

SAMIN

# Supporting Ethnic Minorities by Promoting Access to Labour Market and VET

---

Gap Analysis of Integration Projects in 6 European Countries

# Gap Analysis

---

## IMPRINT

### Publisher:

ESTA-Bildungswerk gGmbH  
 Bismarckstr. 8  
 D-32545 Bad Oeynhausen

Telephone: +49 (0)5731.157-0  
 Fax: +49 (0)5731.157-102  
 info@esta-bw.de  
 www.esta-bw.de

### Contact:

Kerstin Struckmeier

### Run:

500 pieces

## CONTENT

— Executive Summary .....	5
— Introduction .....	6
— Reference Project and Case Studies .....	7
— Approach of the Analysis and Overview on Data .....	17
— Target Groups of the Projects .....	19
— Obstacles to get Access to VET and Jobs .....	19
— Actors Involved .....	22
— Objectives .....	23
— Services and Activities of the Projects .....	25
— Access to Participants and Community Organisations .....	27
— Methodological Approach .....	28
— Holistic, Individual and Person-Centred .....	28
— Ownership and Building Capacities .....	29
— Political Frameworks .....	31
— Recommendations .....	33
— Recommendations in Terms of Methodology and Target Groups: .....	33
— Recommendations in Terms of Project Planning: .....	34
— Recommendations in Terms of Programmes and Policies: .....	34
— Recommendations of the Project FIBA .....	35
— Appendices .....	36
— Apprenticeship Schemes, Migration Policy and Statistical Data .....	36
— Austria .....	36
— France .....	38
— Germany .....	39
— Italy .....	41
— The Netherlands .....	42
— United Kingdom .....	42
— Questionnaire .....	44
— Bibliography .....	46
— Partners .....	48

# Executive Summary

---

Migrants in all of the countries of the SAMIN project face substantial disadvantages when it comes to vocational education and training and access to the job market. But there are projects to foster equal conditions in all of the countries, too. The partners within the SAMIN project from France (coordinator), Austria, Germany, Italy, Netherlands and UK have selected 18 projects, three per country, that were specifically dedicated to promote access to vocational education and training and access to proper jobs for migrants.

Although the projects differ in various aspects there are similar elements that can be found in most of the examined projects: The selected projects fought discrimination, implicit stereotypes and intercultural barriers on the labour market and all projects aimed at improving accessibility to proper jobs through competence-developments, strengthening specific capabilities and the acknowledgement of professional experiences.

Several of them involved potential employers and stakeholders from economy to boost the links to the world of work. Due to the specific groups targeted, the delivered services and activities vary remarkably and range from information and consultancy services to language training courses, from vocational training courses to training internships. While in most of the projects the activities were dedicated directly to the main target group of migrants, in quite a lot of projects some services were rendered to additional target groups like teachers, trainers, employers and recruiters with their means and operations.

In the analysis, we have drawn attention to the methodological design of the 18 projects. Some projects applied specific pedagogical approaches while others were using various formal and informal methods. The comparison of the methodologies shows that there can be found two major approaches in quite a lot of the projects under consideration: some projects offered their services in a holistic, individual and person-centred approach while others relied on an approach of ownership and capacity-building.

As all projects have been considered as successful and have lead to good results, it is possible to conclude specific recommendations from their experiences. These recommendations relate to the different aspects of the projects like methodology and target groups, project planning and programmes and policies. ■

# Reference Project and Case Studies

## Introduction

Between 2010 and 2013 a project called FIBA (Förderung in Berufswahl und Ausbildung/support in career choice and vocational education and training) was operated in 5 cities in Northrhine-Westphalia, which – in terms of population – is the biggest of the German Bundesländer (German state provinces). The project was carried out by the training provider ESTA-Bildungswerk in the cities of Bielefeld, Bochum, Dortmund, Duisburg and Oberhausen; duration was 2 years in each of the cities. All of these cities have a rather huge migrant population and the biggest migrant group consists of people with Turkish origin. The project was funded as a project of innovation within ESF stream of Northrhine-Westphalia. The innovative quality did not lie in the invention of something totally new, but in the combination of a couple of proven services in an innovative way to serve the needs of young people with Turkish family backgrounds to improve their access to initial vocational education and training in the economy. After this project succeeded several evaluations, the idea came up in 2012 to develop an international project to see whether these German results and findings could be compared with experiences made in other European countries. At the beginning of 2013 that idea was put into praxis and the project SAMIN was elaborated as a joint “transfer of innovation” project within the Lifelong Learning Programme of the European Union.

When the project was accepted, each of the six partners from France (as coordinator), Austria, Germany, Italy, Netherlands and the United Kingdom agreed upon searching for three national projects that could be embedded into such a comparative analysis.

This gap-analysis is the first deliverable out of a series of additional products: a methodological handbook about success-features enhancing migrants’ participation in VET and labour market, a digital environment for professionals dealing with migrants and a capacity assessment of stakeholders’ involvement. Finally a report on exploitation will follow during the lifetime of this project (2013-2015). ■

In Germany exists a statistical and valid under-representation of people with migrant background in Initial Vocational Education and Training (IVET). This IVET in Germany is the predominant start for a (non-academic) professional career and it can have different forms and formats, but it is always based on a bilateral (double sided) structure, called dual apprenticeship. This IVET combines in-company training with theoretical lessons in vocational schools. The system is described as dual because training is conducted in these two places of learning - companies and vocational schools.

Access to vocational training is the critical juncture in school-to-work transitions.

Students without or with only lower secondary qualifications in many cases do not manage to enter vocational training right after leaving school<sup>1</sup>. The German VET system reinforces inequalities resulting from stratification within the German school system.

The apprenticeship training qualifies people for a variety of manufacturing or commercial occupations. The majority of graduates with a vocational certificate go into the labour market directly after completing their training. However, they also have the option to enter higher education or advanced vocational training.

Despite its seemingly robustness even in times of economic crisis, the German system has gradually become less responsive to the needs of the economy as a whole, due to several reasons<sup>2</sup>:

- The transition to a knowledge-based economy often creates greater demands for theoretical and transferable skills than for practical knowledge and initial vocational training skills. The German system is mainly applied in domestically oriented companies in traditional trades, but the rapidly growing knowledge-based services are only sparsely represented within this system.

- The curricula-based approach of the German apprenticeship system is slower and less flexible to adaptations than a modularised and competence based system. The adaptability of the German dual apprenticeship is limited in terms of changing skills needs and new methods of delivering training.

- The ageing of the workforce creates a bigger need for lifelong learning activities and not just initial training. In Germany the participation rates in CPD are still not sufficient.

- Higher education is more attractive to very capable young people and thus weakens the intellectual basis of the apprenticeship.

The situation for people with a migrant background is similar in the countries that are involved in this project<sup>3</sup>: migrants face substantial disadvantages when it comes to vocational education and training and jobs. Although the level of disadvantage and discrimination may differ in diverse categories (from country to country, from region to region, from group to group, from sector to sector and so on), the overall picture keeps being confirmed, that the educational achievements of migrants are often lower compared to people without a migrant background, and thus the achieved vocational careers, are often lower than the ones of people without a migrant background. In Europe citizens of migrant origin are almost always overrepresented across most socio-economic indicators of disadvantage<sup>4</sup>.

Considering the information above, an assumption of this Gap Analysis is that VET can improve the access to the labour market. The case studies chosen allow the verification of this assumption amongst others.

All of the examined 18 projects were specifically dedicated to VET-objectives and the integration of migrants into the labour market.

<sup>1</sup> Kohlrausch, Bettina, *Youth Unemployment in Germany - Skill Biased Patterns of Labour Market Integration*, Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung, 2012.

<sup>2</sup> Cedefop REFER NET, *VET in Europe – Country Report Germany, 2011*; See also Cedefop Panorama Series 138: U. Hippach-Schneider, M. Krause, C. Woll, *Vocational education and training in Germany, 2007*.

<sup>3</sup> Tjaden, Jasper Dag: *What can international comparisons of outcomes and policies tell us about good practices of migrant education*, Itinera Institut Discussion Paper 2012, p. 1.

<sup>4</sup> Vidhya Ramalingam, *Integration: what works? Institute for Strategic Dialogue 2013, p. 1*.

The projects were conducted in the last decade and they lasted between 3 months and 7 years. Accordingly, the compared projects vary significantly in terms of size and budget; there are small-scale projects that strictly depended on people working on a voluntary basis and without substantial cost headings up to projects with an annual budget of about 1.000.000 EUR. ■

THE ORGANISATIONS AND PROJECTS IN ALPHABETICAL ORDER OF THE COUNTRY ACRONYMS

Acronym and Organisation	Project	Target groups	Duration (in months)	Activities
<b>AT1</b> migrare. Center for migrants, Upper Austria.	AST. Drop-in center for people with qualifications gained abroad	Migrants with qualifications gained abroad and trying to receive nostrification or vocational utilization of these competences. They were mostly migrants but that has not been obligatory. Most people have been between 24 and 45 years old and their origin shifted over the last years: originally people mainly came from former Yugoslavia.	24	Activities have been multilingual nostrification guidance, assistance during the whole recognition process, gathering of accredited translations of diploma, certificates and other documents and counsel concerning the recognition of qualifications.
<b>AT2</b> BFI Upper Austria	Preparatory course for health care professions.	Refugees entitled to asylum or with subsidiary protection.  This project especially addressed graduates from EFF funded measures MESO or participants of AMI and RIKO and the project integration through language by the Volkshilfe Upper Austria.	12	The preparatory course consisted of various modules with a total of 730 units:  – General and vocation oriented language training (325 units); – Basic knowledge of nursing patients and elderly people (100 units); – Basics of communication and intercultural communication (50 units); – Furtherance of social and intercultural competences (50 units); – Information and communication technology basics (50 units); – Application training, vocational orientation, educational guidance (55 units); – Internship (100 units)

<b>AT3</b> BFI Upper Austria	Improving the chances of a successful entry into a profession for youths and young adults with a migration background	Youths with migration background and disadvantaged youths in compulsory or secondary school.  During the project 187 youths in compulsory school were reached, 76 % of the participants had a migration background, 104 have been younger than 15 years , no participant received financial support from social assistance systems.	24	The project partners offered activities in various fields:  – Activities in schools (BFI OÖ and VHS-public library Linz) – Activities for companies (WK OÖ and ÖGB OÖ) – Extracurricular youth work (ÖGB OÖ and VHS-public library Linz) – Work with parents (ÖGB OÖ) – Teacher seminars (BFI OÖ, ÖGB OÖ, WK OÖ)
<b>FR1</b> Des Passerelles pour l'Insertion	Support for professional and social inclusion of refugees	Refugees. The association works with all refugees and no other additional criteria were used.  Mainly they work with an adult population between 18 to 30 years, both males and females.  People can benefit of the service if they have the right to international protection and they are resident in the Vendée department (where the les Passerelles is placed).	60	Since the aim of the project was to offer a comprehensive support to refugees, the offers varied.  The main goal of the project has been to grant an access to vocational education and training.  Services included:  – elaborating a personal and professional project – techniques for researching a job – interviews preparation – visits of enterprises and meeting employers – building a training project and guidance towards appropriate structures – support during the training and at the moment of the signature of a contract.
<b>FR2</b> CAAPMIE Institut Protes-tant Centre d'Accueil et d'Accompagnement pour Mineurs Isolés Etrangers	Training action for Kitchen Porters	Unaccompanied minors.  The target group has been quite diverse. Where the project offered housing to unaccompanied minors, there has been a target age from 10 to 21 years.  For vocational, education and training the target audience have been people between 16-21 years.	24	Key actions have been welcoming, guiding, educating and integrating.  The welcoming stage is related to housing and the guiding one to the understanding of the background of the unaccompanied minors.  During the educating stage, unaccompanied minors are offered French language

