European Peer Review process:

- Preparatory phase: in OCT it included, mainly, the editing of a Self-Report by the reviewed institutions, the identification and training of Peers, the organisation of the Peer Visit;
- Peer Visit: in OCT it included mainly a tour of the premises, interviews with different groups of stakeholders, an oral feedback at the end of each Peer Visit;
- Editing of a draft report: in OCT Peers sent a draft report to the reviewed institution then a commented copy was sent back to Peers to have them issue a final Peer Review.

2. Peer Review experiences.

2.1 The Transnational Peer Reviews' cycle in OCT.

OCT project planned 3 Transnational Peer Reviews, realised within the OCT partners network; the 3 experiences were linked by a relevant added value in terms of reciprocal and mutual learning.

The whole process was coordinated by SAIP and supervised by an Italian expert, member of the initial Peer Review project in Initial VET; this role supervised all the phases of each peer Reviews and joined all Peer Visit.

Town, country	Focus of the Peer Review	Reviewed Institution	Period	Nationality of Peers Team members (*)
Coria, ES	Escuela Taller Coria VI courses	Patronato de Formacion y Empleo of Ayuntamiento de Coria (PFE)	May the 14 th and 15 th 2009	Spanish, Greek, Italian
Latina, Italy	Internship projects realised with participative approach	Department for Employment and Training Activities of Provincia di Latina, Italy	December the 9 th and 10 th 2009	Spanish, Greek, Italian
Athens, Greece	Training programs funded by ESF	Vocational Training Center (VTC) of HMA, Hellenic Management Association	June the 8 th and 9 th 2010	Spanish, Greek, Italian, Romanian

(*) involving Peers, Peer Review Coordinator and one External Supervisor.

2.2 First Peer Review realised in Coria, ES.

Description of the PFE, the reviewed institution.

The primary purpose of the Patronato de Formación y Empleo of Coria is the promotion of vocational guidance, initial and continuous training to employment and social and economic development in the Municipality and Mancomunidad of Coria from a global perspective and, using this innovative programs themselves or financed by other institutions.

Training and development are promoted in different fields of economic activity, among which are the activities and jobs related to:

- The environment and agriculture.
- The promotion of industry, handicrafts, construction and preservation of historical buildings.
- Tourism services and business services.

The Trustees manage complementary programs in education and access to culture. The Board also has the purpose of research methodology and technology in the areas listed above to improve the expectations of its objectives.

Aims, purposes and benefits of the first Peer Review

The First Peer Review was focused on Escuela Taller (ET in the followings) Coria VI courses, a specific training program performed by Patronato de Formacion y Empleo of Ayuntamiento de Coria - PFE - .

The Peer Visit were realised in Coria, Patronato de Formación y Empleo, on June the 14th and 15th, 2009, involving several members of the PFE staff, as the local Facilitator of PFE (the responsible for Transnational projects of PFE) the PFE Director, the trainers coordinator and two trainers of ET programs.

The main motivations for PFE to undergo a Peer Review referred to the lack of a quality management system and the chance to use the experience of Peer Review as a starting point in establishing a quality management system.

PFE considered the benefits of Peer Review in terms of introducing a quality management system, develop and customise practical tools for internal and external assessment of Escuela Taller.

The experience of Peer Review was also actively supported by the Junta de Extremadura, interested in testing this methodology for a further application in its territory, where the Escuela Taller courses run since 2002 without a dedicated quality system. As for today, only a periodical monitoring and audit procedure is implemented by SEXPE (Servicio Extremeño Público de Empleo).

The Junta considered the benefits of Peer Review in terms of developing an assessment methodology transferable to other Escuela Taller activities and training programs conducted in the Comunidad Autónoma de Extremadura.

More, PFE considered the Peer Review a very important tool for enhancing the credibility and trusting of local employers in Escuela Taller program and, more generally, in PFE training activity in occupational VET.

PFE was interested mainly in:

- identify the coherence between the ET program institutional goals and the organisation and training contents of ET Coria VI, with specific focus on the fulfilling of requirements of National Regulations on degree recognition;
- assess the appraisal and appreciation of Coria inhabitants;
- assess the usefulness of ET program and of Coria VI at local level according to the new labour market needs;
- More, the PFE and the representative of Diputación de Cáceres and of Junta de Extremadura were very interested in testing the Peer Review procedure in order to eventually apply it to all ETs.

The focus of Peer Review.

Escuela Taller provide training for unemployed people from 16 to 25 years old enrolled in the SEXPE (Extremeno Public Employment Service) Job Centers.

Escuela Taller provides young unemployed people with workshop and vocational training, professional practice for an easier access to labour market.

The Escuela Taller is a 2 years program; in the first six months, students attend theoretical and practical training, plus specific training on safety in workplaces. During this period, students have a financial assistance. In the following 18 months, the students continue their training and plus sign a contract as students/workers with the promoter of ET Coria VI (municipality of Coria); they receive 75% of the minimum wage due to public workers.

In the Escuela Taller Coria VI student can qualify in: Finished building, Masonry and Carpentry and be granted by a Certificate of Competence (Masonry and Carpentry) or a specific but no official certification (Finished building).

Each specialisation has devoted skilled trainers plus training coordinators.

ET program is based on four key-areas: theoretical and practical content; time schedule; methods, teaching strategies, materials and tools needed facilities and teaching aids; evaluation.

The curricula are established following the National Catalogue and ET national requirements; they are revised by the training team in relation with the objectives of the ET Coria VI initial project approved by the Junta of Extremadura.

Specific Quality Areas.

The Peer Review was specifically focused on the following Quality Areas.

Quality Area 1 Learning and teaching

Escuela Taller program delivers national level qualifications if its training program complies with the requirements detailed, for each professional profile, in a National Framework for professional qualification (Catalogo National). Escuela Taller program aims (firstly) at supporting the local ordinary/straordinary maintenance and repairs of historical and artistical buildings; some of National Framework requirements - in terms of training units - could be absent or being reduced.

PFE considers the Peer Review experience able to help in highlighting the main criticalities of ET actual approach and support the implementation of proper solutions.