				<p>classes, apprenticeships, courses in the hotel sector and schooling support.</p> <p>Unaccompanied minors who Did not wish to have access to the internal training course for becoming kitchen porters, could look for other trainings courses on the territory and the association guided them on this matter.</p>			
<p><b>FR3</b></p> <p>RAIH Réseau d'Accueil et d'Insertion de l'Hérault</p>	VET related activities	<p>Unaccompanied minors aged between 13 and 21 years.</p> <p>Since the association is placed in Montpellier, they are geographically closer to the North of Africa. For this reason, in 2003, they welcomed migrants from that region. As of now, they welcome migrants from Angola, China, and Mali but mostly from Guinea and Congo.</p>	12	<p>Main activity has been a morning front-office service.</p> <p>The objectives of the front office were to inform and to make a link between public structures (e.g. Centre of Information and Orientation, CIO or schools).</p> <p>Furthermore, this service allowed young migrants to meet the educators of RAIH and to receive professional guidance; these educators assisted them by accom-panying them to public structures, by informing them on the type of jobs they could do, by informing them of which type of qualifications are necessary to attain a certain professional goal.</p> <p>Furthermore, young migrants were put in contact with Almanova, which is an education centre where there are trainers of the construction industry and gardening sectors and which made the link between unaccompanied minors and enterprises for internships and apprenticeships.</p>		<p>Most of the partici-pants had an African or Arabic origin (including Turkish and Kurdish origin).</p> <p>Due to the funding programme (ESF XENOS Diversity and Integration) the target groups has been young migrants that should be sup-ported in the transition from school to work.</p> <p>There has been no ethnic specification embedded to the project.</p> <p>The project management organisation in its daily operation offered the services to people from currently 120 different national and ethnic origins.</p>	<p>hours) that offered VET related content</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Training period (work-placement) in outpatient and inpatient organisations</li> <li>- Advisory services from social workers</li> <li>- Advisory services on the vocational fields</li> <li>- Vocational counselling courses</li> <li>- Qualification courses that lead to allowance to work in this field and that were leaded from experts in medical and care education</li> <li>- Job application training and coaching</li> </ul>
<p><b>DE2</b></p> <p>Netzwerk Lippe</p>	Horizon. Improving employability and vocational perspectives for refugees in the district of Lippe		24	<p>Refugees, persons admitted for asylum, recognised refugees and other refugees with formal access to labour market but with only limited support to VET and at the age between 18 and 54 years.</p> <p>Beyond these legal and formal definitions the target group has been very diverse in terms of country of origin, mother tongue, language capabilities, cultural origin, educational level, duration of stay and other items.</p>		<p>The target groups received tailored language training courses in terms of labour market/vocational sector before they received centrally organized job placement support.</p> <p>The project coordinator was responsible for building up sustainable network nods among the enterprises.</p> <p>As a means of marketing and future accession of additional enterprises there were established models of „Best practice-solutions“ and educational strategies on how to support language capabilities for the labour market among immigrants.</p> <p>The project has been divided into 4 parts:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Intake, consultancy Services and support</li> <li>- vocational practice together with language training</li> </ul>	
<p><b>DE1</b></p> <p>ZFM Zentrum für Flüchtlingshilfe und Migrationsdienste</p>	Young migrants	The target group of the project has not been dedicated to specific national or ethnic origin or residence status.	36	<p>The most important services of the project have been</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Operation of basic health- and care-courses (care assistance course; 700</li> </ul>			

				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- language training relevant to job market opportunities</li> <li>- Job placements</li> </ul>
<p><b>DE3</b></p> <p>BQN Berlin. Vocational Qualification Network for Migrants in Berlin</p>	<p>BQN. Berlin needs you</p>	<p>The target group consisted of young people at school that have an immigration background and as such faced substantial obstacles or misjudgements and did not perceive public companies as potential employers for themselves.</p>	<p>48</p>	<p>The areas of work have been:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- building a consortium and network to steer the process</li> <li>- modelling the project activities according to the general system</li> <li>- supporting schools and companies</li> <li>- conceptualize the activities and framework conditions</li> <li>- evaluate the placements and the process of matching</li> <li>- Public relations</li> </ul> <p>32 schools in Berlin were cooperating with 56 companies from the public service sector, public liaised companies and companies from the metal- and electronic industries.</p> <p>These companies agreed on a common standard for the work-placements.</p> <p>The companies received diversity-training-courses from the project so that they are equipped with suitable capacities to incorporate the young immigrants.</p>
<p><b>IT1</b></p> <p>Centro Astalli Palermo</p>	<p>Health Care Training Course</p>	<p>Migrants, very often sub-Saharan women like Ghanaian and Ivorian</p>	<p>3</p>	<p>Added value was given by professionals working in the sector. Volunteers already working as professional health care assistants gave classes to immigrant students.</p> <p>Both theory and practice on how to take care of elderly people.</p> <p>The training courses lasted 3 months, 100 hours of intense training on specific matters related to health care.</p>

<p><b>IT2</b></p> <p>Associazione Santa Chiara</p>	<p>Life at the top. Tailoring workshop</p>	<p>The most important target group was composed by young women coming from Africa, in particular Ghana, Ivory Coast, Morocco and Niger, aged 20 to 30 years old, with a low level of education but in particular with good knowledge of cooking, hairdressing and tailoring.</p>	<p>4</p>	<p>The activities of the project have concerned three important steps:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Italian course to improve the language skills</li> <li>- Learning how to tailor</li> <li>- ability to reproduce what has been learned and to mix new skills with own tailoring culture.</li> </ul>
<p><b>IT3</b></p> <p>Sicilian Region, Department for Employment</p>	<p>Alkantara. Safe integration</p>	<p>Migrants, mainly people aged 20-45 coming from North Africa (Marocco, Tunisia, Algeria), Bangladesh, Ghana and Nigeria).</p>	<p>18</p>	<p>In particular, the project involved</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- research on the provinces of Palermo and Trapani</li> <li>- training aimed at public and private actors</li> <li>- a training course and counselling targeting new entrepreneurs or aspiring immigrant entrepreneurs</li> <li>- specific measures to provide information and guidance facilitating the integration of the immigrants in the labor market and promoting the protection of their rights.</li> </ul>
<p><b>NL1</b></p> <p>SWV Bouwopleidingen</p>	<p>Building in Limburg with more employees with a migration background</p>	<p>Young people with a migration background and low vocational education background in South-Limburg area.</p>	<p>84</p>	<p>The main project activities included</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Recruitment of young people with a migration background for a basic vocational training course on carpentry, mason or tiler.</li> <li>- The basic vocational training course lasted two years whereby students worked four days a week and attended class one day a week. The participant is offered a contract with salary during the basic vocational training course.</li> <li>- Those who have not yet reached the level of the basic vocational training course are offered a so-called pre-track of between 3 to 6 months.</li> </ul>

				<p>– The pre-track consists of 3 days per week practical training and two days per week attending classes.</p>
<p><b>NL2</b></p> <p>FORUM Institute for Multi-cultural Affairs</p>	K!X	<p>Young migrants</p> <p>Students with a migration background in vocational education and training and generally between the age of 14 to and 18 years.</p>	48	<p>The K!X project was based around the so-called „K!X teams“. Schools could voluntary opt to implement the K!X project whereby one or more K!X teams at their school are formed.</p> <p>The teams consisted of students and a coordinator (generally a member of teaching staff). The teams set their own objectives and activities with a view to promote labour market orientation (in line with the K!X methodology) whereby they could make use of the free (online available) toolkits.</p>
<p><b>NL3</b></p> <p>SIPI Amsterdam</p>	Diamond	<p>Target group has been young people between the age range of 12 to 27 years who faced identity conflicts.</p> <p>The training especially targeted young people with a non-Western migration background that struggle with dual identity.</p> <p>This group of young people wanted to study, work and work towards a stable future in the Netherlands but due to dual identity challenges this leads to truancy, delinquency, early leaving from education or training or possible radicalisation.</p>	84	<p>Main intervention was a training programme that could be delivered individually or in groups.</p> <p>The training programme was divided into three modules where the young people gain better understanding into their own identity, develop social, soft and other key skills, learn to make decisions and manage conflicts.</p> <p>The participants gained confidence in themselves and society by means of group assignments, individual exercises, role plays, presentation and the development of their personal portfolio.</p> <p>At the end of the training programme young people completed a group assignment.</p>

<p><b>UK1</b></p> <p>Sola Arts</p>	Sola Arts	<p>The predominant target group were Black Ethnic minority refugees, asylum seekers and migrants.</p>	6	<p>Key focus of the organisation is Art Psychotherapy, supporting migrant with acute enduring mental health issues, building confidence and raising self-esteem and social well being.</p> <p>Language development was key to Solar Arts and exploring cultural differences.</p> <p>The project took steps to empower individuals in an appropriate way. Exploring the culture of the work place, having a practical knowledge of how things work and having choice within the workplace.</p>
<p><b>UK2</b></p> <p>Refugee Action Liverpool</p>	Refugee Action Liverpool	<p>Refugees and asylum seekers.</p> <p>The vast majority of Refugee Action works with women, as there is a higher number of women refugees. Refugee Action work with Children and families, covering a broad age range.</p>	12	<p>Refugee Action Liverpool</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Refugee Youth Wellbeing Project. This project provided specialist asylum support and provided informal activities to increase in confidence and remain active</li> <li>– Liverpool Asylum Outreach and Support Project. This project supported those migrants who have become isolated and even living on the streets as a result of the asylum process. In collaboration with the British Red Cross and Asylum Link Merseyside Refugee Action have developed a project to fight destitution</li> <li>– Shared Awareness - myth busting project, raising awareness within schools, local business, public sector etc and providing a myth busting toolkit.</li> </ul>

<p><b>UK3</b> Merseyside Refugee Support Network</p>	<p>Merseyside Network for Change</p>	<p>Refugees, asylum seekers, Individuals with migrant background, black ethnic minority communities</p>	<p>12</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- English Language Training</li> <li>- Support for Employability based issues</li> <li>- Validating skills and qualifications</li> <li>- Benefits and housing issues</li> <li>- Advocacy and signposting</li> <li>- Employment skills development and Job Search</li> <li>- Awareness raising and networking across public, private and charities</li> <li>- Strengthening refugee communities through provision of support.</li> </ul>
<p><b>FIBA</b> ESTA-Bildungswerk</p>	<p>FIBA</p>	<p>The direct target groups has been young migrants of Turkish family origin, that are ready to enter IVET after school.</p> <p>As indirect target groups there were the parents of these youngsters, employers and recruiters, people from community organisations and stakeholders working in the area of integration.</p>	<p>24 (per city)</p>	<p>The project has not been about education and training in a narrow sense; there were no school subjects taught to the audience (the only subject which can be called a subject of training is job application training).</p> <p>Important activity as such has been the intensive and personal approach of companies, recruiters and entrepreneurs to find an apprenticeship or a preparatory practice for the audience.</p> <p>Young people are supported when searching for jobs. They are supported to scan the available job markets, to write application letters, to communicate with employers and to establish confidence.</p> <p>Parents are informed about the needs, requirements and structures of vocational training in Germany.</p> <p>Although there is no education in a narrow sense linked, the project sought to strengthen the competences and capacities in a perspective of lifelong learning.</p>

# Approach of the Analysis and Overview on Data

This gap analysis compares national projects from Austria, France, Germany, Italy, the Netherlands and the United Kingdom that deal with the integration of immigrants into the labour market and the system of VET (vocational education and training). With this study we do not follow a statistical approach but a qualitative approach and, as such, we have operated a selection to conduct a meaningful comparison. We see this comparison as a creative strategy of analytical elaboration through research.

As the chosen cases vary in terms of target groups, their national origins, political frameworks and the like, but produce a similar outcome (integration into VET and labour market), our aim is to explain this outcome by identifying the key factors shared by the different cases. Our interest lies in identifying the characteristics of projects that are relevant for their success. The comparative logic that drives this analysis aims at identifying generic items of empiric cases from six European countries.

This analysis will finally come up with a conclusive chapter on recommendations. This chapter is relevant for future implementations of projects. In this conclusion we establish a list of characteristic factors needed to achieve future objectives of integration of migrants. As such, the analysis may support training providers and policy makers in the establishment of projects and programmes. Our analysis does not establish a final state of the art, but it may be considered as a starting point for future strategic project planning in the selected countries.

While the chapters 4 -11 comprise the information given in the single interviews with the organisations, chapter 12 (recommendations) does not just reflect the questionnaires, but, additionally, contains the results of the referencing project FIBA and a comparison of the findings of the referencing project with the other 18 project findings and additional evidences.

**A set of challenges has to be faced in connection with such an analysis and some of the features need clarification:**

**National projects:**

We are interested in comparing projects from the EU member states which are part of this project (AT, DE, FR, IT, NL, UK). This means that we do not take projects into account that have an international scope. The reason for this concentration is that we are more interested in the national approaches to support migrants with clear and sharp operations on local and regional levels than in international approaches with their transnational nature and less impact on solving local and regional needs. Additionally we focus on projects and not on systems. A project can be defined as a temporary rather than a permanent approach and is constituted by a team within or across organizations to accomplish particular tasks under time constraints. Of course systems usually influence projects, but, nevertheless, in our study we only selected projects, because otherwise the comparison would have been much more challenging. Only if a system is influencing the chosen project in its operational success we embedded these systems' information.

**Integration of migrants:**

The terms "migrant", "immigrant", "immigrant background" or "migrant background" are at least in Germany frequently used today in discussions and publications regarding immigration. The fact that this term is used as a matter of course creates the impression that it is clearly and precisely defined. This is neither the case on national levels nor on international levels. This leads to consequences in quantitative and qualitative terms. For example, different definitions can lead to different statements regarding, for instance, educational achievements.

So the definition of "immigration background" or "migrant" has an important effect on migration data and an analysis based on such data. This in turn has an impact on public understanding and on policy debates.

To serve the feasibility and practicability of this comparison we agreed upon referring to the definition that came into practice in Germany in 2005 within the micro-census statistical researches. Those statistics distinguished

between people with migration background and people without migration background. These categories replaced the former categories of “Germans” and “Foreigners”.

These new categories broadened the concept, as since then the status of “migrant background” has not only derived from personal characteristics (migration, naturalization, nationality) but from parental characteristics, too.

In this research people with an “(im)migration background” are defined as foreigners, migrants (independent from their nationality), naturalized foreigners, people born in Germany, France, Italy, Austria, the UK or the Netherlands, having this nationality, but having at least one parent, that migrated to Germany, France, Italy, Austria, the UK or the Netherlands or having at least one parent, that is born in Germany, France, Italy, Austria, the UK or the Netherlands as a foreigner.

The authors of this study are aware of the fact that this definition is based on the concept of national origin although in the humanities it is widely accepted that this category can be a proxy or can be strictly influenced by other factors (social class, gender, generation, legal status, or other socially relevant categories). As projects usually follow the logics of programmes and grant schemes, this study has to follow these logics as well. Nevertheless, the project partners have paid attention to the avoidance of any misinterpretation with this group approach that tends to highlight the importance of specific immigrant attributes (immigrants’ culture, religious affiliation and so on), while these characteristics may be “... secondary to the constraints exerted by macro-level forces, from a receiving country’s citizenship laws to the prevailing institutions and norms on state/church relations.”<sup>5</sup>

**Labour market and the system of VET:**

Although the economy is getting global there remain very different approaches in Europe to reach the goal of closing the gap between the demands of the economies and the structures of existing vocational education and training. Member states of the EU rely on specific institutional mechanisms bridging the worlds of education and employment; European countries are in the process of establishing qualification frameworks that provide additional mechanisms to link education and training provision with labour market requirements.

VET in Europe covers diverse national systems, rooted in their specific economic and social environments. Initial vocational education and training (IVET) is normally part of upper secondary education but also includes a tertiary level (called ‘universities of applied sciences’ or ‘vocational colleges’ in many countries). Continuing vocational education and training (CVET) includes a range of vocationally-oriented training provided by a variety of training providers.

Despite all differences and variations, VET is seen as a driver to contribute to the labour market needs and as such to the objectives of the Europe 2020 strategy.

**Data collection**

The data collection comprises information from 18 projects (3 from each partnering country). The survey was done in March and April 2014. Each partner used the questionnaire which had been developed in February 2014. The binding selection criteria for each project were the following:

**Scope:** The project was part of the educational sector and aimed at integrating people with a migration background into the labour market.

**Target group:** The project specifically targeted (young) people with an immigration background.

**Success:** The project received a (formal or informal) success status.

**Time of existence:** The project took place between 2003 and 2013. ■

# Target Groups of the Projects

The 25 years old daughter of an Austrian dentist who came from Salzburg to Munich 50 years ago and who now is studying international affairs at a private university in a Bavarian city is a migrant as well as the 60 years old refugee from Syria who left their home due to massacres and are now living in a refugee hostel in the same city.

A particular distinction has to be made between intra-EU migration and migration from outside the EU. Subject to some transitory restrictions on citizens of new Member States, EU citizens have the right to live and work in other EU Member States. EU citizens are not subject to limits on the numbers that may be admitted, and are exempt from restrictions as to duration of residence and access to the labour market that may be applied to third-country nationals (persons who are not citizens of an EU Member State).<sup>6</sup>

As programmes or funds are regularly using the term migrant to describe the target audience, and as projects often have to meet the requirements of programmes or funds, this term is widely used in describing the targeted audience of a project, although the term migrant is very weak in a descriptive meaning.<sup>7</sup>

The 18 projects under consideration answer to this precondition and cover people from all over the world, who left their homes for different reasons. Only a few projects specified the target group as refugees and unaccompanied minors. All other projects targeted diverse people in terms of country of origin, legal status, mother tongue, language capabilities, cultural origin, educational level, duration of stay and other items.

Regarding entering the labour market, specific barriers exist for refugees in addition to challenges other migrants face. Challenges may include loss of identity documentation and qualification certificates, non-acceptance of qualifications or educational attainment, trauma and uncertainty, anxiety over family separation, the long period of inactivity in the asylum system, and limited social networks.

Downward professional mobility and de-skilling is particularly hard to cope with for those refugees with qualifications who may suffer downward social, as well as professional mobility.

**Obstacles to get access to VET and jobs**

The success of immigrants in EU VET systems is crucial to the future European labour markets as it is also paramount for maintaining social equality and cohesion in societies.<sup>8</sup> However, there are various obstacles and/or discriminating processes existing on the labour markets which are an obstacle for the different target groups to enter the labour market and find a suitable job. “Immigrants are disadvantaged in most education systems across the EU. Poor education results often lead to fewer, less quality jobs.”<sup>9</sup> Immigrants often face obstacles like low level of knowledge of the language of the host country at arrival, parental human capital not exploitable in terms of suitable jobs, educational attainment in the country of origin, which may not match the requirements in the host country and discrimination by school peers, teachers and recruiters.

Discrimination and lack of intercultural knowledge and awareness among employers lead to a relative disadvantage for migrants compared with their native counterparts in the recruitment process. Even when explicit discrimination against migrants is not an issue, implicit stereotypes and intercultural barriers may bias the recruitment process and contribute to less positive hiring outcomes for migrants as compared to natives with the same levels of qualifications and competences and, thus, to underutilization of migrants’ skills. This risk seems to be higher when the employer is a small or medium-sized enterprise. Due to their resource restrictions and limited experience, SMEs in particular seem to lack the capacity – both in terms of dedicated counselling and training – to deal with cultural diversity issues in the recruitment process.

<sup>5</sup> Irene Bloemraad, *The promise and pitfalls of comparative research design in the study of migration*. Migration Studies Volume 1, 2013, p. 33.

<sup>6</sup> Eurostat statistical books. *Migrants in Europe. A statistical portrait of the first and second generation*, Luxembourg 2011, p. 15.

<sup>7</sup> See chapter 3: approach of the analysis.

<sup>8</sup> See for instance: *Migrants, minorities, mismatch? Skill mismatch among migrants and ethnic minorities in Europe*, Research Paper No 16, CEDEFOP, Luxembourg 2011.

<sup>9</sup> Jasper Dag Tjaden, *What can international comparisons of outcomes and policies tell us about goof practices of migrant education*, Itinera Institut Discussion Paper 2012, p. 2.

While in all countries the school system produces winners and losers, this selection is ubiquitous in Germany; it does not only relate exclusively to migrants, but among migrants the selection has stronger effects than among non-migrants, it sustains over time and hardly can be compensated:<sup>10</sup>

- There exists a high number of migrants in secondary modern schools and special schools (which are located at the very bottom in terms of quality of school exam).
- Migrants statistically have worse school leave exams than non-migrants.
- There are high numbers of migrant parents with low or no educational status.
- There is a high number of migrants with low or no IVET-exam.
- A high number of migrants face huge problems in the transition into IVET and job-market.
- These problems remain persistent, even when school exams are equivalent to non-migrants.
- Disadvantages are particularly validated for people with Turkish and Arabic origins.
- Better school leave exams do not automatically improve access to IVET (as it usually is the case).
- Many of the young migrants lack a specific support from their parents regarding the transition from school to work and training. Reason for this is not missing willingness, but missing information among parents.

The gap in education outcomes between natives and immigrants is substantial. However, natives face similar difficulties and show similar education outcomes as immigrant children. This finding points at more general inequalities in the education system rather than at an immigrant-specific problem. Nevertheless, the (on average) more disadvantaged family education background of immigrant children results in typically lower education outcomes.<sup>11</sup>

These obstacles and elements of discrimination are valid in the partnering countries, although the picture in the specific countries represented in this project may be different due to national immigration policies, immigration flows, labour market systems and economic prosperity. Nevertheless, in the eighteen projects from Austria, France, Germany, Italy, the Netherlands and the UK a similar picture is presented regarding the labour market hurdles for immigrants:

- Low level of migrants' knowledge of the language
- Qualifications may be missing or not transferrable.
- Non transferrable professional experiences.
- Continuous vocational training may be insufficient or not validated.
- Understanding of the job market procedures and insight into labour market conditions may be limited.
- People might have difficulties to adjust to the host country's working culture.
- Prevailing traditional recruiting processes (in the health-care sector in Germany) that are not adequate to immigrants and refugees<sup>12</sup>, as they stick to checking knowledge items from school exams, but not the suitability and fitness of the people to meet the requirements of the work placement.
- Undervaluing the skills of individuals (for example a qualified doctor being encouraged to accept a job as a cleaner at the hospital).
- Downward professional mobility (de-qualification) of asylum seekers or asylum beneficiaries and thus down-sizing the formerly acquired qualifications in the home countries, which often has not been officially recognized.
- Structural and institutional discrimination<sup>13</sup> due to status as immigrant, refugee or unaccompanied minor or due to religious beliefs of people.
- Predominating hierarchies.
- Stereotypes in society (a project from England mentions the applicant's name leading to declining opportunities to get jobs).

These results fit to statistical findings<sup>14</sup> from researches in Europe or in single European countries like

- Misuse of skills and qualifications of highly qualified migrants not finding adequate jobs is amplified by the large number of highly qualified migrants working in jobs well below their educational qualification.<sup>15</sup>
- The situation of second-generation migrants while being more positive than that of first-generation migrants, still shows disadvantages compared to the situation of persons with a native background.
- Young migrants are generally at greater risk of leaving the education and training system without having obtained an upper secondary qualification.
- Even if access to the labour market is granted, difficulties arising from lacking or insufficient formal qualifications often result in poor labour force participation rate. This is also the reason why migrants are accounted for working more frequently in job positions below their qualification level than non-migrant counterparts.<sup>16</sup> ■

<sup>10</sup> Jürgen van Capelle (ed.), *Zukunftschancen. Ausbildungsbeteiligung und -förderung von Jugendlichen mit Migrationshintergrund*, Wiesbaden 2014.

<sup>11</sup> Maria Vincenza Desiderio and Anke Schuster (eds.), *Improving Access to Labour Market Information for Migrants and Employers*, International Organisation for Migration 2013, p. 82.

<sup>12</sup> At least in the health-care sector in Germany there currently seems to evolve an understanding that traditional recruiting processes are not only inadequate to future employees like immigrants, but are inadequate to the requirements of the jobs as well.

<sup>13</sup> 'Institutional discrimination' in schools is often mentioned as a considerable disadvantage to the education of immigrants and occurs in terms of grade repetition rates, tracking decisions, and referral to special education programmes. In addition, textbooks and teaching materials may not reflect the diversity of students' cultural and language backgrounds. 'Institutional discrimination' in general arise from institutional structures that „favour the population without a migrant background when it comes to access to certain services and goods“. (OECD 2012. *Settling in. OECD Indicators of migrant Integration*, p.144)

<sup>14</sup> See for instance Eurostat statistical books. *Migrants in Europe. A statistical portrait of the first and second generation*, Luxembourg 2011.

<sup>15</sup> *Ibid*, p. 21.

<sup>16</sup> *Study of the German National Contact Point for the European Migration Network (EMN). The Organisation of Asylum and Migration Policies in Germany*, Federal Office for Migration and Refugees 2012, p. 61.

# Objectives

The primary objective depends on the target group and their existing situation. Most of the projects offered step sequences to VET and labour market, like for instance:

- Primary information about VET and labour market in the hosting country.
- Raising awareness and interest towards the existing occupations and education and training needs.
- Preparation, prequalification and experimentation for further measures.
- Offering individual support mechanisms and job placements.
- Practically oriented knowledge, which is usually gained through internships in companies.
- Preparation for follow up activities.
- Stimulating an interest for specific sectors of economy (like health and care economy, construction business or creative industries), among young immigrants, which they might not be aware of.
- Strengthening language capabilities in general and specifically targeting specific sectors.
- Reducing the labour market discrimination of the target group.
- Matching the labour market needs with available competences.

A lot of projects were delivering specific activities and supportive components of the education and training business, like for instance

- Empowering people through strengthening their own competences.
- Strengthening the motivation of the participants.
- Providing administrative, legal and social assistance.
- Sensitization of the family environment (if the project is dedicated to young people).
- Networking with employers.
- Building networks with others to exchange.
- Fighting deskilling<sup>17</sup>.
- Supporting psychological welfare.
- Development of identity, self-esteem and confidence.
- Coping with multiple identities (being an immigrant and being Dutch, German and so on at the same time).
- Enabling community cohesion.

Some projects followed specific methodological background approaches that sometimes went beyond individual coaching like for instance

- Sensitising the organisations, companies and enterprises that (mainly young) migrants are a valuable group of employees and may reduce the labour force shortages.
- Raising awareness for the capabilities of migrants through specific public campaigns.
- Inducing the recruiters in companies to modify the processes of recruitment.

As far as projects dealt with specific groups of migrants there were slightly different objectives and aims connected to the projects such as:

- Supporting the general integration into the hosting society (refugees).
- Guiding persons in the new society (unaccompanied minors).
- Supporting the people in their primary education (unaccompanied minors).
- Compiling documents and evaluating existing qualifications (migrants with formal permission to access the labour market).

Some of the projects were dedicated to specific sectors; the health care sector being the most prominent one, but also the construction economy, the creative arts sector and tailoring are mentioned. All projects connected theoretical education (courses) with practical training (practices, traineeships); the courses were developed and delivered by practitioners from the thematical and vocational areas.