Quality Area 11 -Social participation & interactions

Participatory process is increasing in its relevance for local development of ESF funded training activities in occupational VET.

PFE aims at estimating the appraisal and appreciation of Coria inhabitants with regards to Escuela Taller usefulness as training program and as tool for local environmental protection and historical heritage preservation

Composition of Peers Team

The Peers Team was composed by 2 Spanish Peers, 3 transnational Peers (2 from Italy and 1 from Greece), the Peer Review Coordinator and the Evaluation expert (both from Italy)

Candida Sevilla Solano (Spanish Peer)

She works as Training specialist c/o Organismo Autonomo para el Desarrollo Local (OADL), Diputacion de Caceres.

She has a 17 years training experience in Project Design, Training of teachers, Guidance and counselling,

Development of training courses, developing professional skills in quality assurance and quality development procedures. She got transnational experiences on Entrepreneurship, e-learning and on students mobility.

Carmen Alonso Merino (Spanish Peer)

She works in Technical Labour Market Research c/o Organismo Autonomo para el Desarrollo Local (OADL), Diputacion de Caceres.

Mrs Alonso Merino worked as teacher from 1997 to 2004 (business management and training, self-employment, tributary and labour management issues); she has professional expertises in supporting local employment and joined UE fund projects fostering gender mainstreaming.

Mrs Alonso Merino got transnational experiences in Gender Equality Balance (Ireland and Denmark)

Apostolo Xirafis (Transnational Peer)

Mr Xirafis works as Head of financial and administrative department in Economic and Social Council of Greece (OKE), Athens, Greece. He is a member of the Hellenic Management Association.

Mr Xirafis has professional expertise in issues related to age management and innovative training methodologies. He was Member of the steering Committee for the Action plan for the development of social dialogue in SE Europe, Member of the study committee at The National Accreditation Centre for Continuing Vocational Training (EKEPIS).

His main transnational experiences were made in Trans-national cooperation within Equal Initiative on the issue of Age management and Institutionalised social dialogue procedures.

Sandro Middei (Transnational Peer)

He is Project Manager and designer in Albafor, SpA in Albano, in Provincia di Roma; he has a 2 years experience in teaching (from 2002 to 2004) in labour market issues.

He is joining OCT project as SAIP consultant.

Mr Middei has developed professional skills in guidance and counselling, development of training courses and communication and group management and he has developed specific backgrounds on quality assurance and quality development procedures.

Mr Middei has a wide transnational experience in Equal and LdV management and he supported local Romanian VET providers in planning activities on Romanian FSE Calls for proposals.

Francesco Ulgiati (Transnational Peer)

Mr Ulgiati is a high-grade civil servant in Provincia di Latina Public Administration; he is responsible for strategic and operative planning of training activities, as for their implementation, management, monitoring and evaluation, at territorial level.

Ismene Tramontano (Evaluation expert and process supervisor)

Mrs Tramontano is researcher in Isfol, Project Leader for Quality Assurance in VET activities; she is involved in many European Projects such "Peer Review in Initial VET" Leonardo da Vinci Project (AT/04/C/F/TH-82000) and "Peer Review extended".

She is Peer Review coordinator in many Peer Review visits at national and European level and she is involved in the ENQA-VET, European Network for Quality Assurance in Vet, as national expert in many thematic groups such as "Tools for Quality Assurance and "Making Vet more attractive".

Anna Caragnano (Peer Review Coordinator).

Mrs Caragnano is a SAIP consultant, she has 10 years experience in management of national and transnational projects on human resources development, local development, training and vocational training.

She is a project designer and manager in ESF projects.

Data collection.

The Peers collected information by: tour of ET Coria VI premises, introduction to ET Coria VI made by PFE personnel, analysis of additional documents, interviews and observation of training activities performed during Escuela Taller regular classes.

The interviews were performed by two or three Peers at once and were addressed to the following: a student from the on going Escuela Taller Coria VI, a student from a previous Escuela Taller course realised in Coria, a representative of Asociacion Empresarial de Coria y Comarca (ASECOC), a representative of regional UGT body, trainer of practical masonry, trainer in woodwork, a representative of Junta de Extremadura.

Then two or three Peers at once observed theory training activities and woodwork workshop. During the visit the Peers Team informally interviewed ET Coria VI trainers pedagogical coordinator, to deepen some open questions and have a clearer picture of PFE and of Escuela Taller Coria VI.

Assessment of Quality Areas

The first Peer Review was focused on the following two Quality Areas:

- Quality Area 1 Learning and teaching
- Quality Area 11 -Social participation & interactions

As for the Quality Area 1 Learning and teaching the review focused on a set of selected criteria: the teaching contents, lessons planning, the creation of the learning and teaching processes, the promotion of key qualifications (soft skills), the quality of guidance and counselling of students, the quality of information provided to the students.

As for the Quality Area 11 - Social participation & interactions the review focused on a set of selected criteria: the integration of students into institutional life, the level of social interaction between teachers and students

2.3 Second Peer Review realised in Latina, IT.

Description of the Department for Employment and Training Activities of Provincia di Latina, the reviewed Institution.

Provincia di Latina is organised in thematic Departments; the Department for Employment politics and Vocational Training was re-organised in 2000, after one of the main devolution in this field.

The reviewed Department: promotes the employability of all categories of potential unemployed, with a special focus on younger population and weaker targets; supports the matching between demand and supply in labour market; increases the integration of different local services: Employment Centers, Information Centers, local professional and entrepreneurial associations; supports the employment of disabled people.

The Department runs administrative monitoring on general and didactic management on: "Authorised" training activities: activities realised in provincial territory within Regional regulation, by accredited private fee - paying schools; Training activities (qualification and specialisation) of "Third Area" implemented in Upper Secondary Technical and Vocational Schools based on curricula co-defined with Regione Lazio.

The Department, after performing a local need analysis, authorises the on-fee courses and the free courses and performs ex ante, in itinere and ex post monitoring and evaluation.