Although the nature of these projects was to improve access to VET and jobs, some projects specifically addressed additional aims that went beyond VET and integration of the labour market. For instance, one project from Italy (IT1) had as an additional objective the establishment of intercultural contacts among different ethnic groups, another Italian project (IT2) saw vocational empowerment as a means to interact in the social context

# Actors involved

As all selected projects were focused on integration of immigrants into VET and labour market, these links to the labour market were vital and could be identified throughout the whole project lifetime. Involving additional actors boosted the links to the world of work. To establish and to maintain links with the labour market a wide range of actors can suit the need of projects. The involvement in itself varied from loose and random meetings to regular and contract-based collaborations. Which actors the projects dealt with depended on the target group and the intended job placement, but some actors seem to be generic to successful projects:

- Labour administration services, employment services, job-centres.
- Companies, enterprises and respective networks.
- Social partners (trade unions and employer associations).
- Regional public authorities, municipalities and administration bodies.
- Stakeholders from policy.
- Special enterprises of the social economy (third sector economy).
- Business development agencies.
- Training and work placement provider.
- Support centres on regional and local levels.

In a project from France that dealt with unaccompanied minors (FR1) specific types of enterprises (chantiers d'insertion) are mentioned, that support the social and solidarity economy and thus are aiming at overcoming existing barriers to support migrants in entering in the job market.

In a project from Austria (AT2) participants of previous projects who already gained employment were invited to talk to the current participants about their experiences. This approach of role modelling was a feature of other projects, too.

A German project (DE1) shows that it has been a key activity to involve the potential future employers of the target group, i.e. recruiters from the companies (in this case: hospitals, clinics and elderly care institutions). ■

<sup>17</sup> Often people take any job they get when arriving in a new country. This may lead to deskilling the existing opportunities on the labour market.

# Services and Activities of the Projects

to create social relationships. A project from France (FR1) clearly saw the integration of refugees into jobs as one aspect besides finding accommodation and providing administrative, legal and social assistance. The specific goal of another French project (FR2) dealing with unaccompanied minors was to offer a shelter to unaccompanied minors and to guide them towards schooling, which usually is a precondition for vocational education and training. The third French project (FR3) dealt with unaccompanied minors as well and stated the objectives (guidance towards schooling) as a prerequisite for further integration.

Even if the projects aimed at integrating migrants into specific sectors of business, there was only limited specification about the characteristics of the foreseen vocational integration. One project from Germany (DE3) has been an exception, as this project aimed at finding regular non-subsidized jobs and vocational training opportunities for immigrants, particular in the public service sector. This project intended to inform migrants and their parents about the opportunities in German dual VET in the public service system so that people's perception was enhanced by showing that these institutions in German society welcome people with an immigration background (strengthening this welcoming culture was embedded into the project, too). This project had a specific systems approach as it intended to establish functional cooperations between schools and companies that fit to each other. In this way, the project demonstrated that the system of transition from school to work needs to change if discriminating processes shall be altered.

A project from the Netherlands (NL2) had comparable goals and activities as one part of the project was campaigning and as its purpose in a certain meaning went beyond individual enhancement of employability. Although there existed somewhat traditional mechanisms like developing individual generic soft skills (that are insufficiently addressed in regular school curricula) and promoting company visits and excursions to enterprises (to establish insights into the job environment), there was a strategic approach followed that addressed the transition from school to labour on a systematic level, too. Project teams on regional levels were established to learn how to network with a view to labour market orientation as an indirect result to increase the chances on the labour market on a broader level.

A project from Austria (AT1) has been in a certain sense an exception as it not only and primarily aimed at finding jobs, but clearly put the employability of a person into the context of their qualifications to avoid ongoing de-skilling among migrants. ■

As the projects were designed to strengthen labour market access to jobs and vocational education and training, the activities of the projects had to reflect these aims. With regard to the services and activities of the projects a distinction has to be made between at least two kinds of target groups. The following list shows the most important activities dedicated to adults and pupils at school age:

- Intake, consultancy and supporting services.
- Basic language training courses.
- Continuing language training courses related to job market opportunities and individual framework conditions.
- Basic vocational training courses.
- Basic training courses on intercultural communication.
- Basic training on ICT.
- Job application training courses.
- Vocational preparatory courses and pre-track courses.
- Internships and work-placements in organisations and enterprises.
- Counselling concerning the recognition of existing qualifications and competences and assistance during the process of recognition.
- General improvements in labour market orientation.
- Vocational orientation courses and workshops.
- Networking (online and face-to-face).
- Company visits.
- Guest lectures from people in business.
- Psychological support to strengthen confidence and self-esteem.
- Professional guidance to public structures of school and labour (unaccompanied minors).

Mainly in the larger projects in terms of duration and funds existed a clear interdependence and connection between the different areas of intervention. A project from Austria (AT3) describes this as

- Activities/services in schools.
- Activities/services for companies.
- Work with parents.
- Teacher seminars.

In quite a lot of the examined projects there were specified activities and operations conducted that went clearly beyond training, counselling and preparation. If in a

country a strict labour market need for human resources exists (like in Germany and Austria) this situation in general terms favours the opportunities for migrants (and other persons) to find a job. At the same time the labour market need in most cases is specifically dedicated to skilled or specialised workers and it is exactly this skills-update and specialisation that the target group is missing, so the favourable position in a mere statistical view on the labour market may not lead to appropriate labour market entries for the target groups.

In a project conducted in Germany (DE1) there were regular qualification courses offered, that lead directly to job opportunities (in contrast to "measures" that are of no specific entry quality into VET). Here participants got the opportunity, that the course "care assistance" was established as an entrance opportunity to regular vocational education and training such as "professional nurse care" and "professional elderly care" with 2-3 years of duration.

It seems that a French project (FR2) followed a similar approach by offering regular vocational training schemes and diploma that could lead directly to entrance opportunities on the job market. And in a project from Austria (AT2) training courses were also highlighted as enabling the participants to enter mainstream services in VET afterwards.

Another project from Germany (DE2) established models of „best practice-solutions“ as an instrument of communication and marketing to the participants and networking events for entrepreneurs under the patronage of highly authoritative persons from the regional labour market for raising regional awareness. These ambassadors have been strategic levers for immense awareness among the other employers and thorough credibility towards the project and their target groups.

In this project the key to success was that regional stakeholder meetings were operated to steer the process of modelling project activities according to the existing framework conditions in school and at work. Thus the development, planning and evaluation of innovative formats for vocational orientation of migrants, for instance vocational encounters, belonged to the main activities.

As the projects sought to strengthen employability among the target group, this can be done best when the participants get into contact with employers and the world of labour. Despite the fact that cooperation and collaborative exchanges between the project coordinator and local/regional employers were essential to all projects, the quality and quantity of contacts with employers differed remarkably.

It seems to be a quality item if employers, stakeholders of employers (like employer’s associations, chambers of commerce and others) are closely connected to the project through events, workshops, round table meetings and similar formats. To incorporate employers and companies as project-partners to the project seems to be a most stable item to get access. Very valuable seems to be when the project incorporates a consortium of employers together with social partners, authorities, municipalities and training providers so that involvement can be ensured right from the beginning.

Approaching entrepreneurs can be done in different ways; most of the projects under consideration accessed employers both with a notion of social responsibility and with a notion of corporate interest in times of a declining population and a decreasing human workforce .

One of the projects (DE1) mentions common agreements between the project and management level in companies about the aims and targets of the project, which lead to smooth job and training entries for the target group. In a lot of cases it is described as exceptionally important that the project coordinator is an organisation with a high reputation and credibility among entrepreneurs and recruiters. Processes of bilateral collaboration seem to be a very good framework for a stable and sustainable success.

Another project (DE3) directly incorporated recruiters from companies and policy makers at different levels into the project to modify recruiting processes and to find appropriate solutions for both the immigrants and the recruiters with their need for equipped staff. It is this project that promoted sophisticated procedures to match the placement opportunities in companies with the number, dates and preferred business sectors of pupils in schools to erase randomness and to establish planned steps forwarding a suitable career development among young immigrants.

A project from England (UK1) was coordinated by a well-recognised and highly regarded organisation with a high profile among the locals including members of the community, employers and business owners in the creative industries. Thus, their clients recommended people to other organisations and individuals, who then liaise with key stakeholders within the labour market. This organisation owns linkages within creative industries and members of arts group and is fully committed to investing in sustainable relationships with employers, employment organisations, mental health support and the local community.

A project from Italy (IT1) is coordinated by a training provider that is a job-centre, too, so besides pure vocational training part of their main services is to train people on how to apply for jobs, how to write CVs and so on. These extra-curricular services to improve employability were offered by quite a lot of the examined projects. ■

## Access to Participants and Community Organisations

---

Most of the projects were managed by coordinating organisations with existing connections, links and networks to community organisations of migrants; these connections were often based on prior collaboration and were reported to be stable and reliable.

In most of the cases community organisations were used for the transmission of information to the target groups and for the acquisition of participants. The importance of migrant community organisations lay in their ability to enhance credibility to the project. This fact became evident when information services were published in such an environment or via such communication channels.

In a lot of cases the project organisations were collaborating with official authorities that were in charge of dealing with legal, administrative or educational issues of immigrants. In these cases the access to the target group was obviously channelled through these official contacts and participants were directly recruited through these contacts. In most of the projects The coordinators of most of the projects mention that word to mouth advertising among the members of the target group is an important channel to publish the project activities and possible participation opportunities. Community organisations were linked to the project to establish and demonstrate trustful settings to the people.

One project (DE1) expresses that the community organisations were not only used as mainstreaming channels of accessing people but as partners and advisers. In another German project (DE3) the strategic trap is described in which community organisations, which usually work on a voluntary basis, find themselves, because the collaboration of voluntary organisations with professional project coordinators is hard to put into practice due to their different characteristics and logics. Additionally, within projects that are not dedicated to groups with specific ethnic, national or cultural origins, there occurs the problem of selecting partners out of the variety of existing organisations. This problem of selecting single migrant community organisations conceptually cannot be solved successfully as usually there does not exist a formal legitimacy and any selection of the community organisations remains coincidental and finally may exclude others. ■

# Methodological Approach

To work within intercultural settings is a challenge for the methodological training design of any VET project.

In terms of pedagogical approaches and general training approaches, a mix of various methods was applied; formal and informal learning activities and working in groups was quite common, internships and practice sessions in companies were generic and exchange opportunities with others and experts occur regularly.

## Holistic, individual and person-centred

Even though only a few projects branded their approach like that, the holistic, individual and person-centred approach seems to be quite common. The services in these projects offer strictly individual and case-sensitive support to the participants.

One project from Austria (AT3) describes their holistic approach of individual guidance and support which covered the whole environment of the target audience (school, family, enterprises) and connected vocational education and training with these environments (for instance through modifications of regular mainstream curricula at schools and through sensitization-measures and awareness-raising campaigns at companies). A project from Germany (DE2) is very similar to this and their approach is described as delivery of support and

information about the next realistic steps to realize the framework conditions that are necessary to get access to the labour market. These framework conditions were dedicated to supporting the target group in finding child caring possibilities, getting access to available facilities of recognition of qualifications and related objectives. This German projects points out that the immanent consultancy services may include that the immigrants are accompanied in their procedures with the authorities.

A French project (FR3) describes this individual, person-centred approach as a way to validate and strengthen the educational and professional background of the person. A project from Italy (IT2) calls its approach non-formal but it seems to be very similar to the holistic and individual approach which is stated as a procedure where the individual opportunities, strengths and weaknesses define the quantity and quality of the concrete supporting activities.

A project from the Netherlands (NL3) and a project from England (UK1) describe this approach extensively as a combination of different features like:

- Demand-driven intervention regarding the existing needs of the target group throughout the lifetime of the project.
- Assessment of skills, training-needs, expectations and additional supportive necessities like travel, childcare, mental and health treatments.

- Tailored implementation of training sequences and internships in companies.
- Culture sensitive mixture of individual training, training in groups, peer-sessions and personal coaching.
- Creation of trust and confidence among the participants to foster mutual understanding and motivation.
- Involvement of available formal and informal networks on site.
- Involvement of supporting capacities of the environment (parents, school, neighbourhood).

Another Dutch project (NL1) followed a similar approach. Items like individual support, tailored offers, engagement and intercultural skills of staff constituted this approach, but with the addition that this project broadened that concept and defined the methodological approach as „mainstream if possible, tailored if needed“. This means that if it is not necessary to have a tailored approach for the target group then it is best to go for mainstream methods (e.g. basic vocational training course) and thereby not differentiating the target group from others. However, in some instances the target group has a need for an individual approach and in such instances it is an absolute necessity.

## Ownership and building capacities

Regarding the aforementioned approach, it is another Dutch project (NL2) that mentions an additional catchword: ownership is stated as critical – besides empowerment activities – to the success of strengthening migrant youth. Although being a project (and not a regular mainstream activity or structure) it is here that the necessity of fitting into structures (in this case: of schools) is clearly mentioned. The project quality that is determining this fit is analysed as well: it is the level of flexibility that makes this project an added value to the partnering schools. But flexibility is only one side of the coin. Flexibility is needed to meet the existing local needs, but this flexibility must be framed with a strict and vivid involvement and support from all existing stakeholders (school management and policy makers) to find acceptance at all levels, to sustain the results and to embed the offers into the given structures of school and transition to VET and work. Regarding the overall concept of this project (NL2) the approach is described as a merger of a top-down and bottom-up approach.

A French project (FR1) claims its approach to be a specific mix of instruments of capacity building with a certain method (la méthode du trèfle chanceux). This means to improve employability through interventions on four dimensions (socio-economics and political environment, self, place and method). This project is the only one that strictly referenced this approach to proven tracks in the

Canadian immigration policy. A second French project (FR2) calls their approach “capacity planning to support each individual in his choices”, too.

The term capacity-building is mentioned by a German project (DE3) as well and is described as an opportunity to strengthen the capabilities of organisations and people in organisations (schools, companies) for the sake of labour market integration of immigrants.

A German project (DE1) calls its approach “change from inside”, meaning that all groups involved directly or indirectly in the project have a positive attitude towards the immigrants’ opportunities. Firstly, there should exist a positive commitment of the staff on management levels that support the project aims through all activities, finally leading up to immigrant-sensitive modifications within the recruitment routines of the employers. Secondly, there should exist a positive commitment of the whole staff in the companies, which leads to welcoming immigrants as (future) colleagues. Finally this approach means that the project staff (teachers and trainers) are strongly committed to the project aims as well, which is meant as an asset that goes beyond the necessary competences in technical and pedagogical terms and beyond the necessary good command of the world of work. The project managers of this project not only prepared the target group for the available jobs not only on a theoretical level by strengthening competences and qualification, but also on a very practical level as they were incorporated into the company’s recruiting processes and thus acted as advocates of the immigrant and as decision making member of the recruiting committee.

Another German project (DE3) is similar with regard to the employers’ commitment to the aims and operations of the project. This project states a strong political willingness from the world of labour (or rather the connected companies) to integrate immigrants into the labour market and preparatory VET activities. Additionally, a three-folded methodological approach is defined as (a) building competences (through practical placements in companies), (b) strengthening cooperations between schools and companies (through tailored placement schemes) and (c) fostering diversity management in the daily life of schools and enterprises (through respective training sessions) in order to build suitable diversity capacities in schools and at the workplace.

Moreover, it is this project that clearly mentions that the target groups are not just the recipients of the offered activities, but vice versa, the migrants’ perspectives towards jobs should be embedded into the arrangements within the companies. This means that for instance their interests, their strengths and their perception of barriers should be part of the conceptual quality of the project and thus should influence the development of the activities. It

is this project that was conducted under unique framework conditions of strong commitment from both politics and economy. These conditions allowed the project to tackle not only immanent items of the project and the participants (place, duration and intensity of interventions; competences of participants) but to intervene into the transition from school to work as a system. Of course such a systems perspective is restricted to the dimensions of the project, but, nevertheless, such an understanding seems to be valuable to sustain and broaden the range of results of a (undisputed limited) project approach towards an approach that leads to an increase in participation opportunities on a higher level. This systems approach was used to generate transferable environments and equal framework conditions instead of just single individual enhancements and arrangements.

A project conducted in Italy (IT1) followed a similar sector-specific and methodological approach, which was called “exchange of experiences” among the participants. In terms of duration the German projects differ very much from the Italian project, though. While the German care-assistance courses within the project DE1 lasted about 6 months, the courses within IT1 only lasted 3 weeks. Due to these differences the projects content-wise vary enormously in terms of depth and breadth. Moreover, while the delivery of training was the key element of the Italian project it was only one out of several operations in Germany. Nonetheless, in terms of labour market integration the Italian project (IT1) announced a 100% success in getting people a job after participating in the project.

Another Italian project (IT2) stresses this methodological approach and calls it “empowerment of skills and capacities”, too. An Austrian project is similar to this and described its approach as “empowerment and strengthening of own competences”.

A British project (UK1) chose the creative industry, because it seemed to be most appropriate for immigrants and their experiences, at least in the UK: this specific business sector is easily accessible for migrants due to its habit of celebrating diversity and uniqueness. As part of this approach the project coordinator was strongly interested in encouraging entrepreneurship among the target group and to sell their products through self-employment.

Another project from the United Kingdom (UK2) supplemented their activities to raise employability with special campaigns to influence policy and public awareness.

Due to the specifics of the target group (unaccompanied minors) a French project (FR2) rejected any predetermined approach in terms of concrete measures of defining professional pathways and instead operated an individualised approach for enhancing the participants’ orientation in the French society and their planning the own capacity development. ■

# Political Frameworks

In Germany and Austria the demographic development is going to increase the need for skilled human resources. This makes such projects as the examined ones strongly necessary not only for the inclusion of migrants but also for the economy in these countries. As long as projects receive public resources, these resources are usually embedded into funding programmes and grant schemes on regional or national levels.

Some of the general national challenges, at least in **Germany**, turn into specific regional challenges; for example Berlin as a city of huge immigration from all over the world faces specific challenges as the immigrants who are already living in Berlin must be integrated into the society, and well trained people from abroad have to be addressed and invited to come and stay in Berlin as the city needs highly qualified staff.

Like in other regions and municipalities in Berlin there exists a concept on integration, which issued certain strategies, like “cultural diversity and international attraction”, “participation on labour market” and “integration through education, intercultural opening and participation in civil society”.<sup>18</sup> When these strategies turn into projects it becomes obvious that the political framework conditions strongly influence the operation of the projects in a positive way; for instance in one of the projects (DE1) the positive attitude of the management personnel of the cooperating public service agencies was due to this political environment. The fact that another German project has been operated in Berlin as well (DE3), highlights that the political framework conditions in this city not only influenced the project but was the origin of the project, as Berlin was committed via political statements to an increase in numbers of migrants in public services up to a figure that is equivalent to their statistical representation in the population.

One project from Germany (DE1) was clearly dedicated to the integration policies of Berlin as the integration office of Berlin had announced to raise the number of people with a migrant background in municipal services.

As the status as immigrant is hiding huge differences in living conditions and perspectives, some of these groups have unlimited access to labour market and political life while others are only tolerated. Some of the general national challenges turn in Berlin into specific regional challenges. Immigrants who are living in Berlin must be integrated into the society, and the well trained immigrants should be addressed to come to Berlin and stay in Berlin as the city needs highly qualified staff.

In the “Integration concept Berlin” from 2007 there were issued these strategies and actions:

- Cultural diversity and international attraction.
- Participation on labour market.
- Integration through education, intercultural opening and participation in civil society.

Along with additional federal policies and initiatives like the association “Berufliches Bildungsnetzwerk Berlin e.V.” (BQN; Network for Vocational Training) these political framework conditions strongly influenced the operation of the project in a positive way. This may have influenced the positive attitude of the management personnel of the cooperating partners from work and labour (health care organisations), too.

But not only in big cities like Berlin the political framework influences practice on a project level. Another project from Germany (DE2) was conducted in a rural area, a totally opposite environment. This project shows as well that in terms of politics the paradigm shifts in federal policies regarding refugees favoured the operation of the project.

The opposite is reported from two Italian projects (IT1/IT2), where in the opinion of the interviewees politicians “do not care” about migrant workers and migrants are of “no interest to Italian politicians”. So these small scale projects only had positive effects on the target groups but not that much on stakeholders from policy.

<sup>18</sup> Commissioner for Integration and Migration of the Senate of Berlin (Ed.): *Encouraging Diversity – Strengthening Cohesion. Integration Policy in Berlin 2007–2011.*

European countries are increasingly recognising that integration of immigrants takes place largely at the local level, and most governments are increasingly supporting the development of local integration strategies. The importance of language learning has been largely accepted by many countries, though there is no common European approach. Many countries are experimenting with civic integration courses for immigrants to allow them to become proficient in the country’s language. In addition they are delivering educational programmes on the country’s customs and values.<sup>19</sup>

Nonetheless, opposite tendencies are becoming apparent as well; for example, in recent years governments in the Netherlands and Britain have cut back the provision of language tuition for migrants.<sup>20</sup>

**Dutch** integration policy is based on the long-term objective of ensuring that the performance of all key groups in various domains (e.g. the labour market, education and housing), is proportionate to their share of the total Dutch population. Dealing with the overrepresentation of minorities in unemployment figures has been a particular focus in recent years. “However, the focus of policy changed dramatically in 2004 following the murder of Dutch film producer Theo van Gogh, an event which revealed the extent of tensions about the perceived incompatibility of Muslim migrants (particularly those of Moroccan origin) and secular Dutch culture. The rise of the anti-Islam Party for Freedom (Partij voor de Vrijheid) gave a political voice to those concerned and angry about the influence of Islam in Dutch society.”<sup>21</sup>

Today, Dutch integration policies make the right to settle in the Netherlands highly conditional on a number of tests, including language proficiency and other civic integration requirements. The country has also been redirecting efforts towards mainstreaming integration programmes.

The **United Kingdom** has implemented some of the most progressive measures for legal protection for minority communities in Europe, from the Race Relations Act of 1965, to recent legislation aimed at ensuring fair access to education, the labour market and housing for all minorities. In the late-1960s, Britain’s approach was broadly understood as a multiculturalist one, focused on the promotion of minority cultural identity. British immigration regulations have become more restrictive since the 1970s, coupled with an increasingly negative public discourse on immigration and integration. “In recent years a critique of multiculturalism has emerged, which culminated with a key Prime Ministerial speech in February 2011 declaring that state multiculturalism had failed.”<sup>22</sup>

In **France**, the State is responsible for migrants at the departmental level for minors. Competences are shared between the different levels of governance; the State is responsible for detailing policies, which will be implemented by the other levels of governance. The departmental level is then responsible for minors. To this extent, they establish how to implement national social policies and they develop their own legal instruments to accomplish to this task. Furthermore, they finance social policies for unaccompanied minors and therefore they finance the structures that offer services to unaccompanied minors.

Unaccompanied minors are defined as “separated children under 18 years of age, outside their country of origin and separated from both parents or their previous legal, or customary primary caregiver. Some children are totally alone while others may be living with extended family members who are not necessarily their customary or primary caregivers. All such children are separated children and entitled to international protection under a broad range of international and regional instruments. While some separated children are ‘accompanied’ when they arrive in Europe, the accompanying adult(s) may not necessarily be able, or suitable, to assume responsibility for their care.”<sup>23</sup>

## Recommendations

As our aim has been to identify generic items of successful projects for integrating migrants into VET and labour market we can extract the following recommendations to future planning of projects and programmes:

### Recommendations in terms of methodology and target groups:

- It is necessary to establish a holistic approach to people and their strengths and weaknesses (AT3).
- A person-centred approach is vital for the work with migrants – together with a clear elaboration of the needs of people in the local community. Establishing this needs research may be more important than meeting the expectations of funders (UK1).
- To reach labour market effects, staff should have experience in labour market issues – additional to intercultural competences (NL1).
- Delivering training to immigrants needs a clear and straightforward approach and attitude from teachers and trainers; informal training methods that are embedded into a welcoming atmosphere are more appropriate than formal procedures and curricula (IT1).

- Ownership of young people and all actors involved towards the project is critical to the success. The target group is in the driving seat of their own future and it is important that they are aware of that (NL2).
- The integration of refugees needs a clear pedagogical, human centred approach from staff in guiding and counselling people; individual perspectives must be strictly taken into account (FR1).
- Project staff must reflect the target group’s diversity and should personally be able to function as role models (NL2).
- Guiding migrants and unaccompanied minors towards VET and jobs requires clear methodological approaches. One successful approach is to assist people in developing their personal prospects and aspirations (FR2).
- The creation of a Statute on unaccompanied minors is needed to improve guidance and integration. In terms of integration in the host society unaccompanied minors should also get the opportunity to attend classes with French students along with specialised classes (FR3).
- In order to be successful training courses need to be customized for the target groups and not vice versa (adaptation of people to given education and training schemes and curricula (IT1)).

<sup>19</sup> Vidhya Ramalingam, *Integration: what works?* Institute for Strategic Dialogue 2013, foreword.  
<sup>20</sup> *ibid*, p. 2.  
<sup>21</sup> Vidhya Ramalingam, *Integration: what works?* Institute for Strategic Dialogue 2013, p. 6.  
<sup>22</sup> *Ibid*, p. 8.  
<sup>23</sup> United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees and Council of Europe. *Unaccompanied and separated asylum-seeking and refugee children turning eighteen: what to celebrate?* March 2014.

- Education and training have to concentrate on existing competences of immigrants rather than on existing deficits. It should be an aim to foster competences in a perspective towards life-long learning – and not just in a perspective towards school exams (IT1).
- Any pedagogical intervention requires attention towards different cultures (IT2).
- A project that wants to foster diversity must embed diversity into the own project (NL3).
- As it takes time to change things and to establish a trustful relationship with the target group staff must have perseverance (NL1).
- Even projects for migrants should focus on both young people with and without migration background without any differentiation except use of languages (NL2).
- Trainers should be available outside of fixed training hours and curriculum settings (NL3).
- Passion can be more important than grants. A lot can be done with small amounts of money if people are passionate and dedicated (UK1).
- Investing in positive relationships with clients, families, communities and other organisations and employers is beneficial to the project’s objectives (UK3).