It carries out: Organisation and management; Preliminary procedures on required administrative proceedings; Approval and publication of calls; Collecting of proposals for accessing ESF fund; Assessing of submitted proposal, editing and approval of the lists of selected projects; Notifying to beneficiaries of approval and signing of financial agreements; Start up and monitoring of activities; Management of in itinere variations; Collecting, analysis and final approval of economic reports; Eventual revocation of allocated grants.

The Department is developing a new quality approach to the design and deliver of VET provisions in which the Quality assurance is a relevant issue; so far no previous policy was realised in this field.

Aims, purposes and benefits of the second Peer Review.

The personnel involved in the Peer Review included the Department Director, the Facilitator and the manager and coordinator of training activities at local level.

The Peer Visit of this second Peer Review was realised in Latina on December 09 and 10.

Provincia di Latina is introducing and embedding participatory process of local governance, it aims at creating and supporting VET local networks (including VET providers, business, social partners, trade unions, ESF Managing Authority) to increase the effectiveness of local matching between labour market needs and VET offer.

Provincia di Latina realised, among other activities, two projects aiming at support unemployed women in accessing labour market, operative implementations of an innovative approach to the local governance for ESF and VET.

The Provincia di Latina considers this approach a good Practice that could be adopted in its territory not only for women but for different categories of unemployed, also.

Provincia di Latina considered the Peer Review to be a useful tool to have this two experiences assessed and analysed, in order to make weaknesses to emerge and be solved, and strengths to be reinforced

It used the results of Peer Review to design a new project on internships, implemented in 2010.

The focus of Peer Review.

The Department under review implements several activities and projects through a local participative governance (including VET providers, business, social partners and trade unions).

The Department realised two projects aiming at supporting unemployed women in accessing labour market; the first project, called "GO IN", "Testing of governance politics for the innovation of Training System" was realised in 2008 and the second, called "Tirocini al femminile" (Internship for women) "Testing of a local tools for training internships" was realised in 2009.

Both projects were funded by ESF and were planned and realised directly by Provincia di Latina (in house activity) and its operative Agency for Training and Employment. (Agenzia Latina Formazione Lavoro).

"GO IN" project was addressed to three different targets, while "Tirocini al femminile" project was addressed to women only.

Provincia di Latina, due to the achieved results in "GO IN" project decided to use the "GO IN" approach for a second project, focusing on a single specific target; it transferred the methodologies and tools tested in "GO IN" project as a practice to be definitively adopted.

In both projects the main entrepreneurial associations were involved together with Agency Latina Formazione e Lavoro.

Both projects pursued specific gender equality politics, made local women to increase their knowledge and provided supporting activities to reduce the gender segregation in labour market and in careers development. GO IN planned Skills Audit, Guidance and 3-months training internship, providing the trainees with a 3-months financial support; 92 women applied and 72 financial supports were granted.

68 internships were completed in local companies, 15% of internees got a labour agreement.

"Tirocinii al femminile" (Internship for women) planned training activities for tutors and Matchmakers involved in the project, a 2-months internship, providing the trainees with a 2-months financial support; a huge number of applications were submitted (about 450), 148 financial support were granted, 142 internships were completed in local companies, 25% of trainees got a labour agreement.

Specific Quality Areas.

The Peer Review focused on two specific Quality Areas:

- Quality Area 11: External relations and internationalisation

Provincia di Latina have developed and successfully tested an innovative approach to local participated governance in VET; besides, the innovative approach involves only "demand" side of labour market and is mainly company-led.

Provincia di Latina is interested in widening the participative approach involving the most relevant stakeholders since the first steps of design and planning of the next activities.

- *Quality Area 13: Gender mainstreaming*

In 2008 and 2009 Provincia di Latina have developed relevant actions to support local unemployed women to access labour market, facing gender segregation in labour market.

Provincia di Latina is interested in making internship a recurrent activity and integrate it with other supporting activities; more, it would increase the active participation of women representatives in planning further activities.

Composition of Peers Team.

The Peers Team was composed by 1 Italian Peer and 3 transnational Peers (2 from Spain and 1 from Greece), the Peer Review Coordinator and the Evaluation expert (both from Italy).

Apostolo Xirafis (Transnational Peer)

Mr Xirafis works as Head of financial and administrative department in Economic and Social Council of Greece (OKE), Athens, Greece. He is a member of the Hellenic Management Association.

Mr Xirafis has professional expertise in issues related to age management and innovative training methodologies. He was Member of the steering Committee for the Action plan for the development of social dialogue in SE Europe, Member of the study committee at The National Accreditation Centre for Continuing Vocational Training (EKEPIS).

His main transnational experiences were made in Trans-national cooperation within Equal Initiative on the issue of Age management and Institutionalised social dialogue procedures.

Isidoro Fagundo (Transnational Peer)

Mr Isidoro Fagundo is employed in the Patronato de Formación y Empleo of the Ayuntamiento de Coria, ES, as Project Coordinator.

He has a 2-years experience as trainer in Managing and monitoring of natural environment; he has developed professional expertises in the development of innovative projects of vocational training and gender opportunities.

Gloria Gonzalez (Transnational Peer)

Mrs Gloria Gonzalez Ovola is the General Directorate of Training for Employment of Regional Government of Extremadura, ES, Department of Training for Employment, from Regional Ministry of Equality and Employment. She has developed a 20-years experience in training mainly in Spanish philology, Cultural management and management of Innovative and educative Centres.

Mrs Gonzalez has been the coordinator of different programs of employment and training, has been working as Agent of Employment and local Development and was coordinator of two Equal projects.

Stefano Bianchi (Italian Peer)

Mr Stefano Bianchi is a Consultant in Training and Development of organisations.

He has a 8-years experience in training in Quality management and assurance, Communication and relational skills, Marketing and development strategies, Managerial skills.

He has developed professional expertise in assessment and evaluation of human resources and organisational structures and relationships; also, he is trainer and analyst of quality assurance systems and tools.

Ismene Tramontano (Evaluation expert and process supervisor)

Mrs Tramontano is researcher in Isfol, Project Leader for Quality Assurance in VET activities; she is involved in many European Projects such "Peer Review in Initial VET" Leonardo da Vinci Project (AT/04/C/F/TH-82000) and "Peer Review extended".

She is Peer Review coordinator in many Peer Review visits at national and European level and she is involved in the ENQA-VET, European Network for Quality Assurance in Vet, as national expert in many thematic groups such as "Tools for Quality Assurance and "Making Vet more attractive".

Anna Caragnano (Peer Review Coordinator)

Mrs Caragnano is a SAIP consultant, she has 10 years experience in management of national and transnational projects on human resources development, local development, training and vocational training. She is a project designer and manager in ESF projects.

Data Collection.

The Peers collected information by: tour of premises (Peers Team visited the in-use kitchen and cookrooms, mechanical laboratories, car repairs workshop, wellness workshops) hosting the training activities realised by Department for Employment and Training Activities of Provincia di Latina; practical training observation; introduction to Department activities made by Department and Agenzia Formazione e Lavoro managers, interviews and focus group.

The interviews were realised prevailing by Peers Tandem under supervision of I. Tramontano and coordination of A. Caragnano.

The Peers interviewed: 2 ex trainees from "Tirocini formativi" experience, 2 ex trainees from the GO IN experience, several representatives of two entrepreneurial associations involved in both experiences, several representatives of two local companies that hosted trainees, the general coordinator of both experiences, the training coordinator of Tirocini Formativi, the Matchmaker from one of the entrepreneurial associations involved in both experiences and the Councillor for Gender Equity at Provincial level.

The Peer Teams, once completed all interviews and compared the emerging opinions, joint the Focus Group that involved representatives of Trade Unions, the operative Agency of Provincia di Latina for VET activities, one representative of entrepreneurial associations, one representative of Technical Assistance Services for Provincia di Latina, the Councillor for Gender Equity at Provincial level.

Assessment of Quality Areas.

The first Peer Review was focused on the following two Quality Areas:

- Quality Area 11 External relations and internationalisation
- Quality Area 13: Gender mainstreaming

As for the Quality Area 11 External relations and internationalisation the review focused on a set of selected criteria: the quality of information provided to interested target and relevant actors, and the process of identification and cooperation with relevant stakeholders.

As for the Quality Area 13: Gender mainstreaming the review focused on the criterio Mainstreaming equal opportunities.

2.4 Third Peer Review realised in Athens, GR.

Description of HMA and of its Vocational Training Centre (VTC) , the reviewed Institution.

HMA is a non profit organisation aiming at developing and promoting the application of modern principles, methods and techniques of management in private and public sector in Greece and abroad. HMA operates as service provider for its members, has established 5 Institutes specialised in management functions in different sectors; it realises about 90 events per year.

HMA's main activities cover the following sectors:

Open training: a number of seminars are conducted under the following topics: Training the Trainees, Business Administration, Management, Personnel Management, Marketing, Sales, Production Management, Personal Skills, Banking, Financial Management, Executive Secretaries Seminars, Computers.

"In-company" training The main subjects deal with the way in which individual executives or groups of

executives can successfully face problems, can achieve the company's goals and can work out a balance between the company's goals and their personal aims.

Certified training HMA co-operates with the following prestigious training organisations abroad, offering their curricula in Greece: Chartered Institute of Management – Certified Training in Sales, European Organisation for Quality – Diploma in Quality System Manager, Carlson Learning Company

Postgraduate programs in cooperation with Chartered Institute of Marketing, Henley Management College, European Marketing Confederation, Chartered Institute of Bankers

HMA's VTC is one of 284 certified vocational training centres of Greece; through VTC, HMA plans and carries out training programs mainly addressed to unemployed and full-time employed people, which are all funded by the European Social Fund.

HMA's VTC is specialised in the following thematic fields: Environment, Health and Welfare, Culture and Sport, Pedagogical courses, Economics and Management, ICT, Tourism area and Services, Technical and Transport, Agriculture". HMA's VTC participates in national calls for proposals related to educational programs, generally issued by the main national Ministries.

HMA's VTC is accredited by EKEPIS – the National Accreditation Centre for Continuing Vocational Training. EKEPIS is a statutory body supervised by the Ministry of Labour and Social Insurance with administrative and financial autonomy.

Aims, purposes and benefits of the third Peer Review.

The personnel involved in the Peer Review included Yannis Kalyvas, the training manager of the Vocational Training Centre, Cryssa Farlani the coordinator of the training activities reviewed and the Peer Review Facilitator Fanianna Gofa, assisted by Christos Rakovitis.

The Peer Visit of this third Peer Review was realised in Athens on June the 08th and 09th 2010.

The VTC Training Manager took the opportunity emerged in the framework of the OCT project to propose to the HMA General Manager to undergo an evaluation process for the Vocational Training Centre. A Peer Review seems the more appropriate option, especially because the trans-national Peers cooperate with European partners experienced in ESF funded programs.

HMA's VTC expectations from the Peer Review are to discover and examine possible gaps, weaknesses, problems and threats on its training activities to optimize the administration and assessment processes.

The focus of Peer Review.

The Vocational Training Centre of HMA realized, among other activities, the following two programs aimed at training for unemployed people: "Introduction to the use and operation of GIS" and "Basic Skills on Computers". These specific programs were selected as they obtained an important funding from the ESF; more, these programs were completed approximately two years ago, having adequate time to evaluate their results without being extremely old.

Introduction to the use and operation of GIS (implemented from 8/07 to 10/11/2008).

This training program was part of the actions of Measure 1.3: "Strengthening and development of interventions and actions for the unemployed to adapt their skills to the labour market of the Operational Program "Employment and Vocational Training", which generally include actions of continuing vocational training for unemployed people in fields responded to the labour market demand and to the unemployed person needs.

Specifically, the program met the labour market requirements by providing the appropriate theoretical and practical background to graduates from Technical Schools, wishing to work as specialists in the use and operation of Geographical Information System (GIS). The proportion of hours of training in theory - practice was 70-30% (280 hours theory and 120 hours of practice).

Basic Skills on Computers (VTC realised 19 seminars).