**Recommendations in terms of project planning:**

- Integration into labour market is a time-consuming process; ambitious results may last longer than expected, especially when job entries are foreseen in times of economical challenges (DE2).
- It is important to include the parents of young migrants into the projects (AT3).
- Young people’s environments (e.g. parents, school, community organisations, civil society organisations) should be involved with the project, as brokering relations between target groups and civil society cannot succeed without the cooperation of civil society (NL3).
- Projects in the area of transition from school to work need a strictly coordinated approach to match existing qualifications with relevant labour market needs of companies (DE1).

- To realize an impact and quantitative effects a project must have appropriate size and duration; additionally, both a bottom-up approach and a top-down approach is necessary to run the activities successfully. Suitable and supportive framework conditions from policies and people are necessary (DE3).
- The integration of project activities into existing structures must be considered right from the start of the project to sustain the effects (NL1).
- Linkages with labour market should be operated through practical input from professionals instead from teachers to raise attention and belief (NL2).
- Project activities should be embedded into existing structures on the spot for the sake of sustainability (NL2).
- When providing support in access to the labour market the existing framework conditions of the target group should be taken into account (housing, finance, emotional well-being, family relationships, health) (UK2).

**Recommendations in terms of programmes and policies:**

- Concentration on cooperation with long term experienced organisations would be more valuable for the target group than putting projects under the constraints of annual eligibility periods of funding programmes (AT2).
- To reach appropriate effects the political framework conditions should be transparent and stable for a couple of years (IT3).
- The time constraints for refugees regarding working permission should be extended, because integration into labour market is a very time-consuming process (DE2).
- There should be a common understanding that the non-recognition of existing qualifications will lead to disproportionately high exposures to downgrading competences among migrants (AT1).
- Projects need an acceptance of migration and a general positive empathy in society to sustain positive effects. Projects should try to challenge and influence policy to create such an environment of equality and diversity (UK2).

**Recommendations of the project FIBA**

Comparing the referencing project FIBA with the examined projects led to some similar findings:

- As discriminating effects on labour markets are valid, it is mainly in this sphere where intervention through projects is needed. Projects should establish direct and personal contacts to employers and companies, as through these direct contacts and personal experiences discriminating effects and prejudices can be overcome best. It is in the economy where discrimination and cultural-diversity related issues, especially in the hiring process, can be tackled best.
- Counselling and support measures are needed to provide managers and human resources personnel with the capacity to deal appropriately with cultural diversity-related issues in the hiring process, thus avoiding biased recruitment outcomes and contributing to productivity as well as the labour market integration of immigrants.
- Culture-sensitive counsellors and coaches must be engaged, who can function as role-models for youngsters and who are able to establish an understanding of mutual trust.
- The acceptance of existing offers should be enhanced through additional guides/tutors, who are able to promote the migrants across functional borders and from a single source.
- The services should be of a holistic and flexible design in terms of time and place and should be voluntary to the target groups. The target groups need to establish ownership on the project services. Young migrants usually are keen to make a career and work hard on finding a job.
- The parents of young people should be actively and continuously included into all information services, if necessary in their mother languages. Parents of young migrants are very dedicated to their children’s career, but as they often do not have own experiences with the transition from school to work they may not have substantial competences in guidance and support. ■

# Appendices

APPRENTICESHIP SCHEMES,<sup>24</sup> MIGRATION POLICY<sup>26</sup> AND STATISTICAL DATA<sup>27</sup>

## AUSTRIA

### Apprenticeship

In Austria, it is possible to identify several VET schemes related to upper secondary level. The most important one is the “Dual VET System”, also called ‘apprenticeship training’. This dual VET constitutes a particularly practice-oriented variant of VET, where training takes place at the training company (80% of the tuition hours) as well as at a vocational school (20%). The apprenticeship diploma represents a full professional qualification. In addition to this “dual system”, it is possible to identify other mainly school-based VET schemes, such as the VET schools and

the VET colleges. In both cases, tuition hours include a 10% of working practice at an enterprise. Referring to tertiary level VET studies, it is possible to identify the so-called Fachhochschulen, intended to provide a scientifically founded vocational qualification tailored to concrete occupational fields, where periods of work placement form a mandatory part of the curriculum.

All Austrian stakeholders and decision-makers consider it imperative to maintain the high importance of VET, stressing the importance of increasingly gaining young people for the VET path by launching advertising and information campaigns, as well as safeguarding the quality of VET paths. As far as recent changes are

concerned, and in 2006, the Vocational Training Act was amended, providing a legal basis for modularising apprenticeship which aims at making VET system more flexible (better linking IVET and CVET) and responsive to sectoral needs as well as increasing the number of training enterprises (modular apprenticeship consists of a basic module as well as main and specialised modules, allowing acquisition of qualifications according to special production modes and services of particular sectors). Also, the so-called ‘Training guarantee for young people up to the age of 18’ has been introduced in June 2008, basically intended to assure that all compulsory school graduates who do not have a place at an upper secondary school or cannot find a company-based apprenticeship place are given the opportunity to learn an apprenticeship trade at a supracompany training centre.

### Migration Policy

Migrant integration became a key policy issue in Austria in the early 1990s but can be traced back to the 1980s in terms of local practices. At the turn of the 21st century, integration became a major focus of national policymaking and concerned itself primarily with non-EU immigrants, including refugees, and the first and second generation who have settled permanently in Austria.

In 2009, the Austrian government undertook a National Action Plan for Integration (NAP), which aimed to structure cooperation among different actors. The NAP moved Austria from a focus on mandatory integration courses, language skills and related language conditions in Austrian immigration law, to a broader understanding of integration which largely corresponds to the UNHCR definition. The NAP emphasizes more the dual responsibility of integration of the migrant and receiving society, recognizing the two-way process. The NAP also added attention to increasing opportunities for migrants and countering discrimination and xenophobia.

There is no single specific immigration office in Austria; a variety of institutions and organisations are involved in aspects of migration and asylum on all levels. The overall responsibility for asylum and migration issues lies with the Federal Ministry of the Interior. Access to the labour market is regulated by the Federal Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Consumer Protection. The Federal Ministry for European and International Affairs, through Austrian representation authorities, is competent regarding visa issuing procedures. The State Secretariat for Integration is responsible for the coordination of integration measures in Austria.

Austria’s federal structure is reflected in its institutional system on immigration. Within the framework of the Settlement and Residence Act, the provincial governments

are, for example, involved in setting the annual quotas for specific residence titles to be issued for each province. The governors of the provinces, typically delegate this competence to the regional administrative authorities, who are responsible in the first instance in the proceedings according to the Settlement and Residence Act. The Federal Ministry of the Interior acts as the second instance. In some procedures, e.g. for the immigration of (highly) qualified workers, the Public Employment Service Austria, which is responsible for procedures regarding the access to the Austrian labour market, is involved.

The Municipalities and District Commissions implement integration measures on local level.

There is limited possibility to identify refugees in existing statistical data and a lack of longitudinal data in relation to evaluation of integration generally. No data exists on refugees’ participation in political activities, voting patterns or participation in associations.

Monthly and annual asylum statistics are published by the Federal Ministry of Interior, but there are only estimates on the number of persons with refugee status or subsidiary protection statuses. Except for indigenous ethnic minorities, ethnicity is not disaggregated in statistics but the category of “person with a migration background” in the micro-census (since 2008) comes closest .

Austria uses three categories for migration statistics: foreign citizens, those with a foreign background, and those with a migration background. Citizenship is the main variable used for identifying migrants, although country of birth is increasingly used in some datasets including the micro-census.

The main sources for core demographic data and migration control are maintained by Statistics Austria and the Ministry of the Interior, and include data on the legal status of immigrants. Integration-related statistics relating to employment, income, housing, health, education and family characteristics are mainly collected and disseminated by Statistics Austria and/or relevant ministries. The central function of the Austrian population census as a source of information has been diminished by the micro-census and by register-based information such as the Central Register of Residence established in 2001 which is the basis for the Population Register on the size and structure of the Austrian population. The micro-census itself has limitations including low sample size and consequently low numbers of immigrants and refugees.

<sup>24</sup> If not indicated differently country data are taken from European Commission, *Apprenticeship supply in the Member States of the European Union – Final report*. Luxembourg 2012.

<sup>25</sup> The authors are aware that the institutional attributes of ‘apprenticeship’ vary considerably among countries, ranging from the transparency of the ‘coordinated’ Germanic systems to the opacity of the market-oriented English and Italian systems. In this analysis we contrast this scheme to mere „practice of workplacement“ and „internship“.

<sup>26</sup> If not indicated differently country data are taken from EMN European Migration Network, *The Organisation of Asylum and Migration Policies, Factsheets AT, FR, DE, IT, NL, UK, from the Ad-Hoc Query on access to the labour market for asylum seekers requested by European Migration Network on 9 January 2013, Compilation produced on 9 April 2013 and (in the cases of Austria and France) from A New Beginning. Refugee Integration in Europe, United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, Bureau for Europe, September 2013.*

<sup>27</sup> If not indicated differently country data are taken from A New Beginning. *Refugee Integration in Europe, United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, Bureau for Europe, September 2013.*

**FRANCE**

**Apprenticeship**

Vocational path in France offers non-academic education linked to businesses and their professions. Studies for vocational examinations can all be undertaken within the school system in vocational high schools, or through apprenticeships. As pupils in vocational high schools ('lycée professionnel'), most students study for the Vocational Baccalauréat (3 years of study) or for the Vocational Aptitude Certificate which requires 2 years of study. For these students, training takes place mainly in the teaching establishment and includes compulsory training periods in a professional environment.

Apprenticeship contracts are mainly aimed at young people between 16 and 25, and they enable to obtain diplomas or certificates listed in the national directory of vocational certificates. Finally, students can decide to embark on a 2-year study programme leading to a Higher Technician's Certificate. In this case, work experience schemes lasting from 4 to 6 weeks are part of the curricula.

Apprenticeship can be implemented in all sectors.

**Migration Policy and Asylum Policy**

The approach to integration in France has at its heart the Contrat d'Accueil et d'Intégration (CAI) (Reception and Integration Contract) and since 2007 all new migrants, including refugees, aiming to settle permanently in France and acquiring a permanent residence permit must sign the CAI. The CAI requires acceptance of the founding principles of the French Republic and its values, such as laïcité (French secularism) and gender equality.

The change of government in 2012 placed the asylum system and integration policies on the policy agenda with the aim of better protecting, and providing for, the needs of asylum-seekers, refugees and migrants. In May 2013, the Minister of the Interior announced a consultation with civil society actors on the asylum system and procedures, and reception and housing conditions. The Minister also proposed a reform of the CAI following the release of a government-commissioned report on integration that heavily criticized French integration policies and the asylum system.

French integration policies specifically aim to tackle difficulties faced by long-term migrants in France, in particular female and elderly migrants. Through co-funding with the European Integration Fund, the French state granted 38.5 million Euros in 2013, mostly to national or local NGOs to provide language courses, access to education or employment targeting this group.

Programmes at regional level are also funded through this grant.

Refugees are not directly targeted by this scheme but are supported through refugee-specific reception and integration programmes co-funded with the European Refugee Fund.

Thus refugee and migrant integration partly overlap, but also substantially diverge as the French state acknowledges refugees' different circumstances and offers a very specific set of rights and entitlements which provides beneficial conditions for refugees to re-establish themselves. The separation in 2010 of integration funding for refugees from non-refugee integration programming has contributed to differences in refugee and migrant integration.

The Inter-Ministerial Committee on Immigration Control is chaired by the Prime Minister and made up of representatives from nine other Ministries, it sets out policy guidelines in relation to migratory flows and asylum, and approves an annual report to Parliament. The Ministry of the Interior implements migration and asylum policy. A Secretary General for Immigration and Integration coordinates the departments in charge of migration, asylum and integration within the Ministry of the Interior. The French Office for Immigration and Integration is the State operator responsible for the integration of newly-arrived migrants. It also manages family and economic migration procedures, national reception of asylum seekers, as well as assisted return and reintegration. The French Office for the Protection of Refugees and Stateless Persons handles asylum cases. A number of organisations work as partners of the public authorities in handling reception and integration of legally staying foreigners.

Asylum seekers are not allowed to work during the examination of their application in France. However, they can apply for a work authorisation in some limited cases.

Foreigners who entered France with a long-stay visa issued for asylum receive a receipt for six months, which is renewable upon the application for asylum. This receipt allows them to exercise the profession of their choice as an employee.

Asylum seekers can apply for a work authorization when the French Office for the Protection of Refugees and Stateless Persons has failed to give a ruling within one year following the registration of their application, for reasons they are not responsible for. The asylum seeker who has lodged an appeal before the National Court for Right of Asylum against the OFPRA's decision rejecting his/her application, and whose receipt of application for asylum is renewed, can also apply for a work authorization.