The purpose of the project was training unemployed beneficiaries in basic skills to use Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) and access the relative ECDL certification.

The program concerned 19 seminars (100hrs/each) of theory in basic ICT skills and has been implemented in HMA premises. It aimed at unemployed high school graduates in training, vocational training institutes, technical schools, universities, it met their needs to track the basic skills of computer use and led to certification of knowledge acquired in basic skills, information and communication technologies (ICTs) by "ECDL", a certification body recognized by the national Organisation for Vocational Education and Training (O.E.E.K.), in 4 sections. After the completion of each seminar, the trainees underwent an ECDL examination to acquire the appropriate competence on computer skills.

The educational process was clearly laboratory-oriented. In the computer room, a corresponding PC was used per trainee to experiment, operate, create and discover the functions of a PC and the possibilities of Word, Excel, Powerpoint, Internet Explorer and Outlook.

Specific Quality Areas.

The Peer Review focused on two specific Quality Areas:

Quality Area 3: Assessment

HMA considered that a proper assessment process could help them to improve the quality of their training programs and trainers' performance.

VTC does not implement formative assessment but only basic assessment procedures to meet the requirements of each ESF Call for Proposals.

A VTC internal committee selects the candidates' applications and curriculum vitae.

VTC does not provide any kind of feedback to the trainees about their performance, nor in itinere, neither at the end of activities.

Quality Area 6: Management and Administration

The review of the Management and Administration Quality Area has been focused on Vocational Training Centre only.

Actually VTC is directly supported by different HMA's departments for essential processes, like financial supervision, dispatch settlements, IT support etc.

HMA considered that a better management in VTC training programs could affect the whole administration of HMA training activities and improve the efficiency and efficacy of the training programs.

Composition of Peers Team.

The Peers Team was composed by 1 Greek Peer and 3 transnational Peers (1 from Spain, 1 from Italy, 1 from Romania), the Peer Review Coordinator and the Evaluation expert (both from Italy).

Apostolo Xirafis (National Peer)

Mr Xirafis works as Head of financial and administrative department in Economic and Social Council of Greece (OKE), Athens, Greece. He is a member of the Hellenic Management Association.

Mr Xirafis has professional expertise in issues related to age management and innovative training methodologies. He was Member of the steering Committee for the Action plan for the development of social dialogue in SE Europe, Member of the study committee at The National Accreditation Centre for Continuing Vocational Training (EKEPIS).

His main transnational experiences were made in Trans-national cooperation within Equal Initiative on the issue of Age management and Institutionalised social dialogue procedures.

Isidoro Fagundo (Transnational Peer)

Mr Isidoro Fagundo is employed in the Patronato de Formación y Empleo of the Ayuntamiento de Coria, ES, as Project Coordinator.

He has a 2-years experience as trainer in Managing and monitoring of natural environment; he has developed professional expertises in the development of innovative projects of vocational training and gender opportunities

Dragos Florescu (Transnational Peer)

Mr Dragos Florescu is the General Manager of SC Formenerg SA; he has a 13-years teaching experience (chemistry and management subjects).

Mr Florescu has developed a relevant experience in managing educational system in schools and high-schools, consulting services offered by social partners on the policy on education.

He is a Project manager for international and national European funded projects, has developed workshops and meetings with business's representatives in China, Singapore, Brazil, USA, Italy, Greece; also and developed partnership with VET providers from Austria and United Kingdom.

Mr Florescu has a relevant expertise as evaluator in schools and high – schools in Bucharest, with the purpose of assessing the teachers didactic skills for upgrading their professional levels.

Sergio Nisi (Transnational Peer)

Mr Nisi is a 20 years-experienced consultant for private and public organisations in the areas of local development, design, planning and coordination of EU funded projects (ESF, Equal, LdV, ESF art. 6), research and implementation of innovations in VET systems, equal opportunities.

Mr. Nisi has developed a relevant experience as technical consultant for several Italian local authorities (NUTS 3) in the innovation of labour market and VET systems.

HE has designed, planned and coordinated EU transnational projects developed in partnership with institutions from: Greece, Germany, Spain, Portugal, France, Poland, Romania.

Ismene Tramontano (Evaluation expert and supervisor)

Mrs Tramontano is researcher in Isfol, Project Leader for Quality Assurance in VET activities; she is involved in many European Projects such "Peer Review in Initial VET" Leonardo da Vinci Project (AT/04/C/F/TH-82000) "Peer Review extended" and "Peer Review Impact".

She is Peer Review coordinator in many Peer Review visits at national and European level. She is involved in the EQAVET , European Network for Quality Assurance in Vet, and as national expert in Italian Reference Point for Quality Assurance.

Anna Caragnano

Mrs Caragnano is a SAIP consultant, she has 10 years experience in management of national and transnational projects on human resources development, local development, training and vocational training.

She is a project designer and manager in ESF projects.

Data Collection.

The Peers collected information by: tour of premises (Peers Team visited HMA premises in Athens) introduction to Department activities and interviews.

The interviews - realised prevailing by Peers Tandem with the supervision of I.Tramontano and the coordination of A.Caragnan - involved: one trainer in "Basic skills for PC", one , trainer in GIS, one ex trainee in "Basic skills for PC", one ex trainee in GIS, a representative of one company that hosted trainees of past ESF programs in traineeship, the HMA General Manager, the Administrator of VTC, the training manager of the VTC, two of HMA administration staff.

Data Collection Assessment of Quality Areas.

The third Peer review was focused on:

- Quality Area 3 Assessment
- Quality Area 7 Management and Administration

As for the Quality Area 3 Assessment, the review focused on a set of selected criteria: the assessment concept, the function of assessment in learning and teaching processes, the transparency in the assessment procedures and approach.

As for the Quality Area 7 Management and Administration, the review focused on a set of selected criteria: the HMA and VTC management style, the decision making process.

3. Highlights on the benefit of Peer Reviews for the reviewed institutions

At the end of each Peer Visit, during the first level feedback, the reviewed institutions were led to identify some areas for improvement; in average, they agreed with the Peers recommendations and state for the planning of improvement plans.

Actually, formal planning were not provided but the reviewed institutions report of several actions realised after the Peer Review implementation.

It is very useful to read the comments from the protagonists of the Peer Review experiences in their own words.

3.1 IMPACTS OF THE ATHENS PEER REVIEW as described by HMA, Hellenic Management Association.

The Peer Review provided us with better understanding of strengths and weaknesses of the HMA Vocational Training Centre (VTC) administrative procedures.

Gaps and barriers have arisen in the evaluation system and ways of improvement have been identified.

The Peer review created positive reactions in the managerial team and the personnel and there is a willing to adapt such self-evaluation model.

HMA VTC has a strong awareness of the identified problems in the two Quality areas reviewed (quality area1:assessment, quality area 2 :administration of HMA VTC) and is currently examining new procedures, tools and operations in order to integrate them in the ISO system.

The results of the Peer Review in Athens have been communicated to the HMA General Manager, other HMA Departments and all other relevant stakeholders by e-mail and personal contacts.

In addition, during the monthly HMA Personnel meeting Yannis Kalivas informed the participants about the procedure and the Peer Review results.

It has been decided to present the Peer Review procedure to HMA Board of Directors to decide whether such a model would be adopted for the years to come.

3.2 Some conclusions from the Peer review activity carried out in ET Coria in the framework of OCT Project, as described by Junta of Extremadura.

Overview: ESCUELAS TALLER (ET), CASAS DE OFICIOS (CO) AND TALLERES DE EMPLEO (TE) Programs

During the 80 s, unemployment affected a very high number of young people, with very few opportunities of new jobs and high difficulties of labour inclusion. At the same time, there was groups of craftsmen and craftswomen of trades in processes of disappearing because their close retirement and lacking of people who took over those jobs. Besides that, there was important idle resources of the national artistic heritage that needed actions which could avoid the deterioration they were suffering.

The ET (Workshops Schools) CO (Trades Houses) Programs arose from the combination of these three factors in 1985, as well as TE (Employment Workshops) in 1999, led by Labour Ministry and National Institute of Employment.

Nowadays the management and monitoring of these programs are carried out by Autonomous Communities, after all competences in active policies of employment were transferred to regional administrations.

ET CO TE are mixed programs of training and employment that have the aim of improving the employability of unemployed people.

ET programs are aimed to over 18 and under 25 job seekers who have at the most an education level of secondary school. The program includes a first stage introductory training and other stage of training in alternation with the work and professional practice. The length of both stages is not lower than one year and not higher than two years, in periods of six months.

Learning and qualification are mixed with apprentices and a productive work in activities related with recovery or promotion of artistic, cultural or natural heritage, restoration of urban or natural environments, recovering or creation of public infrastructures, and any other public or social activity which allows participants the labour inclusion by professionalization and acquiring of labour experience.

CO are also aimed to young people between 16 and 24 who have not pass secondary education level. The program includes a first stage introductory training and other stage of training in alternation with the work and professional practice. The length of each stage is six months, so the total program last one year.

TE are aimed to people over 25 with a minimum length of six month and a maximum of one year.

ET CO TE Programs have improved the integration of learning, professional experience and training for employment. Nevertheless it is difficult to know whether if a comprehensive knowledge (theoretical and practical) have been reached by participants in programs, as well as the tools that have been useful for inclusion in labour market.

This is because ET CO TE never have included an evaluation action of the program such as that. So, the Peer review activity carried out in the framework of Leonardo da Vinci Project OCT has been very useful for including some improvements.

With Peer Review we have known about:

- An evaluation system that we can apply to all this programs
- Having a privileged information for the designing of new programs as an answer of the current situation in labour market
- Taking into consideration some aspects that are working in the ET CO TE Program, and those which are not.

In this sense, Regional Government of Extremadura through its Public Service of Employment, General Directorate of Vocational Training for Employment, has suggested Ministry of Labour some improvements for active policies that are currently in process of design. These improvements are based on the strengthen of the training phase of the ET CO TE programs, because Peer review showed that there are a high predominance of social aspects in the programs. For achieving this, the next changes have been proposed:

- Programs will have a minimum length of nine months and a maximum of two years
- A new classification of programs can be established: ET for young people under 25 with difficulties for inclusion, ET for people over 25 with difficulties for inclusion, and ET for unemployed people, irrespective of their age.
- Projects will have a first stage of introductory training with a length of 3 or 6 months, and a second stage

of training in alternation with the work and professional practice until the maximum length foreseen for the project.

- During the first stage of training, pupils will receive the vocational training related with the occupation. If it is possible, that training will be linked to the official training of Professional Certificate, which has the official training contents nationwide.
- During the stage of training in alternation with job, pupils will sign a contract for training with the entity.
- So pupils will receive their salaries during this stage.

4 Critical overview of Peer Review cycle in OCT.

Ismene Tramontano, researcher of ISFOL and OCT external consultants in Peer Review methodology.

OCT final aim was to contribute to the improvement of efficiency and effectiveness of VET systems, thanks to participatory process and Peer Review methodology.

Peer Review is a form of external evaluation with the aim to support the reviewed educational institution in its efforts for quality assurance and quality development.

An external group of experts, so called peers, is invited to judge the quality of different fields of the institution, such as the quality of education and training provision of individual departments or of the entire organisation. During the evaluation process, the peers usually visit the reviewed institution.

In particular the transfer of the Peer Review methodology in the original project had the role of promoting a reciprocal learning process and increase the quality of planned activities; the final aim should have been achieved mainly through the transfer of participatory approach in planning ESF activities.

In fact the application of Peer Review methodology has had a bigger impact on the results of the project.

As a matter of fact in the implementation of the project the application of PR methodology produced relevant results:

In Coria the Peer Review was applied for the assessment of Escuela Taller, that are mixed programs of training and employment that have the aim of improving the employability of unemployed people. Before the OCT Leonardo da Vinci project and the application of Peer Review, Escuela Taller programs had never been assessed. So, thanks to this experience the Regional Government of Extremadura has declared to positively consider the results of Peer Review experience because they have recognised that:

Peer Review represents an evaluation tool that can be applied to most training programs

The results of Peer Review evaluation can be considered the starting point for designing new training programs;

Thanks to Peer Review it has been possible to focus on strengths and “areas of improvement” of Escuela Taller programs.