Asylum seekers' application for work authorization is considered according to the rules of law applied to all foreign workers. According to the principle of enforceability of the employment situation, a work authorization is only issued to an asylum seeker if there is no French or European citizen or no foreign national holding already a work authorization who can be employed.

Asylum seekers cannot open their own self-employed business. Foreigners who want to open their own self-employed business must hold a temporary residence permit. To be granted this permit, they have to hold a long-stay visa and have resources at least equivalent to the guaranteed minimum wage.

In accordance with the new "Reception Conditions" Directive, the time limit for granting access to the labour market will be shortened from the currently applicable twelve months to nine months after the lodging of the application for asylum.

Until recently there was no reliable data on refugees in France. Some studies included refugee surveys (Observatoire de l'Intégration des Réfugiés Statutaires 2006) but without incorporating a representative sample. However in 2010 the French Ministry of Interior funded the ELIPA survey, a longitudinal survey on the integration of 6,000 newly arrived migrants which included 600 refugees (Régnard 2011), 58.4 per cent of whom were male. The 2006 Parcours et Profils de Migrants (PPM) survey on migrants who have recently obtained long term leave to remain can also provide some information of relevance for refugees. Overall, the ELIPA survey suggests refugees are worse off than other newly arrived migrants, less likely to be employed or speak French, more likely to face housing difficulties, and to rely on limited social support network.

**GERMANY**

**Apprenticeship**

The main German IVET path is the so-called "Dual System". Its aim is to provide broad-based basic vocational training and the qualifications and competences required to practice an occupation as a skilled worker.

The apprentice is trained in an enterprise for 3 to 4 days a week and in the vocational school for up to 2 days a week. Programmes normally last 3 years (some occupations only require 2 years). Work-based training places are usually offered in both private and public enterprises, where the suitability of training enterprises and in-company training personnel is monitored by the relevant autonomous industrial bodies (Chambers). The professional competences in occupations to be acquired in in-company training are specified in a training regulation and included by the training enterprise in an individual training plan. Concerning the tertiary VET level, Dual study programmes combine in-company vocational training with theoretical studies. By combining practical in-company training with theoretical instruction, students have the chance to acquire two qualifications at once in a large number of study programmes: a vocational training qualification and an academic degree. Dual courses of study are an especially innovative, attractive and practical way of studying that has enjoyed increasing popularity.

On the other hand, it must be stressed that Germany's labour market is closely intertwined with the apprenticeship-place market. Therefore, and as a consequence of the economic crisis, several measures have been put into practice in order to increase the number of apprenticeship places.

In Germany it is one of the policy priorities to improve the integration of migrants into the education system<sup>28</sup>.

Recent changes in the national apprenticeship type schemes were<sup>29</sup>:

- (1) Improving transition from general school education into vocational training:  
In this field, a very large number of measures have been implemented (the budget adding up to more than 700 million EUR)
- (2) Modularisation and increased flexibility of vocational training.
- (3) Increasing permeability between vocational training and higher/tertiary education.

<sup>28</sup> European Commission, *Apprenticeship supply in the Member States of the European Union – Final report. Luxembourg 2012, p. 346.*

<sup>29</sup> European Commission, *Apprenticeship supply in the Member States of the European Union – Final report. Luxembourg 2012, p. 336.*

### Migration Policy

The most important function in policy formulation lies with the Federal Ministry of the Interior. The Federal Office for Migration and Refugees and the Federal Police as subordinate authorities to the Federal Ministry of the Interior are responsible for the majority of operative tasks at the Federal level. Other essential actors within administration and management of procedures are the Foreigners Authorities of the Federal States (regarding residence), the Federal Employment Agency (regarding access to the labour market) and the Diplomatic Missions (regarding visa issuance).

The spectrum of other actors has broadened over the past few years. In addition to a growing number of NGOs, the areas of migration research and policy advice have gained increased attention.

Asylum seekers are not allowed to take up paid employment as long as they are required to stay in a reception centre. An asylum applicant who has lawfully stayed in the Federal territory for 12 months may be permitted to take up employment if the Federal Employment Agency has granted its approval. Previous periods of tolerated or lawful residence are taken into account as part of the waiting period.

The Federal Employment Agency is obliged to carry out a priority check to ensure that no other persons with priority - i.e. Germans or EU citizens - can take up this offer of employment. Priority checks are to be omitted if the asylum seeker has been residing with a residence permit in the Federal Territory for a period of four years without interruption.

Asylum seekers are not allowed to exercise self-employed activities.

Following the development of the National Integration Plan for all newcomers in 2007, the Report on Integration Indicators' (2009) (Beauftragte der Bundesregierung für Migration, Flüchtlinge und Integration) was the first move to systematically monitor integration at national level and present a set of indicators with which to measure integration. However, the report does not distinguish between different ethnic origin groups, although using some crosssurvey data, the 2009 report allows for the assessment of the degree to which divergences between groups derive from the criterion "migrant background" or from general socioeconomic factors.

Monitoring systems have however increased the data collected, albeit focusing on structural issues aimed at bringing migrant populations in line with native populations and generally improving migrant outcomes, rather than more subjective and influential factors.

Germany does not measure or evaluate specifically refugee integration and monitoring integration of refugees is absent in favour of a more general migrant picture.

Other sources of statistical data include the Integration Barometer developed by the Expert Council of German Foundations on Integration and Migration (SVR). Also the micro-census is considered one of the most important surveys for monitoring integration, but neither focuses on, nor disaggregates for, refugees. The Central Aliens Register's (Ausländerzentralregister) function is to provide data to enable policy planning, and quarterly statistics are published on Integration Courses by the Federal Office for Migration and Refugees, but both include all newcomers.

### ITALY

#### Apprenticeship

The Italian IVET system is a complex one, and it includes school-based schemes (although combined with practical training periods at enterprises) and apprenticeship schemes. In this sense, school-based schemes refer to Vocational upper secondary education in two main forms, either Technical education (provided by the technical schools or Vocational/Professional education (provided by the vocational schools. In both cases, students alternate study and work periods (known as 'Traineeships'). The balance between school-based and work-based training depends on the pathway and on the agreements signed between schools and enterprises (there is not an employer-employee job relation, and youngsters do not receive any salary). Also, post Secondary Education (Non Tertiary) is offered through two different pathways (the Higher Technical Institutes and the IFTS courses (Higher technical education and training). In both cases, 30% of the activities are dedicated to work-based training. Finally, it is possible to identify the so-called Initial Vocational Training intended to facilitate labour insertion of young people into the job market in a short time, and that includes a minimum of 30% of hours are devoted to training on the job through "traineeship" schemes similar to those offered in vocational and technical schools.

In addition to this school based scheme, in Italy it is possible to identify the so-called Apprenticeship IVET scheme. The type and duration of the training, and also the number of apprentices that can be employed, are to be established by national collective bargaining agreements covering the relevant sectors, and by intersectoral agreements. Basically, there are three different types of apprenticeships, that is to say,

- a) Training apprenticeships, aimed at young people aged between 15 and 25, where the contract can last up to a maximum of three years,
- b) Professional Apprenticeships, designed for young people aged 18 to 29 who require a form of professional training, where the contract can last no more than three years
- c) Advanced Training and Research Apprenticeships, aimed at people who require high levels of professional training in the field of research, doctorates and to enter professional associations, and designed for young people aged 18 to 29.

#### Migration Policy

The Coordination and Monitoring Committee for the regulations regarding migration, composed of the relevant Ministers, coordinates the migration policy at the

ministerial level supported by an open inter-institutional Technical Working Group consisting of legal representatives of relevant ministries and experts appointed by the Unified Conference (State-Cities and Local Authorities) that conducts analysis and evaluation of problems related to migration. At the level of the Ministry of Interior, the practical coordination of migration policies is undertaken by the Department for Civil Liberties and Immigration (which outlines and coordinates the activities of the Territorial Commissions for Refugee Status Recognition and proposes guidelines for the evaluation of asylum applications) and the Department of Public Security (which focuses on developing strategies to prevent and fight irregular migration). Other key institutions include the Ministry for International Cooperation and Integration, the Ministry of Labour and Social Policies and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

In Italy asylum seekers have access to the labour market when their application for asylum is pending for longer than six months. After six months access to the labour market is granted; the stay permit contains the wording "asylum request - allows access to labour pursuant to art. 11 of Legislative Decree n. 140/05". It allows to work until completion of the status recognition procedure and cannot be converted into a work permit after expiration. Asylum seekers have access to employment but self-employment is only envisaged for refugees and holders of subsidiary protection. In that case, the general rules on labour market access apply.

In Italy, non-EU citizens (including refugees) may exercise self-employment in the industrial, professional, craftwork and trade sector, by creating a joint-stock company, a commercial partnership or accessing to managerial position, as long as the activity itself is not reserved by law to Italian or EU citizens. In addition, the regulation establishes the same moral and professional requirements applied to self-employed Italians, including - if necessary - the prerequisites for professional bodies and associations. Furthermore, foreign citizens have to prove that their income is sufficient and coming from legitimate sources, that their accommodation is appropriate, and that the resources for their activity in Italy are adequate.

**THE NETHERLANDS**

**Apprenticeship**

The Dutch Upper Secondary Vocational Education is provided through the vocational programmes known as MBO. MBO vocational programmes are offered at 4 different levels. The Dutch VET system offers 2 different learning pathways, school-based (with practical periods in enterprises) and the dual system. The school-based programmes offer practical periods in enterprises, which makes up at least 20% of the study time and a maximum of 60%, and this route can be taken as a full-time or a part-time student. Meanwhile, the dual pathway combines learning and working, and training takes place in a company during at least 60% of the study time. Both pathways function in the market as communicating vessels; the same qualifications/diplomas can be achieved via both path-ways. Concerning Higher Education IVET, it is professionally oriented and it can be also obtained in a dual learning pathway.

**Migration Policy**

As of 5th November 2012, the Secretary of State Security and Justice has overall responsibility for aliens' policies. Immigration Policy Department and the organisations responsible for the implementation of the legislation fall within the responsibility of the Ministry of Security and Justice. The 'Aliens Chain' constitutes institutions and responsible ministries cooperating in implementation of policy. These are Immigration Policy Department (developing policy on immigration), Royal Constabulary for border control and support in the asylum procedure, Central Agency for the Reception of Asylum Seekers (for organisation and reception of asylum applicants), Immigration and Naturalisation Service responsible for implementing policies regarding foreign nationals and treatment of migration and asylum applications, Aliens Police supervises the foreign nationals residing, Repatriation and Departure Service performs services connected to return policy.

Asylum seekers have a waiting period of 6 months following the registration of their application. After that period they are allowed to work but max 24 weeks a year.

EU-citizens are given priority on the Dutch labour market. Third Country Nationals (except certain highly skilled migrants) and asylum seekers both need a work permit. However, a Third Country National is only granted a work permit if there is no Dutch or EU citizen available to complete the vacancy. This labour market-check does not apply for asylum seekers.

An asylum seeker is not allowed to open their own self-employed business

**UNITED KINGDOM**

**Apprenticeship**

Within the UK, there is no unified VET structure and provision is profuse. Historically, VET has developed in an ad hoc way, rather than through central planning. In this sense, the UK system distinguishes between a school-based approach and a work-based approach. In the first case, it is possible to identify the IVET provided by Sixth form colleges and Further Education Colleges, who offer amongst others, vocational courses. In any case, there is a wide variety of programmes, and the balance between school-based and work-based training varies on the course/college. Meanwhile, and as far as Tertiary Level IVET is concerned, it is possible to identify several possibilities, such as the so-called Higher National Certificates and Diplomas or the Foundation Degrees. There is no separate identification of 'vocational' higher education in the UK, so most institutions offer both vocational and general courses. Again, some of these programmes involve a combination of college and workplace learning, but the balance between theory and practice varies. More precisely, Foundation Degrees, which were designed in conjunction with employers, were introduced in 2001; they integrate academic and work-based learning.

In addition to these school-based schemes, the UK has got an apprenticeship scheme. Through this scheme, students formally combine employment-based training in a broad range of sectors with training provided either by a college or other training provider, where students gain recognised qualifications. There are three levels of apprenticeship available. There is no single set time to complete Apprenticeships (they normally last between 1 and 3-4 years) and they vary widely in content and size depending on the type of programme and the level attained. Apprentices receive pay and have the status of employees of the organisation where they work. They have a contract and also an individual learning plan, which employers develop with the help of local learning providers. Apprentices typically spend one day per week at college studying the technical certificate and the remainder of their time in training or work with their employer.

**Migration Policy**

The Home Office is the government department responsible for immigration and asylum policy in UK. The UK Border Agency, an executive agency of the Home Office, is responsible for the operational implementation of asylum and migration policy. Key actors in the immigration process are the Secretary of State for the Home Office (generally known as the Home Secretary) who is supported by the Minister of State for borders and immigration. Other actors include Immigration Officers,

Entry Clearance Officers and case owners (who are civil servants in the Home Office). The Migratory Advisory Committee provides independent advice to the Government on migration issues, and the Independent Family Returns Panel provides advice on family returns. The First and Upper Tribunal Immigrations and Asylum Chambers, under the Ministry of Justice, handle appeal cases.