The results of Peer Review assessment have been considered as the starting point for planning the new training programs.

So the application of Peer Review has contributed not only to the improvement of quality of training through the introduction of assessment tools, but also to the improvement of participatory decision making process, thanks to the promotion of a strict cooperation between the Escuela Taller, the Township of Coria and the Regional Government of Extremadura.

In the Province of Latina, in particular in the Department for Employment and Training Activities, Peer Review visit was focused on the following Quality Areas:

External relations and internationalisation

Gender mainstreaming

In particular the assessment was referred to two training projects, GO.IN. and Tirocini al femminile, both characterised by a high level of participation in planning training offers; in fact all social partners and representatives of VET providers were involved.

On a general point of view the Department for Employment and Training Activities implements a lot of activities and projects through a local participative approach.

That's why the Peer Review conducted in the Province of Latina represents, among the three Peer Reviews of the Project, the best synthesis between the transfer of participatory process of local governance and Peer Review.

The results of the assessment of the Peers were approved by managers and staff of the Province of Latina.

In Greece the Peer Review was conducted in the Vocational Training Centre of the Hellenic Management Association, an organisation characterised by a very strong brand and whose partnership is composed of a very strong companies network. As a matter of fact the Hellenic Management Association appeared as an organisation able to provide a "participatory" process for planning and implementing training offer. The Peer Review was focused on two quality areas: Management and Administration and Assessment. According to the opinion of the Director of the Vocational Training Centre, the Peer Review experience provided "with better understanding of strengths and weaknesses of the HMA Vocational Training Centre (VTC) administrative procedures. The Peer Review created positive reactions in the managerial team and the personnel and there is a willing to adapt such self-evaluation models". HMA VTC staff has shared the results of the assessment made by the Peers and expressed the wish to integrate new procedures and tools in their internal quality assurance ISO procedures.

The overall assessment of the transfer of Peer Review methodology is positive because through this methodology and in all the three experiences it has been possible to make a "friendly assessment" and to promote participatory processes:

- in Spain the participatory processes is referred to a stricter cooperation between the Township and the Regional Government of Extremadura, the two different local Institutions responsible for the implementation and improvement of Escuela Taller training programmes;
- in Italy, in the Province of Latina, the participatory process already existed, but thanks to Peer Review local actors were sensitised on some needs, point of attention for making participatory process of local governance more effective and more efficient;
- in Greece too, even if the Peer Review was conducted in a very strong and effective organisation, the improvement of the internal participatory management process was promoted.

In OCT project, the transfer of Peer Review methodology linked to participatory process has completed achieved its original aim. The transfer of this methodology has had also the merit to introduce a new assessment methodology and new assessment tools in three different countries. The Peer Review methodology as a "light assessment" has had a great degree of acceptance and has allowed the assessment of projects/experiences that for some aspects had never been evaluated. So we can say that this transfer has contribute also to the improvement and the spread of the assessment culture and so to the improvement and promotion of quality of VET provisions.

It would be interesting in the next year to assess the impact of Peer Review on the improvement of quality and local cooperation in the Institutions and context assessed in the background of OCT Project.

Self-Report for the European Peer Review

Name of reviewed organisation

Author of the Report

Date of issue

This form is a customised version of the original one realised by Leonardo da Vinci project AT/04/C/F/TH-82000

Data Sheet

Data Sheet

1) Contact information Name of VET provider		
Address		
Telephone, fax, e-mail		
Contact persons	Name	Contact (e-mail)

2) Starting point (e.g. prior evaluations, national quality requirements applicable etc.) and decision to conduct the Peer Review (taken when and by whom?)

3) Aims and purpose of the Peer Review

4) External organisation

Single Peer Review (Peers come from different VET Providers)

Reciprocal Peer Review (Peer Review with one partner institution)

This form is a customised version of the original one realised by Leonardo da Vinci project AT/04/C/F/TH-82000

Peer Review in a Network (more than 2 VET Providers have a common Peer Team)

5) Internal organisation for the conduct of the Peer Review (Describe who is responsible for which tasks)

6) Overview of the procedure and time schedule:	
Activity	
Self-Evaluation	
Self-Report (due 1 month before Visit at the latest)	
Preparation of Peer Visit	
Peer Visit	
Peer Review Report	
Action Plan and Improvements	

whole institution
 specific department

7) Scope of the Peer Review

8) Quality Areas

8.1) List of special evaluation questions for the Peers

--

9) List of Peers with names and contact information

Role	Name	Institution	E-mail

Special Functions

--	--	--	--

2.

2.1 Description of the VET provider

2.2 Mission statement

2.3 Statistical Information on VET Provision

Data for study branches	F	M	Total
Student/pupil enrolment in study branch (indicate which):			
Current year			
Previous year			
Year before previous year			
Success/Graduation rate (%; reporting year :)			
Student/teacher ratio	/		
Student/pupil enrolment in study branch (indicate which):			
Current year			
Previous year			
Year before previous year			
Success/Graduation rate			

This form is a customised version of the original one realised by Leonardo da Vinci project AT/04/C/F/TH-82000

(%; reporting year :)			
Student/teacher ratio			/
Student/pupil enrolment in study branch (indicate which):			
Current year			
Previous year			
Year before previous year			
Success/Graduation rate (%; reporting year :)			
Student/teacher ratio			/

3. Quality assurance/ quality management

3.1 Quality assurance and development policy

3.2 Quality assurance activities and improvement measures (including QM system and an overview of data generated and used)

3.3 Overall assessment of quality of VET provision

This
82000

/F/TH-

4. Assessment of Quality Areas

4.1 Quality Area 1

Strengths and areas of improvement

Overall assessment of the Quality Area

Improvement measures (planned and implemented)

Evaluation questions for the Peers (recommended)

4.2 Quality Area 2

Strengths and areas of improvement

Overall assessment of the Quality Area

Improvement measures (planned and implemented)

Evaluation questions for the Peers (recommended)

This form is a customised version of the original one realised by Leonardo da Vinci project AT/04/C/F/TH-82000

5. Annexes

This form is a customised version of the original one realised by Leonardo da Vinci project AT/04/C/F/TH-82000

Application form for Peers

Name

Sex: Female Male

Date of birth:

Nationality:

Address:

Phone:

Email:

Main organisation at which you are employed

Job title:

Name of Organisation:

Department:

Address (of department/organisation):

Experience relevant to the Peer Review work

Teaching experience: Yes No

Years of teaching experience: _____ years

Main Professional Disciplines:

Teaching experience

Subject	From	To

What other professional expertise do you have that is relevant for the Peer Review work?

Indicate the areas in which you have acquired expertise and rank the level of this expertise on a scale from 1 (excellent) to 4 (basic). For the three areas you feel most experienced in, please use the space provided to explain how you have acquired this expertise.

Level of Expertise (1-4)
1 (excellent), 2 (good), 3 (fair), 4 (basic)

<input type="checkbox"/>	Evaluation	Field of Expertise	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Communication and moderation		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Guidance and counselling		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Training of teachers/trainers		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Innovation in teaching methods		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Development of training courses		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Development of teaching materials	Field of Expertise	Expertise:
<input type="checkbox"/>	Employment/Labour market		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Co-operation between vocational training bodies, businesses and social partners		
<input type="checkbox"/>	New employment profiles		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Gender Mainstreaming		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Intercultural dialogue		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Other - Specify: Age management	Field of Expertise	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Other - Specify:		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Other - Specify:		
<input type="checkbox"/>	Other - Specify:		

Experience with quality assurance and quality development procedures

Experience in quality assurance and quality development procedures

Topics, Fields	From	To

Have you already conducted any review work? Yes No

What	Where	From	To

Have you or has your institution already been reviewed? Yes No

Type of review procedure	By whom	When
1		
2		
3		

Transnational experience

Transnational experience Yes No

Country, area	Description of knowledge

Language Skills

Indicate your level of proficiency: 1 (excellent), 2 (good), 3 (fair), 4 (basic)

Language	Reading	Speaking	Writing
Mother tongue:			

Further skills relevant to the Peer Review work

Use the box below if you wish to indicate any other relevant skills (personal skills, social skills, etc.)

Interview Minutes

Name of the VET provider	
Date and time	
Interviewees	
Name of interviewers	
First Quality Area	Quality Area 1
Criterion/criteria	
Indicators	
Second Quality Area	
Criterion/criteria	
Indicators	
Relevant remarks	

1. Interview minutes

Quality Area 1

<p><u>Criterion</u></p> <p>Indicator:</p> <p><u>Questions</u></p>
<p><u>Criterion</u></p> <p>Indicator:</p> <p><u>Questions:</u></p>
<p>.....</p> <p>.....</p> <p>.....</p>

Quality Area 2

<p><u>Criterion</u></p> <p>Indicator:</p> <p><u>Questions</u></p>
<p><u>Criterion</u></p> <p>Indicator:</p> <p><u>Questions:</u></p>
<p>.....</p> <p>.....</p> <p>.....</p>

2. Guidelines for analysis of the interview by the Peer Tandem

1) What are the key issues of the interview in relation to the different indicators and criteria?
2) How credible and reliable is the information gathered during this interview?
3) Which additional meaningful and unusual information (which does not fit into the content of the indicators/criteria) can be outlined?
4) Do you want to record any further questions, assumptions or inconsistencies?

OBSERVATION GRID

Trainer:

Class/workshop:

Number of attending students:

Observation performed from..... to

Observers:

1. Location:

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	----

2. Management of class:

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	----

3. Ability in explanation:

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	----

4. Training supporting materials

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	----

5. Relationship among trainers and students:

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	----

6. Management of students with special needs

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	----

7. Strengths

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	----

8. Criticalities

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	----

Peer Review Report

Name of reviewed organisation

List of persons involved in Peer Review and respective role:

Author of the Report

Date of issue

Data Sheet

Data Sheet

1) Contact information Name of VET provider		
Address		
Telephone, fax, e-mail		
Contact persons	Name	Contact (e-mail)

2) Starting point (e.g. prior evaluations, national quality requirements applicable etc.) and decision to conduct the Peer Review (taken when and by whom?)

3) Aims and purpose of the Peer Review

4) External organisation

Single Peer Review (Peers come from different VET Providers)

Reciprocal Peer Review (Peer Review with one partner institution)

Peer Review in a Network (more than 2 VET Providers have a common Peer Team)

5) Internal organisation for the conduct of the Peer Review (Describe who is responsible for which tasks)

6) Overview of the procedure and time schedule:	
Activity	
Self-Evaluation	
Self-Report (due 1 month before Visit at the latest)	
Preparation of Peer Visit	
Peer Visit	
Peer Review Report	
Action Plan and Improvements	

- whole institution
 specific department

7) Scope of the Peer Review

8) Quality Areas

8.1) List of special evaluation questions for the Peers

9) List of Peers with names and contact information

Role	Name	Institution	E-mail

Special Functions			

2. Description of the VET provider

2.1 Summary: Description of VET provision

2.2 Summary: Mission Statement

2.3 Summary: Quality Assurance and Development: policies and measures

3. Peer Review procedure

3.1 Purpose/targets of the Peer Review

3.2 Peer Team

List the participants in the Peer Team with their professional and institutional background.

Role	Name	Institution	E-mail

3.3 Methods for collecting data and sources

4 Assessment of Quality Areas

4.1 Quality Area 1

For each criterio and indicator please details the Strengths, Areas of Improvement and sources of information

4.2 Overall assessment of Quality Area 1

4.3 Quality Area 2

For each criterio and indicator please details the Strengths, Areas of Improvement and sources of information

4.4 Overall assessment of Quality Area 2

4.5 Overall Assessment

5 Annexes