Asylum seekers are not permitted to work while their claim is pending. Asylum seekers are only given access to the labour market if their asylum application has been outstanding for 12 months or more, and where the delay cannot be attributed to the applicant. Access to the labour market is not provided automatically after 12 months, applicants must apply for it. In addition, their access to the labour market is restricted to jobs included in the list of shortage occupations (a list formulated and recommended to the UK Government by an independent body). They are also not allowed to become self-employed or set up a business.

Interest in integration of refugees at UK government level led to the development of a longitudinal study of refugee integration in the UK undertaken by UKBA9 between 2005 and 2009. The Survey of New Refugees focused on three areas: language, employment and housing, presenting statistical analysis in Spotlight on Refugee Integration (2010). The Survey collected information on the characteristics of new refugees at the time of their asylum decision; and provided data on the integration of new refugees in the UK over time. The Survey (2010) presents evidence of integration happening over time: that refugees' English language skills improved, employment rates increased and the privacy and stability of accommodation also appeared to increase. However, since this survey, there is currently no national level monitoring of refugee integration in the UK.

The Survey on New Refugees (published in Spotlight on Refugee Integration, Home Office 2010) has provided much-needed data on refugees and their integration trajectory. The focus on housing, employment and language reflects that these are the three UK integration indicators which are most measurable. The focus from academia has been much wider, adding for example identity, legal aspects, social capital, and producing case studies on ethnic or national groups. The result is a large body of work on refugees. ■

# Questionnaire

**1. Educational Sector / VET:**

- a) What are the main aims of the project? Please also explain if these are in line with VET-objectives and the integration of people into the labour market.
- b) Does the project address additional aims that go beyond VET and integration of the labour market? If yes, please explain (e.g. integration of young people with a migration background into society, politics, culture...).

**2. Needs Assessment / Rationale:**

- a) What kind of needs analysis has been carried out to start the project? Provide both quantitative and qualitative data. If no needs analysis has been carried out, please continue with question 2.d.
- b) At what level has it been done (local/regional/national)?
- c) What other stakeholders have been involved (e.g. Local government offices, employment services)?
- d) If no formal needs assessment has been done, what has been the rationale/need for setting up the project?

**3. Target groups:**

- a) What is the most important (direct) target group? Please comment on characteristics such as background, age, education, etc.
- b) What methods have been used to reach them?

- c) What are the additional (direct or indirect) target groups? Please comment on characteristics such as background, age, education, etc.
- d) Are migrant community organisations linked to the project? Please explain the purpose and link to these organisations.
- e) How have these community organisations been identified and how have they been reached? What role did they play in the project?

**4. Activity / Operation / Service:**

- a) What are the most important services/ operations/ activities of the project to reach the goals? Please explain in-depth how these have been carried out and their added-value to other projects and services.
- b) How did the project manage to strengthen employability skills among the target group?
- c) How did the project deliver information and guidance to the target group?
- d) How did the project manage to raise competences in LLL among the target group?
- e) How did the project get into contact with employers/ companies?
- f) Where are the activities/operations/services delivered?
- g) How is the environment (i.e. the location where the services are delivered) linked to the success of the project?

**5. What are the Methodological Approaches?**

- a) What is the methodological approach of your project? Please give specific examples of how the approach has been implemented. (e.g. needs assessment, capacity planning, training plans, informal/formal/non formal learning activities)
- b) Why is this approach used?
- c) What are the success factors and weaknesses of this approach?
- d) Which elements of the approach could be transferred to other contexts?
- e) How did you ensure a culture-sensitive approach?
- f) How did you ensure a gender-sensitive approach?

**6. Staff:**

- a) How many people (staff) are implementing the project?
- b) What is their professional/personal background, which has been relevant for this project?
- c) What knowledge/competences staff need to have to run the project?
- d) How was staff prepared to work with the target group (e.g. training)?
- e) What was the role of staff vis-a-vis the success of the project?
- f) How much time did staff spend on the project (full time equivalent in month)?

**7. Labour Market / Job Market:**

- a) How was the project linked to the labour market and for which purpose?
- b) Which actors did you involve?
- c) What was the added-value of bringing in these actors?
- d) What methods were used to establish and maintain links with the labour market?
- e) What discriminating processes/structures existing on the labour market are an obstacle for the target group to enter the labour market/job market?
- f) How did the project overcome these barriers to entering the job market?

**8. Organisation:**

- a) Are there any cooperation partners connected to the project (agencies, institutions)?
- b) What was their role in the project and why has this cooperation been set up?

**9. (Political) Framework Conditions:**

- a) Are there specific political framework conditions existing, which influenced the project?
- b) Are these politics dedicated to a national or regional scale?

**10. Results:**

- a) What are the main outcomes of the project?
- b) Did the project reach its objectives? If yes, please explain and if not, what have been the reasons for this?
- c) How did the project contribute towards tackling existing societal issues (national, regional or local)?
- d) Was the project evaluated (internally/externally)? If yes, what were the findings of the evaluation?
- e) What factors underpin the success of the project? Which facts and figures are available to evidence the success?
- f) How have the results been disseminated?
- g) Are there any results published that are available for the public?
- h) What is the impact of the project to politics?

**11. Sustainability:**

- a) Based on your experience, could you please make any suggestions on how to ensure sustainability of the project?

**12. Finances:**

- a) How was the project funded?
- b) What are (roughly) the costs of the project per year (direct costs)?
- c) What has been the cost/benefit ratio of the project?

**13. Remarks and Advices to Policy and Programme Development:**

- a) What are the main lessons learned
- b) What is the most important advice you could give to policy and programme development?
- c) What would be your advice to project managers or staff working with similar target groups

# Bibliography

## A

Ad-Hoc Query on access to the labour market for asylum seekers requested by European Migration Network on 9 January 2013, Compilation produced on 9 April 2013.

Apprenticeship supply in the Member States of the European Union – Final report. European Commission, Luxembourg 2012.

## B

Beicht, Ursula: Young people from a migrant background: worse prospects of success despite extensive endeavours to search for a training place. BIBB analysis of the progression opportunities of applicants differentiated according to region of origin, BIBB Report 16, Bonn 2011.

Beicht, Ursula; Granato, Mona: Prekäre Übergänge vermeiden – Potenziale nutzen. Junge Frauen und Männer mit Migrationshintergrund an der Schwelle von der Schule zur Ausbildung. Expertise im Auftrag des Gesprächskreises Migration und Integration der Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung 2011.

Beicht, Ursula; Granato, Mona; Ulrich, Joachim Gerd: Mindert die Berufsausbildung die soziale Ungleichheit von Jugendlichen mit und ohne Migrationshintergrund? Bundesinstitut für Berufsbildung, Bonn 2011.

Bloemraad, Irene: The promise and pitfalls of comparative research design in the study of migration. Migration Studies Volume 1, 2013.

## C

Cedefop REFER NET: VET in Europe – Country Report Germany, 2011.

Cedefop Panorama Series 138: U. Hippach-Schneider, M. Krause, C. Woll, Vocational education and training in Germany, 2007.

Commissioner for Integration and Migration of the Senate of Berlin (Ed.): Encouraging Diversity – Strengthening Cohesion. Integration Policy in Berlin 2007–2011.

## D

Datenreport zum Berufsbildungsbericht 2012. Informationen und Analysen zur Entwicklung der beruflichen Bildung, Bundesinstitut für Berufsbildung, Bonn 2012.

Desiderio, Maria Vincenza; Schuster, Anke (eds.): Improving Access to Labour Market Information for Migrants and Employers, International Organisation for Migration 2013.

Dionisius, Regina; Lissek, Nicole; Schier, Friedel (Eds.): Participation in vocational education and training – a summary of indicators and rates. Federal Institute for Vocational Education and Training Publication, Discussion papers No. 143, Bonn 20113.

## E

European Commission: Qualitative Eurobarometer, Migrant Integration Aggregate Report, May 2011.

European Migration Network: The Organisation of Asylum and Migration Policies, Factsheets AT, FR, DE, IT, NL, UK. Eurostat statistical books: Migrants in Europe. A statistical portrait of the first and second generation, Luxembourg 2011.

## G

Garibay, Montserrat González; De Cuyper, Peter: The evaluation of integration policies across the OECD: a review, Antwerpen 2013.

German National Contact Point for the European Migration Network (EMN). The Organisation of Asylum and Migration Policies in Germany, Federal Office for Migration and Refugees 2012.

GIB (Hrsg.): Arbeitsmarktreport NRW 2012. Sonderbericht: Migrantinnen und Migranten auf dem Arbeitsmarkt, Bottrop 2012.

## K

Kohlrausch, Bettina: Youth Unemployment in Germany. Skill Biased Patterns of Labour Market Integration, Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung 2012.

## L

le Mouillour, Isabelle; Thomann, Birgit: From a special case to a model that is in demand – what makes dual VET attractive abroad? Retrieved on 07.02.2014 from <http://www.bibb.de/en/64861.htm>.

## M

Migrants, minorities, mismatch? Skill mismatch among migrants and ethnic minorities in Europe, Research Paper No 16, CEDEFOP, Luxembourg 2011.

## N

New Beginning. Refugee Integration in Europe, United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, Bureau for Europe, September 2013.

## R

Ryan, Paul: Apprenticeship: between theory and practice, school and workplace, in: Pilz, Matthias (Hrsg.), The future of vocational education and training in a changing world. Wiesbaden 2012.

Ramalingam, Vidhya: Integration: what works? Institute for Strategic Dialogue 2013. Heft 112.

## S

Scherr, Albert: Betriebliche Diskriminierung. Warum und wie werden migrantische Bewerberinnen und Bewerber um Ausbildungs- und Arbeitsplätze benachteiligt? Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung, Bonn 2014.

Settelmeyer, Anke; Erbe, Jessica: Migrationshintergrund. Zur Operationalisierung des Begriffs in der Berufsbildungsforschung. Schriftenreihe des Bundesinstituts für Berufsbildung, Wissenschaftliche Diskussionspapiere Heft 112, Bonn 2013.

Settling in. OECD Indicators of migrant Integration. OECD 2012.

Spöttl, Georg; Windelband, Lars: Innovations in vocational education and training – a successful paradigm shift within the dual system in Germany. Bremen 2013.

## T

Tjaden, Jasper Dag: What can international comparisons of outcomes and policies tell us about good practices of migrant education, Itinera Institut Discussion Paper 2012.

## V

van Capelle, Jürgen (ed.): Zukunftschancen. Ausbildungs-beteiligung und -förderung von Jugendlichen mit Migrationshintergrund, Wiesbaden 2014.

## W

Wang, Yafang: New Bildung Chances for the Disadvantaged through Reconstruction of Online Social Capital – An Empirical Research into Informal Learning of Migrant Youth in Online Socio-cultural Networks. Dissertation for obtaining the doctoral degree at the Faculty of Educational Science University of Bielefeld, Bielefeld 2009.

Working and ageing. Guidance and counselling for mature learners, CEDEFOP Luxembourg 2011.

# Partners

**Berufsförderungsinstitut Oberösterreich**  
Gabriele Einsiedler | Project Manager

Bulgariplatz 13  
4020 Linz  
Austria

E-mail: gabriele.einsiedler@bfi-ooe.at



**Centro per lo Sviluppo Creativo "Danilo Dolci"**  
Dario Ferrante | Project Manager

94 Via Roma  
90040 Palermo  
Italy

E-mail: dario.ferrante@danilodolci.org



**CEMEA Rhône-Alpes**  
Alessandra Santoianni | Project Officer

29, rue Smith  
69002 Lyon  
France



E-mail: a.santoanni@cemearhonealpes.org

**ESTA-Bildungswerk gGmbH**  
Kerstin Struckmeier |  
Representative for Continuous Education

Bismarckstr. 8  
32545 Bad Oeynhausen  
Germany

E-mail: info@esta-bw.de



# Partners

---

**EURICON**

Loraine Schaepkens | Director

Stampstraat 57  
6369BA Simpelveld  
The Netherlands

E-mail: [loraine.schaepkens@euricon.eu](mailto:loraine.schaepkens@euricon.eu)



**Merseyside Expanding Horizons Ltd**

Nicola Daley | Chief Executive Officer

The Old Secondary Education Centre  
Mill Lane  
Old Swan  
L13 5TF Liverpool  
United Kingdom

E-mail: [nicoladaley@expandinghorizons.co.uk](mailto:nicoladaley@expandinghorizons.co.uk)



#### SAMIN

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission.

This publication [communication] reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

Contact:



ESTA-Bildungswerk gGmbH  
Kerstin Struckmeier  
Bismarckstr. 8  
D-32545 Bad Oeynhausen

Telephone: +49 (0)5731.157-0  
E-mail: [info@esta-bw.de](mailto:info@esta-bw.de)  
[www.esta-bw.de](http://www.esta-bw.de)

